MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

HELD

AUGUST 26, 1999

AT THE BOARD HEADQUARTERS BUILDING
535 EAST 80TH STREET - BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

The Chairperson called the meeting to order at 5:02 P.M.

There were present:

Herman Badillo, Chairman
Benno C. Schmidt, Jr., Vice Chairman

Satish K. Babbar
John J. Calandra
Kenneth E. Cook
John Morning

Md. Mizanur R. Biswas, ex officio

Secretary Genevieve Mullin
Roy P. Moskowitz, Acting General Counsel and Acting Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs
Hourig Messerlian, Executive Assistant

Chancellor-Designate Matthew Goldstein
Interim Chancellor Christoph M. Kimmich
Interim Deputy Chancellor Patricia Hassett
President Raymond C. Bowen
President David A. Caputo
President Dolores Fernandez
President Ricardo R. Fernandez
President Frances Degen Horowitz
President Edison O. Jackson
President Charles C. Kidd

President Antonio Perez
President Allen Lee Sessoms
President Mariene Springer
President Carolyn G. Williams
Dean Kristin Booth Glen
Dean Stanford R. Roman, Jr.
Interim Vice Chancellor Sherry Brabham
Vice Chancellor Jay Hershenson
Vice Chancellor Louise Mirrer

The absence of Trustees Michael C. Crimmins, Alfred B. Curtis, Jr., Ronald J. Marino, Randy M. Mastro, Kathleen M. Pesile, and Bernard Sohmer was excused.
Upon motion duly made, seconded and carried, the following resolution was unanimously adopted:

Chairman Badillo stated that as you know, Jim Murphy is no longer a member of this Board. He served on the Board for over twenty years and has been my friend for many years before that. We go back to the State Constitutional Convention in the late 1960’s. I have talked with Jim and I expect to be working with him on some of the programs that we will be developing. I would like now to read the following:

NO. 1. RESOLUTION OF APPRECIATION – JAMES P. MURPHY:

WHEREAS, The Honorable James P. Murphy has served with exemplary distinction as a member of the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York from June, 1980 to August, 1999 and in an earlier term from 1974 to 1976, and as Chairman of the Board from September, 1980 to February, 1997; and

WHEREAS, As Chairman of the Board of Trustees, he has brought to the Board’s work a perception of the role of public higher education for the cultural, social, and economic enhancement of individuals and citizens of New York as a whole; and

WHEREAS, He fostered the establishment of the Kennedy Fellows Program for the advancement of individuals who work with the developmentally disabled; and

WHEREAS, James P. Murphy won the admiration of his colleagues in the University community through his unflagging dedication to, and vigorous defense of, the educational mission of The City University of New York; and

WHEREAS, The Board, the Administration, the faculty, staff, and students have benefited from his leadership, concern, and commitment throughout his many years of outstanding service; now therefore be it

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees extends its most sincere thanks and expresses its deepest appreciation and gratitude to the Honorable James P. Murphy for the creativity, intelligence, and the constancy with which he has carried out his duties as a member and Chairman of the Board; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees and the entire University community wishes him continued success in his public and private endeavors.

A. INTRODUCTION OF NEW TRUSTEE: Chairman Badillo announced that on behalf of the Board and the Administration it is his pleasure to introduce and welcome Benno C. Schmidt, Jr., who has been appointed by Governor Pataki to serve as Vice Chairman of the Board, and has been confirmed by the State Senate. Welcome Benno, and congratulations.

B. CONDOLENCES: Chairman Badillo offered condolences on behalf of the Board and the Administration to Benno Schmidt on the loss of his stepmother, Nancy Montgomery Schmidt, who passed away on August 10, 1999.

C. INTRODUCTION OF CHANCELLOR-DESIGNATE MATTHEW GOLDSTEIN: Chairman Badillo stated that it is his pleasure to introduce and welcome Chancellor-Designate Matthew Goldstein. Although he does not officially begin until September 1, you can be sure I’ve had him working from the very day that we talked about his becoming Chancellor. Matthew has been going through the transition process with Christoph Kimmich. Welcome, Matt, and congratulations.
D. APPRECIATION OF SERVICE – LOIS CRONHOLM: Chairman Badillo called on Trustee Nilda Soto Ruiz to present the following:

On behalf of the Board of Trustees, I wish to extend sincere thanks and appreciation to Lois Cronholm for her dedicated service to Baruch College. She has served as Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs of the college from 1992 to 1998 and from June, 1998 as Interim President. The constituents of both The City University and Baruch College have greatly benefited from Dr. Cronholm's energetic and visionary leadership. We wish her success in all her future endeavors.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the Public meeting was adjourned at 5:07 P.M. to go into Executive Session.

