The meeting was called to order at 4:04 p.m.

There were present:

**Committee Members:**
- Hon. Wellington Z. Chen, Chair
- Hon. Rita DiMartino
- Hon. Freida Foster-Tolbert
- Hon. Charles A. Shorter
- Hon. Solomon A. Sutton
- Prof. Lenore Beaky, faculty member
- Mr. Cory Provost, student alternate
- President Russell K. Hotzler, COP liaison

**Ex-officio:**
- Hon. Philip Alfonso Berry

**Trustee Observers:**
- Hon. Simone Lamont
- Hon. Manfred Philipp

**Trustee Staff:**
- Senior Vice Chancellor and Secretary of the Board Jay Hershenson
- General Counsel and Senior Vice Chancellor Frederick P. Schaffer
- Deputy to the Secretary of the Board Hourig Messerlian
- Mr. Steven Quinn

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cal. No.</th>
<th>DISPOSITION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

The agenda items were considered in the following order:

**I. ACTION ITEMS:**

A. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 3, 2008.** The minutes were approved as submitted.

B. **POLICY CALENDAR**

1. **Borough of Manhattan Community College/John Jay College of Criminal Justice – Dual/Joint AS/BS in Science for Forensics/Forensic Science.** Interim Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost Alexandra Logue stated that this is another one of the programs arising from the successful partnership initiatives between John Jay College and the community colleges. John Jay College has a multi-year plan to stop giving associate degrees and focus on baccalaureate and graduate education. As a result, it is developing strong partnerships with a number of community colleges so that students will have a seamless path to John Jay by starting in a community college. This dual joint AS and BS in science for forensics and forensic science is an example of one of these...
partnerships. Students will be admitted to both the associate degree program at BMCC and to the baccalaureate part of the program at John Jay College simultaneously. This will enable them to transfer to the upper division part of the program seamlessly without any loss of credit. After graduating with a BS, students will be well prepared for entering the workforce as forensic scientists or continuing graduate study in the biological and physical sciences.

Prof. Lenore Beaky noted that this was an excellent program, particularly because it is a STEM discipline, and BMCC will bring a pool of more diverse students into the mix. She expressed her concern about the overcrowded classrooms at BMCC, and hoped that they would have smaller class sizes, as well as mentoring, tutoring and transfer guidance for the students in this program. President Antonio Perez stated that as the Fiterman Hall building will not be ready until 2012, BMCC was in conversations with John Jay College about the utilization of some of their space on Fridays and Saturdays, in order to facilitate transition for the students.

Prof. Lenore Beaky also expressed her concern about the paucity of liberal arts electives in programs of this kind. Senior Vice President Sadie Bragg explained that the thrust of an AS/BS in Science for Forensics/Forensics Science program was science, therefore, one would see more science here as in any of BMCC’s other AS degrees in science. Prof. Beaky noted that she was just making a general statement about curricula in general, stating that she was saddened by the enforced loss of free electives in so many community college programs some years ago.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

2. **Kingsborough Community College – AAS in Fashion Design.** Dr. Logue stated that this program would prepare students for entry level jobs in the fashion industry. Potential employers include retailers, textile and apparel manufacturers and fashion studios. It responds to student demand building on the existing fashion merchandising option within the college’s retail merchandising program. It will be the first such degree at CUNY. Kingsborough has provided extensive information about the demand for positions for students trained in this program.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

Committee Chair Chen welcomed Mr. Cory Provost, the student alternate representative to the committee.

3. **Lehman College – Health Equity Institute.** Dr. Logue stated that this institute will be housed on the Lehman College campus, and will represent collaboration among Lehman, Brooklyn, Hunter and the Graduate Center working closely with their public health programs as well as other CUNY graduate programs with relevance to urban public health. The Institute is expected to provide a home for interdisciplinary population-based research across CUNY campuses and with community partners. The primary focus will be on the analysis of the social determinants of health that influence morbidity and mortality rates. The Institute will be supported by external grants as well as by contributions to support faculty reassigned time and other moderate expenses that the Institute will have by participating campuses.
In response to a question from Professor Beaky, Prof. Marilyn Aguirre-Molina of the Department of Health Sciences explained that Lehman faculty are extensively involved in the program, and that faculty from across the University will have affiliate relationships with the Lehman faculty. Two faculty members are taking lead responsibility in the core areas of research core and capacity building, and some of the faculty will serve as advisors on an as needed basis to graduate and doctoral students who will be doing research and other projects as part of the institute.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

Trustee Sam Sutton joined the meeting.

