The meeting was called to order at 3:30 p.m.

There were present:

**Committee Members:**
- Hon. Wellington Chen, Chair
- Hon. Hugo Morales, Vice Chair
- Hon. Rita DiMartino, member
- Hon. Charles A. Shorter, member
- Hon. Sam A. Sutton, member
- Prof. Karen Kaplowitz, faculty member
- Mr. Louis DiMeglio, student member
- President Russell K. Hotzler, COP liaison

**Ex-officio:**
- Hon. Benno Schmidt
- Hon. Philip A. Berry

**Trustee Observers:**
- Hon. Cory Provost
- Hon. Sandi E. Cooper
- Hon. Valerie Beal

**Trustee Staff:**
- Senior Vice Chancellor and Secretary of the Board Jay Hershenson
- Senior Vice Chancellor and General Counsel Frederick Schaffer
- Deputy to the Secretary Hourig Messerlian
- Mr. Steven Quinn

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cal. No.</th>
<th>DISPOSITION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

The agenda items were considered in the following order:

**I. ACTION ITEMS:**

**A. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF APRIL 4, 2011.** The minutes were approved as submitted.

**B. POLICY CALENDAR**

1. **Graduate School and University Center/School of Professional Studies – MS in Information Systems.** Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost Alexandra Logue stated that the proposed master's degree will be offered fully online making it the second fully online graduate program at CUNY--The first one being the MS in Business Management and Leadership at the School of Professional Studies. It will prepare students for addressing complex business and social problems through the theories, tools and techniques of information systems. Students will have a choice between
pursuing a general information systems program, or specializing in urban sustainability. The program aims to equip students for a variety of technical and managerial positions such as information systems analyst, software application engineer and so on.

Following discussion the item was approved for submission to the Board.

2. Hunter College – MFA in Dance; MA in Dance Education; and BA/MA in Dance/Dance Education. Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that this proposal encompasses the registration of three interconnected degree programs. An MFA in Dance focusing on performance, choreography and teaching artistry, a master's degree in Dance Education focusing on preparation for pre-K to 12 teaching which is for initial and professional certification, and a combined BA/MA building on the existing strength of an undergraduate program in dance leading to teacher certification. The programs are mutually reinforcing with eight required courses being cross listed among the programs. There are no graduate programs in dance, either MFA or MA, elsewhere at CUNY. The development of these programs has been supported by an outside donation amounting to $1 million.

Following discussion the item was approved for submission to the Board.

3. New York City College of Technology – BS in Radiological Science. Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that the proposed program builds on an existing associate's degree program in Radiologic Technology and Medical Imaging that has been offered at the New York City College of Technology for almost forty years. It is designed to provide a pathway to a baccalaureate for radiologic technologists, radiographers, nuclear medicine technologists, radiation therapists and stenographers who are already holding an associate's degree or a certificate facilitating their career advancement. This program will be unique to CUNY. All of the needed equipment for this program is already available because of the existing associate's program. This baccalaureate primarily adds liberal arts courses to the associate's degree, plus some advanced medical imaging courses. Only certified radiologic technicians will be admitted and they will be prepared for advance practice and leadership positions.

Following discussion the item was approved for submission to the Board.

4. Borough of Manhattan Community College – AS in Mathematics and Sciences for Secondary Education. Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that the proposed AS program in Mathematics and Sciences for Secondary Education provides students with a solid background in liberal arts and sciences enabling them to transfer to a baccalaureate program and pursue the initial certification in secondary education. Each of the four tracks, mathematics, biology, physics, and chemistry has been articulated with a corresponding four year program at one of the CUNY senior colleges.

Following discussion the item was approved for submission to the Board.

5. Hostos Community College – AAS in Game Design. Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that the proposed curriculum will prepare graduates for entry level jobs in the rapidly expanding entertainment software industry. The program emphasizes the use of industry standard technology and media required for a design career in business and industry. This program will be unique at CUNY. It is envisaged that in the future it will articulate with the baccalaureate program in game design currently under development at New York City College of Technology.
Following discussion the item was approved for submission to the Board.

6. **LaGuardia Community College – AS in Theater.** Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that the proposed program was developed on the basis of a popular concentration within the liberal arts program. It prepares students for transfer into a wide range of four year liberal arts or fine arts programs. An articulation with Queens College’s program in Drama and Theater has been signed. The college has sufficient faculty, expertise as well as facilities for staging theater productions.