SECRETARY GENEVIEVE MULLIN
MINUTES OF THE EXECUTIVE SESSION OF THE BOARD OF
TRUSTEES OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK
HELD
AUGUST 26, 1999
AT THE BOARD HEADQUARTERS BUILDING
535 EAST 80TH STREET - BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

The Executive Session was called to order at 5:10 P.M.

There were present:

Herman Badillo, Chairman
Benno C. Schmidt, Jr., Vice Chairman

Satish K. Babbar
John J. Calandra
Kenneth E. Cook
John Morning

Kathleen M. Pesile
George J. Rios
Nilda Soto Ruiz
Jeffrey S. Wiesenfeld

Md. Mizanoor R. Biswas, ex officio

Secretary Genevieve Mullin
Roy P. Moskowitz, Acting General Counsel and Acting Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs
Hourig Messerlian, Executive Assistant

Chancellor-Designate Matthew Goldstein
Interim Chancellor Christoph M. Kimmich
Interim Deputy Chancellor Patricia Hassett
Vice Chancellor Jay Hershenson

The absence of Trustees Michael C. Crimmins, Alfred B. Curtis, Jr., Ronald J. Marino, Randy M. Mastro, and Bernard Sohmer was excused.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the following resolution was adopted:

The Board went into Executive Session to discuss personnel matters.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the Executive Session was adjourned at 5:29 P.M. to go into Public Session.

SECRETARY GENEVIEVE MULLIN
MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

HELD

AUGUST 26, 1999

AT THE BOARD HEADQUARTERS BUILDING
535 EAST 80TH STREET - BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

The Public session reconvened at 5:30 P.M.

There were present:

Herman Badillo, Chairman
Benno C. Schmidt, Jr., Vice Chairman

Satish K. Babbar
John J. Calandra
Kenneth E. Cook
John Morning

Kathleen M. Pesile
George J. Rios
Nilda Soto Ruiz
Jeffrey S. Wiesenfeld

Md. Mizanoor R. Biswas, ex officio

Secretary Genevieve Mullin
Roy P. Moskowitz, Acting General Counsel and Acting Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs
Hourig Messerlian, Executive Assistant

Chancellor-Designate Matthew Goldstein
Interim Chancellor Christoph M. Kimmich
Interim Deputy Chancellor Patricia Hassett

President Ricardo R. Fernandez
Vice Chancellor Jay Hershenson

The absence of Trustees Michael C. Crimmins, Alfred B. Curtis, Jr., Ronald J. Marino, Randy M. Mastro, and Bernard Sohmer was excused.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the following resolutions were unanimously adopted:

NO. 2. THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK – CENTRAL OFFICE, DESIGNATION OF CHANCELLOR (REVISED):

RESOLVED, That the effective date of the designation of Dr. Matthew Goldstein as Chancellor of The City University of New York be changed to September 1, 1999; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the effective date of the salary plan amendment increasing the salary of the Chancellor from $178,523 to $250,000 be changed to September 1, 1999; and that it be noted that the housing allowance provided to the Chancellor in lieu of University residence be set at $7,500 per month.
EXPLANATION: The Board of Trustees, at its special meeting of July 22, 1999 set September 6, 1999 as the effective date of the designation of Dr. Matthew Goldstein as Chancellor and as the effective date upon which the salary of the Chancellor would be increased to $250,000. The change to September 1, 1999 reflects the actual date Dr. Goldstein will assume office as Chancellor at the indicated salary level and notes the amount of the housing allowance approved by the Board of Trustees.

NO. 3. BARUCH COLLEGE – DESIGNATION OF INTERIM PRESIDENT:

RESOLVED, That Dr. Sidney I. Lirtzman be appointed Interim President of Baruch College, effective September 1, 1999, with an annual salary at the applicable presidential level, subject to financial ability, and that during the period of his service as Interim President, Dr. Lirtzman be granted a leave from his position as Dean of the Zicklin School of Business at Baruch College.

EXPLANATION: Dr. Lirtzman has been Dean of the Zicklin School of Business at Baruch College since 1995. Dr. Lirtzman has been an administrator and faculty member at Baruch College since 1967, including previous appointments as Associate Dean of Graduate Studies in the School of Business and Public Administration (1973-1988), Acting Vice President for Academic Affairs/Provost (1976-1978), and Executive Officer of the Ph.D. Program in Business (1973-1988).

NO. 4. THE CITY COLLEGE – DESIGNATION OF INTERIM PRESIDENT:

RESOLVED, That Dr. Stanford A. Roman, Jr. be appointed Interim President of The City College, effective September 1, 1999.

EXPLANATION: Dr. Roman will continue to serve as Dean of the Sophie Davis School of Biomedical Education/The City University of New York Medical School, which position he has held since 1990. Dr. Roman had previously served as Senior Vice President for Medical and Professional Affairs of the New York City Health and Hospitals Corporation, Dean and Vice President for Academic Affairs of the Morehouse School of Medicine, and as Deputy Dean of the Dartmouth Medical School.