II. INFORMATION ITEMS:

A. The Graduate School and University Center – The Luxembourg Income Study Center.  
Dr. Logue stated that centers are organized units of a single college of the University, whose mission is to sponsor, coordinate and promote research, training, instruction or service, and which should not duplicate or substantially compete with the mission of University-wide entities. After the Office of Academic Affairs has reviewed a proposed center for conformity with this policy, the college places the item under Special Actions in its Academic Matters section of the Chancellor’s University Report, and the center is presented to this committee as an information item.

The Luxembourg Income Study Center will function as the U.S. base of an international non-profit organization operating out of Luxembourg City and funded by the National Science & Social Science Research Foundations of its member countries. Its purpose is to encourage research on income, earnings and a range of labor market outcomes to support curricular development for an interdisciplinary credit bearing course and to organize symposia and other scholarly activities. The center has an initial operating budget in place for three years thanks to a combination of support committed to by the Graduate Center as well as by sizeable outside grants. It is expected that the Center will become self sustaining within three years. The director of the center is Dr. Janet Gornick, a faculty member at the Graduate Center.

B. The Graduate School and University Center – The Global Center for the Responsibility to Protect.  
Dr. Logue stated that the Global Center for the Responsibility to Protect is named after a UN commission report, The Responsibility to Protect, which forms a new international consensus on how to respond in the face of massive violations of human rights and humanitarian law. The Global Center will generate research and support the activities of NGOs around the world that are working on translating the document’s endorsement by the UN General Assembly into a set of practical guidelines. It will focus on helping create structures and processes capable of delivering effective prevention and reaction and stimulating the political will to act when the next potential mass violent situation arises. It will offer assistance to the UN’s Special Adviser on the Prevention of Genocide, Francis Deng. The center is linked to five major international NGOs and will be financially self sustaining through outside grants. The director of the center is Dr. Thomas Weiss who is a faculty member at the Graduate Center.

In response to question from Prof. Beaky about the current status of these centers, Vice President for Research and Sponsored Programs at the Graduate Center Brian Schwartz explained that the Luxembourg Income Studies Center has been operating for about two
and a half years and it is almost self-sufficient now, operating very well with grants from the National Science Foundation and the Sloan Foundation. The Global Center for the Responsibility to Protect will only exist for about five years, having been created in response to an emergency, and it is housed within the Ralph Bunche Institute for International Studies. Director Weiss works closely with the UN and has been approached by many foundations due to the center's focus. Having already received significant commitments from the McArthur Foundation, the center is expected to be self-sufficient.

C. Fall 2009 Enrollment Information. Dr. Logue stated that New York State and New York City along with the rest of the world are facing the worst financial crisis in a great many decades. This means that many people have less money to spend than they had previously due to loss of investments and/or less salary. During times of financial constraint, if people cannot get a job due to a tightening job market, or when people need further education to get a satisfactory job, they are more likely to pursue their undergraduate or graduate education. They are also more likely to start at a lower-versus a higher-priced college, or to choose to stay at a lower-priced college instead of switching to a higher-priced one after the first two years of college, and they are also more likely to switch from a higher- to a lower-priced college.

Dr. Logue noted that CUNY's reputation in recent years under the leadership of Chancellor Goldstein has been soaring and its tuition of $4,000 per year for a full time baccalaureate student is relatively low even for a public university. It is not at all surprising that CUNY is seeing a huge and unprecedented increase in applications, but we have to insure that our growth rate is commensurate with our ability to provide a high quality education.

Dr. Logue explained that the majority of new students begin in the fall, but new students can also start in the spring. For spring 2009, compared to a similar point for spring 2008, we have already accepted 13% more freshman and 4% more transfers. As a result, several colleges have already closed their spring 2009 admissions and others will probably close admissions soon. For fall 2009, we know that we are significantly ahead of last year in all types of applications, from all types of high schools and to all types of CUNY colleges, and it is very possible that we will have a 15% increase in fall 2009 applications, and go over the previous maximum total enrollment for CUNY in 1974 of approximately 253,000 students in credit bearing courses.