Following discussion the item was approved for submission to the Board.

7. **John Jay College – BA in Law & Society.** Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that the proposed program replaces a major in legal studies, which is being phased out, with a structured interdisciplinary curriculum focusing on the study of legal institutions and their role in political and social changes. Students will be prepared for graduate study in a variety of disciplines including political science, sociology, history, and law as well as for entry to careers in public service and judicial administration, and for employment with nonprofit organizations.

Following discussion the item was approved for submission to the Board.

8. **John Jay College – BA in Philosophy.** Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that the program proposal is part of John Jay College’s transformation into a senior college with an array of traditional liberal arts majors. This major will offer students a solid background for further graduate or professional studies. The college already has the necessary faculty expertise.

Following discussion the item was approved for submission to the Board.

9. **Queens College – BA in Middle Eastern Studies.** Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that this liberal arts major will introduce students to Middle Eastern studies through the study of languages—Arabic, Hebrew, Farsi, and Turkish, as well as literature, civilization, and history, and prepares students for graduate or professional studies. This is the first such program at CUNY and is in response to national demand. The U.S. Department of Education recognizes the need not only for more speakers with fluency in Arabic and other Middle Eastern languages, but also graduates with area studies knowledge of this region.

Following discussion the item was approved for submission to the Board.

10. **Queensborough Community College/Hunter College – dual/joint AAS/BS in Nursing.** Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that this program provides a seamless transfer of associate level nursing graduates to a baccalaureate nursing program. It is the first such program in what is expected to be a series of collaborative programs across the University. Such programs are very important because increasingly hospitals and other employers will only hire nurses who have baccalaureate degrees.

In response to a question, Anne Marie Menendez, Chairperson of the Nursing Department at Queensborough Community College, stated that in order to recruit and attract individuals of Hispanic descent the college has hired a student success advocate who is working on recruitment, mentoring and support.
In response to a question, Chairperson Menendez stated that Hispanics are underrepresented in all the health fields. Last semester at Queensborough Community College Hispanics made up seven percent of students in nursing, but sometimes they make up to 21 percent of students.

Following discussion the item was approved for submission to the Board.

11. Brooklyn College – School of Education, creation of the departments of Early Childhood Education/Art Education; Childhood Education/Special Education; Secondary Education; School Psychology, Counseling and Leadership. Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that the proposed creation of four new departments is in line with the ongoing institutional reorganization at Brooklyn College, which puts an emphasis on a clear role for schools in the campus structure. Historically the School of Education has served as a single department. This arrangement is no longer adequate in view of the large number of students and the variety of degree programs offered. Therefore, Brooklyn College wishes to create four separate departments, with the School of Education continuing as the administrative unit overseeing the four departments. The faculty members have chosen their respective departments. This reorganization is resource neutral and it has been approved by the Brooklyn Policy Council.

Following discussion the item was approved for submission to the Board.

12. The City University of New York – Resolution on amendments to the Academic Integrity Policy. Following discussion, this item is approved for submission to the Board pending revision after consultation with the University Faculty Senate leadership. Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that the existing 2004 CUNY Policy on Academic Integrity addresses situations in which students violate principles of academic integrity by cheating, plagiarism or falsification of academic records. These amendments are necessary to bring the policy up to date with changes in technology and legal requirements and to provide additional clarity for campuses. It should be noted that the new amendments afford additional due process for students who deny allegations of academic dishonesty.

Prof. Karen Kaplowitz commented that the proposed new 3.2 language states that faculty members shall report all incidents they consider to be academic dishonesty on a faculty report form in substantially the same format as the sample annexed to this policy and shall submit the form to the college’s academic integrity officer. This can be read in two possible ways and the ambiguity is troubling. One possible way of reading this is that if a faculty member reports an incident about a person believed to have shown academic dishonesty then that faculty member must use a specific form, the form annexed to the policy. But another one of reading it is that faculty members shall report every incident.