NO. 5. FIORELLO H. LAGUARDIA COMMUNITY COLLEGE – DESIGNATION OF INTERIM PRESIDENT

RESOLVED, That Dr. Roberta S. Matthews be appointed Interim President of LaGuardia Community College, effective November 1, 1999, with an annual salary at the applicable presidential level, subject to financial ability, and that she be reinstated as a Professor with tenure in the Department of English.

EXPLANATION: Dr. Matthews has been Acting Provost, Vice President for Academic Affairs and Dean of Faculty at Marymount College in Tarrytown, New York since 1996. Prior to that date Dr. Matthews had been an administrator and faculty member at LaGuardia Community College since 1973, including appointments as Associate Dean for Academic Affairs (1989-1996), Associate Dean of Faculty (1980-1986), and Acting Dean of Faculty (1979-1980).

Chairman Badillo pointed out that we are going to have a new search for the presidency of Baruch College and Kay Pesile, as before, will be the chairwoman of that search committee. With respect to The City College, the plan will be explained by Chancellor-Designate, Matthew Goldstein.

Chancellor-Designate Goldstein stated that we are going to use this year as a study year at The City College, bringing together the best thinking in this building and across the University, consultants, and certainly members of the faculty and administration of The City College of New York to best discern what are the possibilities and capabilities for rethinking some of what we do there. We expect that the process will take probably the better part of this academic year, at the end of which we will initiate a national search with the intention of getting a very distinguished president at that very important institution.

Chairman Badillo also announced that Trustee Babbar is the chairman of the presidential search committee for LaGuardia Community College and that the search will be beginning very shortly. We will then have the following
four on-going presidential searches underway: Trustee Ruiz is the chairwoman of the search for Queensborough Community College, Trustee Alfred Curtis is the chairman of the search for Kingsborough Community College, Trustee Kay Pesile is the chairwoman of the search committee for Baruch College. As soon as we get the plan approved for The City College, we will be having that search.

NO. 6. BROOKLYN COLLEGE – RESIGNATION OF PRESIDENT:

RESOLVED. That the Board of Trustees accepts the resignation of President Vernon E. Lattin, effective January 31, 2000.

NO. 7. BROOKLYN COLLEGE – DESIGNATION OF PRESIDENT:

Trustee Wiesenfeld stated that in the short time that he has been on the Board he has had an opportunity to visit a few community groups to discuss The City University. On two occasions what I found is that I was confronted with people engaging in the democratic process, but in a peculiar fashion. They attacked the Board on the selection process of our new Chancellor, Matthew Goldstein, saying that the process wasn't followed – no search and so on. And when you explain that these are extraordinary circumstances where the Board endeavors to move The City University forward, get it back on track and try to eliminate distraction where possible, they have this rigorous adherence to process. Process is very important, but the world is not always black and white, sometimes it is grey, sometimes there are nuances when there are extraordinary situations and I have no doubt that the question of process will be raised tomorrow regarding the section of Dr. Kimmich.

Now if you will forgive me, I am not trying to digress, but there is an old Yiddish saying, and what it means literally is that saying nice things about a person doesn't cost you anything. If we really mean the resolutions of appreciation that we put forth for people who have provided exemplary service to The City University, such as the resolution which we approved last month regarding Chancellor Kimmich, we have here a person who can immediately fill a position in a college from which he has come to the Chancellery, and that he is willing to take it on, is really a gift to The City University. Process is important, but in this respect the waiver of this search and the process is working quite well.

Trustee Cook stated that he would like to congratulate President Kimmich and say it has been a delightful year working with him. I know he may not have appreciated it as much as I did because I was on the better side, but I do look forward to seeing him at Brooklyn College and hope that his stay there will be very, very happy.

Vice Chairman Schmidt stated that he would like to second the comments of Trustee Wiesenfeld. I think that Interim Chancellor Kimmich's credentials and qualifications for the presidency of Brooklyn College are, in fact, unique. The degree to which we know him and his ability and can have confidence in him based on the closest working association is also unique.

The point of the processes is to come to good and sound conclusions and there is no question in my mind that the result in this case could not be a more promising one for The City University. Ever since I began to work and to try to understand this institution, I very quickly developed a view that one of the goals that the institution ought to try to achieve was to maintain Dr. Kimmich in a crucial position of leadership.

Speaking for myself, I believe increasingly as we search for, evaluate, and appoint the presidents of the various campuses that we ought to be asking ourselves, "Will this person provide leadership for the University as a whole?" There is nothing more important, I think for the future promise of The City University, than that the various campuses and programs start working well together.