Dr. Logue noted that this surge in applications will impact CUNY colleges differently. Most of the senior colleges do not want to grow by much or at all, and feel that they will provide optimal student education at their current size. When they get more applications they generally respond by raising their admission standards. This has a number of good effects which include greater student retention because better students are more likely to stay at a college and also can result in higher rankings for the college. But this also means that more students do not get into the senior colleges and are more likely therefore to want to attend one of the community colleges. The community colleges are already getting more applications because of the current environment. As the only requirement for enrolling in a community college is having a high school diploma, they cannot respond to the current situation by increasing admission standards. Also, in this fiscal environment we need to be extremely vigilant to insure that we have sufficient resources for all the students whom we admit while still adhering to the access part of our mission.
Dr. Logue stated that there is one option that can assist our community colleges in this situation. Traditionally they have admitted fall students up until the very end of the summer. There is extensive research from both within and outside of CUNY that indicates that students who are admitted at the very end of the summer are the least likely to succeed—meaning to stay in college and graduate. We definitely know that last minute applications result in campuses having inadequate student support personnel and scrambling to test for appropriate placement in classes, particularly in English and math, and finding faculty to teach newly added class sections. Therefore, we are encouraging community colleges to deal with the unusual enrollment pressures for fall 2009 by closing admissions prior to the very end of the summer. Students who apply too late will just be told that they need to wait until January. Dealing with too many applicants is uncharted territory for most CUNY campuses, and the University will be following the current situation very carefully, doing whatever is possible to provide the best education for each of our students.

Trustee Charles Shorter stated that no matter what terms were applied, there was going to be a significant increase in the number of students. He then inquired whether there was a correlation, or have there been any measures or coordination with regard to the extent to which increased numbers of students will impact on the physical capacity of each of the colleges that serve those students, as well as their faculty capabilities.

Dr. Logue explained that most of the colleges would have the physical capacity to hold more students, but not during the most popular times of the week. Such colleges would make adjustments by encouraging faculty to teach, and students to attend, classes at other times of the week. She added that CUNY intends to increase the number of full time faculty again next year. CUNY can handle an increase in students, but not a huge amount.

Trustee Shorter inquired whether faculty would have more students in their classes. Dr. Logue noted that the University would be increasing the number of full time faculty again next year, so that an increase in students, but not by a huge amount, could be handled.

Chancellor Goldstein stated that this is a serious problem for the University and he has been addressing it with the presidents for the past year and a half. Higher education is a good example of an efficient market: Everybody has access to the same information and is making judgments on the basis of reputation and price. When the reputation of the University goes up and the price continues to be competitive to other institutions, it is not unreasonable to expect increasing enrollment. The financial crisis that we are in is an outlier that is forcing a lot of dislocation and movement into CUNY. We have some serious issues to confront quickly.

Chancellor Goldstein noted that CUNY is more interested in retaining and graduating students than growing the institution through a revolving door of students coming in and not doing well. But this strategy is coming right up against the needs and challenges, such as the physical capacity to house students, and the inability to keep up with hiring full time faculty. This is a problem that can only be solved by a big infusion of capital into the University to allow it to have more physical capacity and at the same time have an operating budget that allows for putting the right people in front of the classes; or, to have a totally different modality of instruction, and CUNY is going to be faced with providing much more online educating as universities all over the United States are doing faced
with similar problems. He added that there are no alternative solutions other than capping enrollment, but in a world where employers are going to be unforgiving of people who do not have skills, the University cannot take such a strategy. The path of least resistance would be to just admit as many students as possible by keeping the educational facilities open 24/7. This is not a strategy that is going to create the kind of educational experience that the University want for its students.

Trustee Shorter noted that increases in the number of students is a good problem to have, but it did have its issues. He wondered whether we could reduce some of the University’s advertising.

Trustee Sam Sutton agreed with Trustee Shorter, but suggested reviewing the kind of advertising CUNY is doing—talking about quality rather than enrollment.

Trustee Shorter stated that as somebody who rides the subways a lot, he reads the ads and he has noticed their emphasis on quality, which in and of itself adds to the attraction. He suggested adding an emphasis on retention.

Prof. Philipp noted that it is essential to continue the strategy of emphasizing CUNY’s quality. This includes offering courses at the time that students need them, and in the correct sequence. As the number of students increase it is going to be more and more of a challenge to do that.

Chancellor Goldstein noted that at the end of the day there is no better strategy than to admit students and give them a degree that is respected in the marketplace. CUNY’s communication strategy has been all about the trajectories and the values that are held dear and this will be continued. There are other ways of managing enrollment by changing the mix of the students: CUNY has extraordinary faculty, and many of its PhD programs are ranked very highly, and enrollment in graduate education can grow substantially.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:45 p.m.