Prof. Kaplowitz added that of course if a person thinks that it is not an issue of academic dishonesty they would not report it as an issue of academic dishonesty. This is capable of being read that if a faculty member believes a student has engaged in an activity that the faculty member considers to be academic dishonesty, the faculty member must report it, and that there is no discretion. There has to be discretion as there are all levels of academic dishonesty from freshmen cutting and pasting something because they have not yet quite learned the concept of plagiarism, attribution, and quoting, to someone who plagiarizes a master’s thesis. The way this policy is written takes away discretion, and the committee should consider correcting the language if that is not its intent.
General Counsel and Senior Vice Chancellor Schaffer stated for the record that when the policy states that faculty shall report all incidents they consider being academic dishonesty; this means that it is a matter of their academic discretion whether to report.

Prof. Kaplowitz proposed an amendment whereby section 3.2 would read that when faculty members report an incident that they consider to be academic dishonesty they shall use the faculty report form in substantially the same format as the sample annexed to the policy. The proposed amendment was moved and seconded, and opened for discussion.

Trustee Sam Sutton suggested that Prof. Kaplowitz's request could perhaps be accomplished with the words at the faculty member’s discretion—adding four words and then leaving the rest of the paragraph the same.

Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that there is another consideration here. Reporting an incident of academic dishonesty or lack of academic integrity is time consuming for the faculty member. It can also have adverse consequences for the faculty member. Therefore, there is an incentive for faculty not to report. Unfortunately, there are cases where students say that they have never done this before, and will never do it again, and this is not true. If the case is not reported, there is no way to track repeated academic dishonesty. It may be that faculty may not be reporting because of there being an incentive not to report. That is why many universities have made it a requirement that every such incident be reported.

General Counsel and Senior Vice Chancellor Schaffer stated that as a result of the colloquy with Trustee Sutton, he now understands the issue brought forth by Prof. Kaplowitz to mean faculty discretion not to report a serious or significant such incident, and he is in agreement with Dr. Logue that there is a price to be paid when faculty members exercise their discretion not to report serious incidents, perhaps because of the burden involved which is understandable, but it results in some serious consequences for the college and for the university when that occurs.

In response to suggestions from Chairperson Benno Schmidt and Trustee Cory Provost, General Counsel and Senior Vice Chancellor Schaffer stated that the second sentence would go first, so it would begin with a statement that a faculty member who suspects that a student has committed a violation of the CUNY academic integrity policy shall review with the student the facts and circumstances of the suspected violation whenever possible. The next sentence would read: if the faculty member concludes in his/her judgment that there has been a substantial incident of academic dishonesty, the faculty member shall report such incident.

The proposed amendment to section 3.2 was accepted.

Prof. Kaplowitz then commented that she found it troubling that in the proposed new language for section 4.1, the second paragraph, there is no measure of plagiarism or cheating. She proposed that this wording be added.

General Counsel and Senior Vice Chancellor Schaffer noted that the substance of Prof. Kaplowitz' comments is what is intended in this section. He agreed that while it is not desirable to redraft language at meetings, CUNY has a consultative process that for this policy began in March 2011, and it is also not desirable when that consultative process does not result in timely responses.
Chancellor Matthew Goldstein suggested that this resolution be “paused,” and that the committee go forward with approving the proposed policy with the understanding that there will be every effort made in the next week by all parties involved to revise it.

Following this discussion the item was approved for submission to the Board.

13. Medgar Evers College – Honorary Degrees. Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that both of these honorary degrees were recommended by the Medgar Evers College Honorary Degree Committee and were then voted on unanimously and positively by the Medgar Evers College Council.

In response to a question, Chancellor Goldstein stated that, in general, when the University gives an honorary degree to an individual, it would pay their expenses to come to the ceremony if they request it, unless they are people of means.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board. Vice Chairperson Philip A. Berry abstained.

14. The City University of New York – Resolution on Creating an Efficient Transfer System. Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that for over forty years CUNY undergraduates have struggled with having their course credits transferred when they moved from one CUNY campus to another. All too often students have received elective credit for courses they have taken as part of general education or as major courses even when they did not change majors when transferring, and sometimes they have not received credit at all. This is because in most cases transfer credit at CUNY has operated on a course matching system. Courses taken at campus A receive credit at campus B, if campus B judges that it has a course that matches the course at campus A. Because of delays in getting their transfer credits evaluated and because of frequent assessments that courses do not match, students have taken the wrong courses and/or had to retake courses and/or take additional courses resulting in longer times to complete course work and lack of coverage of all courses by financial aid, two factors that are known to decrease the probability of a student ever graduating as well as increasing the cost of an education to students, the city, and the state. New York State education law considers CUNY to be a single university and directs CUNY to have easy transfer among its colleges, yet a variety of research studies and policies have failed to resolve the issues facing our transferring undergraduates.