So, I think it is extraordinary good fortune for the University that the presidency of one of its most important campuses will be in the hands of someone who has such knowledge and commitment to the University as a whole. Those are some of the reasons that I vote for this motion, Mr. Chairman, with a great deal of enthusiasm and I am just delighted that we have been fortunate enough to secure the continued leadership of Chancellor Kimmich.
Chairman Badillo stated that he would certainly agree that the qualifications of Chancellor Kimmich for the presidency of Brooklyn College are incomparable. But I also want to say that we are all, and especially me, grateful for the service you have given us in the past twenty-one months. I don’t think we would have been able, Benno, to prepare the kind of report we did without the cooperation of Chancellor Kimmich, because for one year we were after him to get data and to give us information. But beyond that, nobody knows better than I do the difficulties we had in the past twenty-one months to get this organization to keep moving and to make sure that it maintains as steady a flow as possible. So, you certainly have demonstrated enormous leadership here and we are delighted, as Benno said, that you will be with us in Brooklyn College.

Trustee Ruiz stated that at the July meeting she had the pleasure of reading the resolution thanking Dr. Kimmich, and I second everyone’s sentiments. But I think more importantly in the appointment of our new Chancellor, and in the appointment of the President of Brooklyn College, we are also recognizing that we have a great deal of talent at CUNY. As we go forward with our searches everyone is welcome, the people who are present and outside talent as well, so I think that we are establishing a very sound precedent as to how we want to function as a Board and I thank you for the leadership in that.

Trustee Rios stated that he is reminded in part about two lessons he has learned in life. At The Equitable I was once privy, without denigrating what was going on, when I was sitting at a meeting where they said we will hire this consultant and do an 11 city review, and we will find the poverty area in America where the most attention is deserved, etc. I sat at the meeting and I said, well, that is the South Bronx, why are you going to go through a whole year? And they went through the whole year and they came back with the same conclusion anyway. But as to the process and my colleagues who have mentioned it, we are sort of in the same situation. Let us not pretend, let us be candid, this is well deserved.

The second point I would like to make based on my experience, is that no matter how eloquent we are, or think we are, there are limitations of words. We string them along and we try to convey a feeling and that’s when we find the shortcomings of any language we use. The feeling that most of us have for you, Doctor Kimmich, in bringing you into this presidency, is one that cannot be conveyed merely in words. So, as the years go by, we will do it through embraces, hugs, squeezes, and attendance at your College functions.

Chancellor-Designate Goldstein stated that he is delighted that we have been able to maintain the talent and enthusiasm for this great University in Christoph Kimmich coming and staying at Brooklyn College. We have some formidable work ahead of us and as your new Chancellor nobody could be happier than I to have a man of his experience, his depth of intellect, his commitment to this institution, at one of our leading four-year colleges. Christoph has been a wonderful counsel to me over the past several weeks. We have spent hours together and I thank you, Christoph, and I certainly look forward to many years of working collaboratively with you, and congratulations.

Trustee Biswas stated that he knows that students at Brooklyn College will be very happy. Especially, I am speechless and I think this is one of the best things that we have done. I would like to take this opportunity to thank Chairman Badillo. Many of you know, as a student I may have a lot of conflict of interest with him. But I have been experiencing working with him and I think we should be helpful in the coming years with his leadership. I would like to thank you, Chairman Badillo, and I would also like to thank President now Kimmich. Hopefully there will be a big party at Brooklyn.

RESOLVED, That Dr. Christoph M. Kimmich be appointed President of Brooklyn College, effective February 1, 2000, with an annual salary at the applicable college presidential level, subject to financial ability, with a waiver of search.

EXPLANATION: Dr. Christoph M. Kimmich has been serving as Interim Chancellor since December 1, 1997. He previously served as Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs at Brooklyn College since 1988. An internationally prominent scholar of 20th century German diplomatic history, Dr. Kimmich is a Professor with tenure in the Department of History at Brooklyn College, where he has been a member of the faculty since 1973. Based upon the presence of a candidate of such proven distinction, and his exemplary service as the chief educational and administrative officer of The City University during the past 21 months, the Board has determined to forgo its search.
process for a new college president, in order to provide Brooklyn College with the benefit of his leadership at a time when Dr. Kimmich is available and willing to accept the college presidency.

Interim Chancellor Kimmich stated that it has really been a privilege and an honor to serve this University for the last twenty-one months. No man is an island and I have drawn on the talents, the support, and the commitment of my colleagues in the colleges, of my colleagues in the Central Office, and not least on the Board of Trustees, and that's been enormously satisfying.

In conferring upon me the honor of the Presidency of Brooklyn College, and with all your kind words in the process, I am confident that we can move forward in where we want, not only these colleges, and this particular College, but also the University, to be. And I am confident also that we will be satisfied in the college work that lies ahead.

