MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

HELD

MARCH 23, 1981

AT THE BOARD HEADQUARTERS BUILDING
535 EAST 80 STREET–BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

The Chairperson called the meeting to order at 4:50 P.M.

There were present:

James P. Murphy, Chairperson
Edith B. Everett, Vice-Chairperson

Paul P. Baard
Blanche Bernstein
James A. Cavanagh
Armand D’Angelo

Judah Gribezt
Harold M. Jacobs
Albert V. Maniscalco
Joaquin Rivera
David Z. Robinson

Ann M. Burton, ex officio
Garth Marchant, ex officio

Martin J. Warmbrand, Secretary of the Board
David B. Rigney, General Counsel and Vice-Chancellor for Legal Affairs

Chancellor Robert J. Kibbee
Acting Deputy Chancellor Leon M. Goldstein
President Milton G. Bassin
President Roscoe C. Brown, Jr.
President Saul B. Cohen
President Flora Mancuso Edwards
Acting President Israel Glasser
President Robert L. Hess
President Leonard Lief
President Gerald W. Lynch
President Kurt R. Schmeller
President Ursula Schwerin

President Joel Segall
President Donna E. Shalala
President Joseph Shenker
President Joshua L. Smith
Acting President Arthur E. Tiedemann
President Edmond Volpe
Vice Chancellor Richard M. Catalano
Vice Chancellor Dolores E. Cross
Vice Chancellor Julius C.C. Edelstein
Acting Vice Chancellor Ira H. Fuchs
Vice Chancellor Jerald Posman
Vice Chancellor Leonard O. Roellig

Etta G. Grass, Assistant Secretary of the Board

The absence of Mr. Badillo, Dr. Polk, and Mrs. Titone was excused.
A. CUNY BASKETBALL TOURNAMENT: The Chairperson congratulated The College of Staten Island on its victory in the CUNY Basketball Tournament.

NO. 1. UNIVERSITY REPORT: RESOLVED, That the University Report for March 23, 1981 (including Addendum Items) be approved, as amended as follows:

(a) PART D - ADDENDUM: Add the following item:

D.2. AMENDMENT OF MINUTES: RESOLVED, That the Board minutes of 11/20/78, Cal. No. 5A be amended to make the effective date for the Civil Service Management Plan 12/1/78. The Plan was presented at the 11/20/78 Board meeting for approval effective 12/1/78. Inadvertently the record through a clerical error gave the effective date as 1/1/78.

(b) Items listed in PART E - ERRATA, to be withdrawn or changed as indicated.

EXPLANATION: The University Report consists of annual instructional appointments at a salary of $15,000 and above and other resolutions of a non-policy nature which require approval by the Board of Trustees.

NO. 2. CHANCELLOR'S REPORT: RESOLVED, That the Chancellor's Report for March 23, 1981 (including Addendum Items) be approved, as amended as follows:

(a) Items listed in PART E - ERRATA, to be withdrawn or changed as indicated.

EXPLANATION: The Chancellor's Report consists of standard resolutions and actions of a non-policy nature which require approval by the Board of Trustees.

NO. 3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: RESOLVED, That the minutes of the meeting of the Board of Trustees held February 23, 1981 be approved as amended to indicate that Cal. No 4D failed to pass.

At this point Mr. Gribetz joined the meeting.

NO. 4. COMMITTEE ON FACILITIES PLANNING AND MANAGEMENT AND CONTRACT REVIEW: RESOLVED, That the following items be approved:

A. SENIOR COLLEGE MAJOR CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS:

RESOLVED, That the Board approve the advancement and implementation of four new senior college capital construction projects:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROJECT</th>
<th>ESTIMATED COST</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Queens College, New Science Building</td>
<td>$41,988,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City College, Alterations in Shepard Hall for School of Architecture</td>
<td>3,186,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lehman College, Alteration of Old Library for Art Department</td>
<td>4,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City College, Alterations in Townsend Harris Hall for Industrial Arts Department (Planning Only)</td>
<td>137,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

and be it further
RESOLVED, That the form and substance of a proposed Supplemental Agreement among The City University, The City University Construction Fund and the New York State Dormitory Authority which provides, among other matters, for financing by the Dormitory Authority by the issuance of the Authority's Bonds and Notes in one or more Series pursuant to the Revenue Bond Resolution and Agreement of Lease dated as of June 12, 1967, as supplemented from time to time, of the indicated facilities constituting a part of the Project is hereby approved; the Chairman of the Board of Trustees is hereby authorized and directed to execute such Supplemental Agreement and to cause the seal of such Board to be affixed thereto; and the Secretary of the Board is hereby authorized and directed to affix his signature thereto in attestation of such seal; and be it further

RESOLVED, That notwithstanding any other provision of this resolution, prior to the execution of such Supplemental Agreement, changes, insertions and omissions may be made thereto as may be approved by the Chairman of the Board and the execution by said Chairman of such Supplementary Agreement containing such changes, insertions, and the attestation thereto by the Secretary, shall be conclusive evidence of such approval; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Board hereby affirms that the aforeindicated facilities are included in its approved Master Plan; and be it further

RESOLVED, That The City University Construction Fund be and is hereby requested to approve the advancement and implementation of the indicated facilities and to approve and execute the aforementioned Supplemental Agreement; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Chancellor be authorized and directed to secure any additional approvals that may be determined to be necessary to implement the facility development approved herein.