Now in 2011, huge proportions of CUNY students are transferring, typical of what is going on across the United States but perhaps even more frequent at CUNY due to the close physical proximity of our campuses. Last fall alone approximately 10,000 of our undergraduates transferred from one CUNY campus to another, and at every one of our senior colleges, over fifty percent of the graduates are now transfer students. We must insure that these students have the same clear and efficient pathways to graduation as do the students who do not transfer.

Articulation agreements have proven of great worth to the pairs of colleges that have established them, and high quality academic advising is also critical. However, with CUNY students transferring between all possible pairs of colleges, with over 700 undergraduate majors and over 23,000 undergraduate courses, and with articulation agreements sometimes taking years to establish and becoming out of date as soon as one of the colleges changes one course, articulation agreements are not a viable method for assisting the majority of our students with transfer.
It is time for CUNY to take comprehensive action to break down these barriers for our students, to respect our students’ right to transfer seamlessly among the different campuses of our single University according to their needs and interests, though subject to the admission standards of the different colleges. The resolution before you now addresses transfer credit issues in terms of the three main parts of any undergraduate curriculum: general education, major and electives.

The first part concerns general education courses, with the resolution establishing a general education framework for all of CUNY, one that will prepare students for lifelong learning and intellectual success. The general education framework itself consists of two parts, the common core and the college option. The common core will consist of thirty credits that will apply to all AA, AS, and baccalaureate students. These thirty credits will be divided into curricular areas defined according to learning outcomes by a task force consisting predominantly of faculty. Each college’s faculty will then submit its choice of courses to satisfy these learning outcomes. The college option will comprise an additional twelve credits of general education for baccalaureate students for a total of forty-two general education credits for baccalaureate students (a bit high compared to national norms.), with the college option courses determined by the faculty at the individual baccalaureate colleges. Students who satisfy any part of the general education framework at any college will be deemed to have satisfied that part at all CUNY colleges.

In addition, to insure that associate degree students do not have to take significant numbers of general education courses in the latter part of their college careers when they should be focusing on their majors and electives, the number of college option credits that a student transferring from an associate to a baccalaureate program must take will be limited according to how many total credits that student has accumulated at the time of transfer.

The second part of the resolution concerns major courses. In order to insure that students can begin a major at any CUNY college and then transfer seamlessly in that same major to any other CUNY college, faculty from across CUNY will convene and decide on the first three to six courses that lead into the largest transfer majors. The third part of the resolution concerns electives. A student’s electives taken at any CUNY college will transfer with full credit to any other CUNY college. The proposed resolution contains provisions for students transferring to a CUNY college from outside of CUNY as well.

Prof. Kaplowitz requested the distribution of two documents at the table, stating that one is a set of resolutions from faculty at some of the senior and community colleges, objecting to the proposed policy; and that the second document is from the UFS, which voted unanimously to authorize her to present certain delineated changes to the resolution to the committee, and move them in total. This was moved, seconded, and opened for discussion.

After extensive discussion on the proposed changes, during which time the committee listened to suggestions from Vice Chairperson Berry and Prof. Sandi Cooper among others, Chancellor Goldstein noted that he would like to dispose of this amendment, by stating that he supported the idea of the C or better language, and that he strongly disagreed with upping the general education credits from forty-two as it would not conform with the rest of the U.S.
Chairperson Schmidt interjected that the committee would consider Chancellor Goldstein’s suggestion as a friendly amendment, and that this would mean that the original motion would now include the C or better language.

Chancellor Goldstein further suggested that the committee reject the other amendments proposed by the UFS. He added that while the UFS is an important body within the University’s decision-making framework, it is not the only body of faculty that this administration works with.

Prof. Kaplowitz stated that she would like to amend her earlier motion, by proposing that 50% of the members of the CUNY committees established by the resolution be taken from a list of nominations from the UFS. Prof. Kaplowitz’s amended motion was not seconded, and thus remained closed for discussion by the committee.