As a final statement I would say that as you are conferring this honor upon me, I conclude that the work that we have done together over the twenty-one months that I have been here has been satisfactory and productive, and has led this University in the ways we want to lead it, and that we are agreed on all of that. So, thank you, very much.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the Public meeting was adjourned at 5:51 P.M.

SECRETARY GENEVIEVE MULLIN

(This is a detailed summary of the Board of Trustee's meeting. The tapes of the meeting are available in the Office of the Secretary of the Board for a period of three years.)
MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING OF THE BOARD OF
TRUSTEES OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK
HELD
AUGUST 26, 1999
AT THE BOARD HEADQUARTERS BUILDING
535 EAST 80TH STREET - BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

The Chairperson called the meeting to order at 5:02 P.M.

There were present:

Herman Badillo, Chairman
Benno C. Schmidt, Jr., Vice Chairman

Satish K. Babbar
John J. Calandra
Kenneth E. Cook
John Morning

George J. Rios
Nilda Soto Ruiz
Jeffrey S. Wiesenfeld

Md. Mizanor R. Biswas, ex officio

Secretary Genevieve Mullin
Roy P. Moskowitz, Acting General Counsel and Acting Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs
Hourig Messerlian, Executive Assistant

Chancellor-Designate Matthew Goldstein
Interim Chancellor Christoph M. Kimmich
Interim Deputy Chancellor Patricia Hassett
President Raymond C. Bowen
President David A. Caputo
President Dolores Fernandez
President Ricardo R. Fernandez
President Frances Degen Horowitz
President Edison O. Jackson
President Charles C. Kidd

President Antonio Perez
President Allen Lee Sessoms
President Marlene Springer
President Carolyn G. Williams
Dean Kristin Booth Glen
Dean Stanford R. Roman, Jr.
Interim Vice Chancellor Sherry Brabham
Vice Chancellor Jay Hershenson
Vice Chancellor Louise Mirr

The absence of Trustees Michael C. Crimmins, Alfred B. Curtis, Jr., Ronald J. Marino, Randy M. Mastro, Kathleen M. Pesile, and Bernard Sohmer was excused.
Upon motion duly made, seconded and carried, the following resolution was unanimously adopted:

Chairman Badillo stated that as you know, Jim Murphy is no longer a member of this Board. He served on the Board for over twenty years and has been my friend for many years before that. We go back to the State Constitutional Convention in the late 1960’s. I have talked with Jim and I expect to be working with him on some of the programs that we will be developing. I would like now to read the following:

NO. 1. RESOLUTION OF APPRECIATION – JAMES P. MURPHY:

WHEREAS, The Honorable James P. Murphy has served with exemplary distinction as a member of the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York from June, 1980 to August, 1999 and in an earlier term from 1974 to 1976, and as Chairman of the Board from September, 1980 to February, 1997; and

WHEREAS, As Chairman of the Board of Trustees, he has brought to the Board’s work a perception of the role of public higher education for the cultural, social, and economic enhancement of individuals and citizens of New York as a whole; and

WHEREAS, He fostered the establishment of the Kennedy Fellows Program for the advancement of individuals who work with the developmentally disabled; and

WHEREAS, James P. Murphy won the admiration of his colleagues in the University community through his unflagging dedication to, and vigorous defense of, the educational mission of The City University of New York; and

WHEREAS, The Board, the Administration, the faculty, staff, and students have benefited from his leadership, concern, and commitment throughout his many years of outstanding service; now therefore be it

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees extends its most sincere thanks and expresses its deepest appreciation and gratitude to the Honorable James P. Murphy for the creativity, intelligence, and the constancy with which he has carried out his duties as a member and Chairman of the Board; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees and the entire University community wishes him continued success in his public and private endeavors.

A. INTRODUCTION OF NEW TRUSTEE: Chairman Badillo announced that on behalf of the Board and the Administration it is his pleasure to introduce and welcome Benno C. Schmidt, Jr., who has been appointed by Governor Pataki to serve as Vice Chairman of the Board, and has been confirmed by the State Senate. Welcome Benno, and congratulations.

B. CONDOLENCES: Chairman Badillo offered condolences on behalf of the Board and the Administration to Benno Schmidt on the loss of his stepmother, Nancy Montgomery Schmidt, who passed away on August 10, 1999.

C. INTRODUCTION OF CHANCELLOR-DESIGNATE MATTHEW GOLDSMITH: Chairman Badillo stated that it is his pleasure to introduce and welcome Chancellor-Designate Matthew Goldstein. Although he does not officially begin until September 1, you can be sure I’ve had him working from the very day that we talked about his becoming Chancellor. Matthew has been going through the transition process with Christoph Kimmich. Welcome, Matt, and congratulations.
D. APPRECIATION OF SERVICE – LOIS CRONHOLM: Chairman Badillo called on Trustee Nilda Soto Ruiz to present the following:

On behalf of the Board of Trustees, I wish to extend sincere thanks and appreciation to Lois Cronholm for her dedicated service to Baruch College. She has served as Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs of the college from 1992 to 1998 and from June, 1998 as Interim President. The constituents of both The City University and Baruch College have greatly benefited from Dr. Cronholm’s energetic and visionary leadership. We wish her success in all her future endeavors.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the Public meeting was adjourned at 5:07 P.M. to go into Executive Session.