EXPLANATION: The State Executive Budget for 1981-82 includes a recommendation for funding of four senior college projects proposed by The City University. In anticipation of the Legislature approving the Governor's recommendation, this resolution will authorize agreements and actions necessary to arrange Dormitory Authority financing for the four facilities. Selection of architects, approval of plans and cost estimates, etc. will be submitted for Board approval at later dates.

B. THE CITY COLLEGE - COMPTON HALL WINDOW REPLACEMENT:

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York approve the contract documents, specifications and expenditure and authorize The City College to advertise for, receive and open bids and award contract to the lowest responsible bidder for furnishing all the necessary labor and materials required for the replacement of all machinery operated steel swing out windows with double-glazed thermally efficient windows in Compton Hall at an estimated cost of $350,000 chargeable to Capital Project HN-203.

EXPLANATION: It is imperative that the replacement of the deteriorated windows be done in order to protect the inside environment from outside effects such as noise, dirt, temperature extremes and the weather. The existing original installed windows (1903-07) are a significant cause of heat loss as well as a cause of water damage to interior building surfaces.

C. QUEENS COLLEGE - UNIFORMED GUARD SERVICE:

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York approve the contract documents and specifications and authorize Queens College to advertise for, receive and open bids and award contract to the lowest responsible bidder or exercise its option to renew the existing contract for Uniformed Guard Service as required by Queens College for the period July 1, 1981 to June 30, 1982 at a total estimated cost of $470,000 chargeable to Code 2.3480-14-00 and/or such other funds as may be available, subject to financial ability. (See also BHE Cal. No. 2(b), 4/20/64)

EXPLANATION: Guards are utilized to prevent entrance of unauthorized vehicles; to patrol the campus and rented property; and to protect against theft, vandalism, illegal parking and other illegal or improper deportment.
At this point Prof. Burton left the meeting.

D. THE CITY COLLEGE - UNIFORMED GUARD SERVICE:

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York approve the contract documents and expenditure and authorize The City College to advertise for, receive and open bids and award contract to the lowest responsible bidder for furnishing Uniformed Guard Service including armed service when necessary as required, for the buildings and campus areas of The City College for the period July 1, 1981 to June 30, 1982 with an option by the College to renew for two (2) additional years, from July 1, 1982 to June 30, 1983 and July 1, 1983 to June 30, 1984. Said option to be executed by the college on a year to year basis on the same terms and conditions as set forth in the contract, in the estimated amounts, subject to financial ability chargeable as set forth herein:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TAX LEVY</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7002.176-8201-2-23480-14-00</td>
<td>$1,135,802</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7002.176-8301-2-23480-14-00</td>
<td>1,249,382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7002.176-8401-2-23480-14-00</td>
<td>1,374,320</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NON-TAX LEVY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7/1/81 - 6/30/82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/1/82 - 6/30/83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/1/83 - 6/30/84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These estimates also reflect the following required support equipment:

Motor vehicles and Cushman now in operation have proven to be highly effective for use in patrolling the campus. Their high visibility acts as a deterrent to potential perpetrators. The walkie talkies are to provide ready communication and instant response to Campus incidents and are mandated as an instrument of support.

It is anticipated that when this contract is submitted for bid the hourly cost for guard service will rise due to escalated cost in labor and equipment for this type of service.

Request for acquisition of related services covers required security in over 2,256,407 square feet of usable campus space including peripheral buildings in off-campus facilities, and requirements for the North Academic Complex security.

This is a requirements contract: the estimated amount may or may not be completely encumbered. The indicated non-tax levy funds are for guarding the Student Center and Bookstore and are included as part of the contract in order to assure these facilities of equal rates for services that may be required by them.

The resolution was adopted with the understanding that a particular question raised with respect to non-uniformed guards at City College will be answered by the College. Many other issues relating to guard service are part of a study underway. It is expected that a report will be made to the Committee within a few weeks.

E. BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN COMMUNITY COLLEGE - UNIFORMED GUARD SERVICE 1981-82:

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees approve the contract documents and specifications and authorize the Borough of Manhattan Community College to advertise for, receive, open and award contract to the lowest responsible bidder for Furnishing Guard Service from July 1, 1981 to June 30, 1982, with a maximum of three renewal options, at an estimated cost of $206,463, chargeable to code 2-34801-400, Contractual Services and/or such other funds as may be available.