Trustee Cory Provost stated that he did not agree with the change to the C or better language regarding transfer.

Chairperson Schmidt stated that since this language was accepted only as a friendly amendment, Trustee Provost could move to strike it.

Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that she had been informed that there might be financial aid issues with not transferring grades of less than C. Further, the intent behind this resolution is that if something counts at one college, it counts at another college, and the resolution already contains language regarding respecting the grade requirements and residency rules at the transfer colleges.

Chairperson Schmidt agreed to withdraw the friendly amendment.

Prof. Kaplowitz then commented that she favored revising the last “resolved” on page four, as a friendly amendment, that the evaluations that will take place every year for three years beginning in 2013, be placed on the agenda of this committee so that its findings can be discussed.

Chancellor Goldstein stated that this would occur.

Committee Chair Chen called the question on the original resolution. The resolution was approved. Prof. Kaplowitz voted NO.

II. INFORMATION ITEMS:

A. CUNY School of Law – Center on Urban Environmental Reform

Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that the CUNY School of Law is submitting its resolution on the Center on Urban Environmental Reform, CUER, for Board approval via this month’s Chancellor University Report. In accordance with standard practice this item is also being presented for informational purposes to this committee. The main goals of the proposed center will be producing research on urban environmental justice and converting that research into policy tools useful to planners, policy makers and advocates. The Center will institute a fellowship program for students interested in working on environmental decision making and host an annual speaker series. Center activities will also support development of classes on environmental law and policy. A
modest annual budget is projected to organize regular conferences and workshops and so on and will be supported through outside grants.

B. Report by Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost Alexandra Logue

Executive Vice Chancellor Logue gave an update on University enrollment for the coming fall. She stated that the University is up in freshmen admissions by almost 6 percent, but most of the increase is at the comprehensive and community colleges. Transfer admissions are ahead of last year, but again it is not even across the board. The senior colleges are flat overall in terms of transfer admissions, but the community colleges are way ahead of last year by a total of 54 percent. Some of these increases are the result of higher standards at the most selective senior colleges, including that those colleges are no longer taking conditional admits (undergraduates who need some remediation and must address those needs before enrolling in September). This may mean that the show rate, which is the percentage of accepted students who actually enroll, may be down this year because fewer students are being accepted to their first choice CUNY college and so would be more likely to end up enrolling in a non-CUNY college. In terms of enrollment, the University appears to be several thousand ahead of the same point last year but it is still too early to make an accurate assessment of that.

Executive Vice Chancellor Logue stated that at the Board’s Faculty, Staff and Administration meeting five scholars will be considered for the rank of Distinguished Professor, which is CUNY’s highest faculty rank. These five scholars are: Paul Attewell, who is presently a professor at the Graduate School and University Center; Peter Godfrey Smith who comes to CUNY from Harvard’s Department of Philosophy; David Sorkin who comes to CUNY from the University of Wisconsin - Madison; Peter Kwong, who has been at Hunter College since 1993; and, V. Parameswaran Nair who has worked at City College since 1993.

Chancellor Goldstein stated that he would like to make a statement at the end of this important meeting: I really just want to congratulate all of us in taking this very important step forward. I know there are many students here today and know that so much of our work is really directed to giving you the very best experience that you can have without unnecessary impedances built into the system. He noted that he would also like to commend Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost Alexandra Logue: this is a woman of the greatest professionalism, dignity, and intellect. Her academic record is comparable with that of the best of the faculty we have in this University. She has been fair, and she has listened and moderated her positions over this very long and arduous time. She has stayed focused and refused to participate in theatrical moves while understanding that she could still face a blemish on her impeccable career. Chancellor Goldstein added that he was deeply offended by what was transmitted to some members of this committee with respect to this matter, and that the University owed Dr. Logue a great debt of gratitude.

Chairperson Schmidt proposed and moved the following resolution:

Committee Resolution of Appreciation – Dr. Alexandra W. Logue.

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees Standing Committee on Academic Policy, Programs and Research, on behalf of the full membership of the Board, expresses its heartfelt appreciation and depth of gratitude to Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost Alexandra W. Logue for her exemplary dedication and superb work in creating an efficient transfer system that is of critical importance to the students of The City University of New York.
The resolution was unanimously approved.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:59 p.m.