SECRETARY GENEVIEVE MULLIN
MINUTES OF THE EXECUTIVE SESSION OF THE BOARD OF
TRUSTEES OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK
HELD
AUGUST 26, 1999
AT THE BOARD HEADQUARTERS BUILDING
535 EAST 80TH STREET - BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

The Executive Session was called to order at 5:10 P.M.

There were present:

Herman Badillo, Chairman
Benno C. Schmidt, Jr., Vice Chairman
Satish K. Babbar
John J. Calandra
Kenneth E. Cook
John Morning

Kathleen M. Pesile
George J. Rios
Nilda Soto Ruiz
Jeffrey S. Wiesenfeld

Md. Mizanoor R. Biswas, ex officio

Secretary Genevieve Mullin
Roy P. Moskowitz, Acting General Counsel and Acting Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs
Hourig Messerlian, Executive Assistant

Chancellor-Designate Matthew Goldstein
Interim Chancellor Christoph M. Kimmich
Interim Deputy Chancellor Patricia Hassett
Vice Chancellor Jay Hershenson

The absence of Trustees Michael C. Crimmins, Alfred B. Curtis, Jr., Ronald J. Marino, Randy M. Mastro, and
Bernard Sohmer was excused.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the following resolution was adopted:

The Board went into Executive Session to discuss personnel matters.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the Executive Session was adjourned at 5:29 P.M.
to go into Public Session.
MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING OF THE BOARD OF
TRUSTEES OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

HELD

AUGUST 26, 1999

AT THE BOARD HEADQUARTERS BUILDING
535 EAST 80TH STREET - BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

The Public session reconvened at 5:30 P.M.

There were present:

Herman Badillo, Chairman
Benno C. Schmidt, Jr., Vice Chairman
Satish K. Babbar
John J. Calandra
Kenneth E. Cook
John Morning
Kathleen M. Pesile
George J. Rios
Niida Soto Ruiz
Jeffrey S. Wiesenfeld
Md. Mizanoor R. Biswas, ex officio

Secretary Genevieve Mullin
Roy P. Moskowitz, Acting General Counsel and Acting Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs
Hourig Messerlian, Executive Assistant

Chancellor-Designate Matthew Goldstein
Interim Chancellor Christoph M. Kimmich
Interim Deputy Chancellor Patricia Hassett

President Ricardo R. Fernandez
Vice Chancellor Jay Hershenson

The absence of Trustees Michael C. Crimeans, Alfred B. Curtis, Jr., Ronald J. Marino, Randy M. Mastro, and Bernard Sohmer was excused.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the following resolutions were unanimously adopted:

NO. 2. THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK – CENTRAL OFFICE, DESIGNATION OF CHANCELLOR (REVISED):

RESOLVED, That the effective date of the designation of Dr. Matthew Goldstein as Chancellor of The City University of New York be changed to September 1, 1999; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the effective date of the salary plan amendment increasing the salary of the Chancellor from $178,523 to $250,000 be changed to September 1, 1999; and that it be noted that the housing allowance provided to the Chancellor in lieu of University residence be set at $7,500 per month.
EXPLANATION: The Board of Trustees, at its special meeting of July 22, 1999 set September 6, 1999 as the effective date of the designation of Dr. Matthew Goldstein as Chancellor and as the effective date upon which the salary of the Chancellor would be increased to $250,000. The change to September 1, 1999 reflects the actual date Dr. Goldstein will assume office as Chancellor at the indicated salary level and notes the amount of the housing allowance approved by the Board of Trustees.

NO. 3. BARUCH COLLEGE – DESIGNATION OF INTERIM PRESIDENT:

RESOLVED, That Dr. Sidney I. Lirzman be appointed Interim President of Baruch College, effective September 1, 1999, with an annual salary at the applicable presidential level, subject to financial ability, and that during the period of his service as Interim President, Dr. Lirzman be granted a leave from his position as Dean of the Zicklin School of Business at Baruch College.

EXPLANATION: Dr. Lirzman has been Dean of the Zicklin School of Business at Baruch College since 1995. Dr. Lirzman has been an administrator and faculty member at Baruch College since 1967, including previous appointments as Associate Dean of Graduate Studies in the School of Business and Public Administration (1973-1988), Acting Vice President for Academic Affairs/Provost (1976-1978), and Executive Officer of the Ph.D. Program in Business (1973-1988).