EXPLANATION: The present contract expires June 30, 1981 and continued service is essential.
NO. 5. COMMITTEE ON ACADEMIC POLICY, PROGRAM, AND RESEARCH: RESOLVED, That
the following items be approved:

A. QUEENS COLLEGE - BACHELOR OF FINE ARTS:

RESOLVED, That the eighty-two credit program in art, leading to the Bachelor of Fine Arts degree, to be offered at Queens College be approved, effective September 1, 1981, subject to financial ability.

EXPLANATION: The purpose of the B.F.A. program is to improve the educational opportunities in Art available to residents of Queens, Nassau, and Suffolk counties, by adding, alongside an existing B.A. program in art at Queens College, a specialized program in fine arts for qualified and highly motivated students. Courses for the B.F.A. program are drawn from existing courses in the Art Department.

B. STUDENT ELIGIBILITY FOR STATE FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE:

WHEREAS, The Revised Regulations of the State Education Department concerning Student Eligibility for State Financial Assistance and the related guidelines of the Commissioner for Implementation of such regulations are complex and far-reaching, and

WHEREAS, Their implementation is likely to have a detrimental educational impact on students in the University, and

WHEREAS, Their implementation is likely to unjustly deprive certain students of educational opportunity, and

WHEREAS, Their implementation imposes new, extensive, and costly administrative burdens; therefore be it

RESOLVED, That this Board express formally its strong opposition to the implementation of this important matter pending a determination of the impact on students and institutions; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Chancellor represent these concerns before the appropriate public officials and bodies; and

be it further

RESOLVED, That a copy of this resolution be transmitted by the Secretary to the Chancellor of the Regents and to the Commissioner of Education of the State of New York.

C. STUDENT RETENTION AND ACADEMIC PROGRESS:

RESOLVED, That the policy regarding Student Retention and Progress adopted by the Board on April 5, 1976 (Calendar No. 7) and amended on October 25, 1976 (University Report) be amended as follows:

STUDENT RETENTION AND PROGRESS: [RESOLVED, That the grade of “incomplete” or its equivalent shall be awarded only when the course requirement has not been completed for good and sufficient reasons and where there is reasonable expectation that the student can in fact successfully complete the requirements of the course; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the grade of (W), withdrawal without penalty, be awarded only when it is clear that the student has good and sufficient reasons for withdrawing from the course and is doing so at a time when he or she is doing passing work in the course; and be it further

RESOLVED, That satisfactory progress toward a degree shall be defined as the satisfactory completion of:
1. At least one-half of the first four (4) courses or twelve (12) credits attempted.
2. At least two-thirds of the second four (4) courses or twelve (12) credits attempted.
3. At least three-quarters of the third four (4) courses or twelve (12) credits attempted.
4. At least three-quarters of all courses attempted in any subsequent semester;

and be it further]

RESOLVED, That until August 31, 1981 and until substitute standards are in place each student will be expected to maintain a grade point average of at least 1.50 for the first four (4) courses or twelve (12) credits attempted and at least a 1.75 grade point average for the first eight (8) courses or twenty-four (24) credits attempted [], and that in each subsequent semester students will be expected to maintain at least a 2.00 grade point average; and be it further

RESOLVED, That, until August 31, 1981 and until substitute standards are in place, students who fail to achieve these standards [will] be placed on probation for one semester and if unable to correct their deficiencies during that semester [will] they be dropped from the University. The normal academic appeals procedure of each college will continue to consider individual cases and to make such exceptions [to the implementation of these guidelines] as unusual circumstances may warrant; and be it further

[RESOLVED, That students who are dropped from the University for academic reasons may apply for readmission after one semester and be subject to normal faculty decisions;]

RESOLVED, That the Chancellor, after appropriate consultation within the University, promulgate a glossary precisely defining the symbols used as grades in the academic courses; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Chancellor, after appropriate consultation within the University, promulgate the minimal standards for satisfactory progress for full-time undergraduate students, to be effective September 1, 1981 and to be used for determining student eligibility for State financial assistance and not for general institutional use; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Chancellor, after submission of his proposed standards, and pursuant to any subsequent negotiation on these standards, will resubmit them to the Board; and be it further

RESOLVED, That, through the normal academic processes each college recommend, prior to August 31, 1981, to the Board, with the approval of the Chancellor, its minimal academic standards for retention of full-time and part-time students and that these standards be designed for general institutional use and be it further