NO. 4. THE CITY COLLEGE – DESIGNATION OF INTERIM PRESIDENT:

RESOLVED, That Dr. Stanford A. Roman, Jr. be appointed Interim President of The City College, effective September 1, 1999.

EXPLANATION: Dr. Roman will continue to serve as Dean of the Sophie Davis School of Biomedical Education/The City University of New York Medical School, which position he has held since 1990. Dr. Roman had previously served as Senior Vice President for Medical and Professional Affairs of the New York City Health and Hospitals Corporation, Dean and Vice President for Academic Affairs of the Morehouse School of Medicine, and as Deputy Dean of the Dartmouth Medical School.

NO. 5. FIORELLO H. LAGUARDIA COMMUNITY COLLEGE – DESIGNATION OF INTERIM PRESIDENT

RESOLVED, That Dr. Roberta S. Matthews be appointed Interim President of LaGuardia Community College, effective November 1, 1999, with an annual salary at the applicable presidential level, subject to financial ability, and that she be reinstated as a Professor with tenure in the Department of English.

EXPLANATION: Dr. Matthews has been Acting Provost, Vice President for Academic Affairs and Dean of Faculty at Marymount College in Tarrytown, New York since 1996. Prior to that date Dr. Matthews had been an administrator and faculty member at LaGuardia Community College since 1973, including appointments as Associate Dean for Academic Affairs (1989-1996), Associate Dean of Faculty (1980-1986), and Acting Dean of Faculty (1979-1980).

Chairman Badillo pointed out that we are going to have a new search for the presidency of Baruch College and Kay Pesile, as before, will be the chairwoman of that search committee. With respect to The City College, the plan will be explained by Chancellor-Designate, Matthew Goldstein.

Chancellor-Designate Goldstein stated that we are going to use this year as a study year at The City College, bringing together the best thinking in this building and across the University, consultants, and certainly members of the faculty and administration of The City College of New York to best discern what are the possibilities and capabilities for rethinking some of what we do there. We expect that the process will take probably the better part of this academic year, at the end of which we will initiate a national search with the intention of getting a very distinguished president at that very important institution.

Chairman Badillo also announced that Trustee Babbar is the chairman of the presidential search committee for LaGuardia Community College and that the search will be beginning very shortly. We will then have the following
four on-going presidential searches underway: Trustee Ruiz is the chairwoman of the search for Queensborough Community College, Trustee Alfred Curtis is the chairman of the search for Kingsborough Community College, Trustee Kay Pesile is the chairwoman of the search committee for Baruch College. As soon as we get the plan approved for The City College, we will be having that search.

NO. 6. BROOKLYN COLLEGE – RESIGNATION OF PRESIDENT:

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees accepts the resignation of President Vernon E. Lattin, effective January 31, 2000.

NO. 7. BROOKLYN COLLEGE – DESIGNATION OF PRESIDENT:

Trustee Wiesefeld stated that in the short time that he has been on the Board he has had an opportunity to visit a few community groups to discuss The City University. On two occasions what I found is that I was confronted with people engaging in the democratic process, but in a peculiar fashion. They attacked the Board on the selection process of our new Chancellor, Matthew Goldstein, saying that the process wasn’t followed – no search and so on. And when you explain that these are extraordinary circumstances where the Board endeavors to move The City University forward, get it back on track and try to eliminate distraction where possible, they have this rigorous adherence to process. Process is very important, but the world is not always black and white, sometimes it is grey, sometimes there are nuances when there are extraordinary situations and I have no doubt that the question of process will be raised tomorrow regarding the section of Dr. Kimmich.

Now if you will forgive me, I am not trying to digress, but there is an old Yiddish saying, and what it means literally is that saying nice things about a person doesn’t cost you anything. If we really mean the resolutions of appreciation that we put forth for people who have provided exemplary service to The City University, such as the resolution which we approved last month regarding Chancellor Kimmich, we have here a person who can immediately fill a position in a college from which he has come to the Chancellery, and that he is willing to take it on, is really a gift to The City University. Process is important, but in this respect the waiver of this search and the process is working quite well.

Trustee Cook stated that he would like to congratulate President Kimmich and say it has been a delightful year working with him. I know he may not have appreciated it as much as I did because I was on the better side, but I do look forward to seeing him at Brooklyn College and hope that his stay there will be very, very happy.

Vice Chairman Schmidt stated that he would like to second the comments of Trustee Wiesenfeld. I think that Interim Chancellor Kimmich’s credentials and qualifications for the presidency of Brooklyn College are, in fact, unique. The degree to which we know him and his ability and can have confidence in him based on the closest working association is also unique.

The point of the processes is to come to good and sound conclusions and there is no question in my mind that the result in this case could not be a more promising one for The City University. Ever since I began to work and to try to understand this institution, I very quickly developed a view that one of the goals that the institution ought to try to achieve was to maintain Dr. Kimmich in a crucial position of leadership.