RESOLVED, That students who fail to meet their college’s retention standards or the conditions of an academic or other probation, be dropped from their college but may apply for readmission no sooner than one semester after their dismissal and be subject to normal faculty admission decisions; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the normal faculty processes dealing with student placement on academic probation, attendance probation, or other probation deemed advisable by the faculty be continued with the condition that such probation constitute good academic standing for the purpose of student eligibility for financial assistance; and be it further

RESOLVED, That students moving to the upper divisions of a four-year college either from the lower divisions of the college or from a community college within the University system or outside of it must provide evidence, in accordance with a standard to be determined by the Chancellor, that they have attained a level of proficiency in basic learning skills necessary to cope successfully with advanced work in the academic disciplines.
EXPLANATION: Foregoing resolutions are intended to maximize the instructional resources of the University. With the inception of the Open Admissions Program, the University and its faculty have liberalized the grading process so as to maximize opportunities for students. In the process, the grading system has been abused to the extent that very little incentive has been provided the student where he or she is doing less than average work. The intent of these resolutions is to have students' transcripts accurately reflect their performance and to maximize the available instructional resources.

EXPLANATION: The foregoing amended resolution permits the University to develop standards which in the academic judgment of the University carry out the purposes of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education of the State of New York regarding student eligibility for State financial assistance and authorizes the Chancellor to carry out any necessary negotiations with the State Education Department. Since eligibility for State financial assistance is based on inflexible standards which are not suitable for general institutional use, this resolution provides for the establishment of academic standards for both, general institutional and financial assistance use. At the same time, the resolution clarifies the difference between the status of academic or other probation and the loss of good academic standing as it affects eligibility for State financial assistance. Provision is also made for revising retention standards for the students of the University by a process which maximizes involvement of the colleges. The resolution further provides for standardization of symbols used for grades.

Mr. Marchant voted No.

Mr. Marchant left the meeting.

NO. 5X. COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC POLICY AND EXTERNAL RELATIONS: Mr. Maniscalco, the Chairperson of the Committee, reported on the very successful borough hearing held on March 12 in Queens and announced that the next borough hearing would be held in Manhattan on April 23, from 3 to 5 P.M. in City Hall. He commended the Trustees who had been present at the Queens hearing and urged a similar attendance in Manhattan.

NO. 6. COMMITTEE ON FACULTY, STAFF, AND ADMINISTRATION: RESOLVED, That the following action be taken:

A. DISTINGUISHED PROFESSOR: Withdrawn.

At this point Mr. Baard left the meeting. Mr. Marchant returned.

NO. 6X. PRESIDENTIAL DISCRETIONARY FUNDS: At the meeting of the Board held February 23, 1981, Calendar No. 11, the issues raised as to the use of auxiliary enterprise funds and the inclusion of the University's commitment to non-discrimination were referred back to the Chancellor's Task Force for further clarification and report to the Board. The Chancellor reported briefly on the recommendation of the Task Force.

It was agreed to refer the question of auxiliary enterprise funds to a special subcommittee of the Task Force on Student Activity Fees, which will be asked to incorporate this matter in its recommendation on student activity fees. The Task Force will be asked to submit its report by May.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the following resolution was adopted:

RESOLVED, That the Board's Guidelines on Discretionary Funds, Paragraph 4, be amended as follows:

Payment of dues and fees to clubs which restrict their membership by race, creed or sex may not be made from discretionary funds.
Mr. Marchant voted No because, he stated, although he was not against the resolution, there was no clearcut understanding of what discretionary funds and auxiliary enterprise funds are.

NO. 7 REPORT BY PRESIDENT HESS: President Hess made an oral presentation on the academic programs of Brooklyn College, with particular emphasis on the newly instituted core curriculum, and on the accomplishments of the College's graduates.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the Board went into executive session to consider a personnel matter.

There were present:

James P. Murphy, Chairperson
Edith B. Everett, Vice-Chairperson

Blanche Bernstein  
James A. Cavanagh  
Armand D'Angelo  
Judah Gribetz

Harold M. Jacobs  
Albert V. Maniscalco  
Joaquin Rivera  
David Z. Robinson

Martin J. Warmbrand, Secretary of the Board
David B. Rigney, General Counsel and Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs

Acting Deputy Chancellor Leon M. Goldstein  
Vice Chancellor Richard M. Catalano  
Vice Chancellor Jerald Posman  
Etta G. Grass, Assistant Secretary of the Board

The absence of Mr. Baard, Mr. Badillo, Dr. Polk, Mrs. Titone, Prof. Burton, and Mr. Marchant was excused.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the following resolution was adopted.

NO. 8. CHANCELLOR'S SALARY: RESOLVED, That the salary of the Chancellor be increased to $69,100 per annum, effective January 1, 1981, subject to financial ability, and subject to the approval of the State Director of the Budget. This represents the Chancellor's total salary for the performance of his duties.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the meeting was adjourned at 6:39 P.M.

MARTIN J. WARMBRAND  
Secretary of the board