Speaking for myself, I believe increasingly as we search for, evaluate, and appoint the presidents of the various campuses that we ought to be asking ourselves, “Will this person provide leadership for the University as a whole?” There is nothing more important, I think for the future promise of The City University, than that the various campuses and programs start working well together.

So, I think it is extraordinary good fortune for the University that the presidency of one of its most important campuses will be in the hands of someone who has such knowledge and commitment to the University as a whole. Those are some of the reasons that I vote for this motion, Mr. Chairman, with a great deal of enthusiasm and I am just delighted that we have been fortunate enough to secure the continued leadership of Chancellor Kimmich.
Chairman Badillo stated that he would certainly agree that the qualifications of Chancellor Kimmich for the presidency of Brooklyn College are incomparable. But I also want to say that we are all, and especially me, grateful for the service you have given us in the past twenty-one months. I don't think we would have been able, Benno, to prepare the kind of report we did without the cooperation of Chancellor Kimmich, because for one year we were after him to get data and to give us information. But beyond that, nobody knows better than I do the difficulties we had in the past twenty-one months to get this organization to keep moving and to make sure that it maintains as steady a flow as possible. So, you certainly have demonstrated enormous leadership here and we are delighted, as Benno said, that you will be with us in Brooklyn College.

Trustee Ruiz stated that at the July meeting she had the pleasure of reading the resolution thanking Dr. Kimmich, and I second everyone's sentiments. But I think more importantly in the appointment of our new Chancellor, and in the appointment of the President of Brooklyn College, we are also recognizing that we have a great deal of talent at CUNY. As we go forward with our searches everyone is welcome, the people who are present and outside talent as well, so I think that we are establishing a very sound precedent as to how we want to function as a Board and I thank you for the leadership in that.

Trustee Rios stated that he is reminded in part about two lessons he has learned in life. At The Equitable I was once privy, without denigrating what was going on, when I was sitting at a meeting where they said we will hire this consultant and do an 11 city review, and we will find the poverty area in America where the most attention is deserved, etc. I sat at the meeting and I said, well, that is the South Bronx, why are you going to go through a whole year? And they went through the whole year and they came back with the same conclusion anyway. But as to the process and my colleagues who have mentioned it, we are sort of in the same situation. Let us not pretend, let us be candid, this is well deserved.

The second point I would like to make based on my experience, is that no matter how eloquent we are, or think we are, there are limitations of words. We string them along and we try to convey a feeling and that's when we find the shortcomings of any language we use. The feeling that most of us have for you, Doctor Kimmich, in bringing you into this presidency, is one that cannot be conveyed merely in words. So, as the years go by, we will do it through embraces, hugs, squeezes, and attendance at your College functions.

Chancellor-Designate Goldstein stated that he is delighted that we have been able to maintain the talent and enthusiasm for this great University in Christoph Kimmich coming and staying at Brooklyn College. We have some formidable work ahead of us and as your new Chancellor nobody could be happier than I to have a man of his experience, his depth of intellect, his commitment to this institution, at one of our leading four-year colleges. Christoph has been a wonderful counsel to me over the past several weeks. We have spent hours together and I thank you, Christoph, and I certainly look forward to many years of working collaboratively with you, and congratulations.

Trustee Biswas stated that he knows that students at Brooklyn College will be very happy. Especially, I am speechless and I think this is one of the best things that we have done. I would like to take this opportunity to thank Chairman Badillo. Many of you know, as a student I may have a lot of conflict of interest with him. But I have been experiencing working with him and I think we should be helpful in the coming years with his leadership. I would like to thank you, Chairman Badillo, and I would also like to thank President now Kimmich. Hopefully there will be a big party at Brooklyn.

RESOLVED, That Dr. Christoph M. Kimmich be appointed President of Brooklyn College, effective February 1, 2000, with an annual salary at the applicable college presidential level, subject to financial ability, with a waiver of search.

EXPLANATION: Dr. Christoph M. Kimmich has been serving as Interim Chancellor since December 1, 1997. He previously served as Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs at Brooklyn College since 1988. An internationally prominent scholar of 20th century German diplomatic history, Dr. Kimmich is a Professor with tenure in the Department of History at Brooklyn College, where he has been a member of the faculty since 1973. Based upon the presence of a candidate of such proven distinction, and his exemplary service as the chief educational and administrative officer of The City University during the past 21 months, the Board has determined to forgo its search
process for a new college president, in order to provide Brooklyn College with the benefit of his leadership at a time when Dr. Kimmich is available and willing to accept the college presidency.

**Interim Chancellor Kimmich** stated that it has really been a privilege and an honor to serve this University for the last twenty-one months. No man is an island and I have drawn on the talents, the support, and the commitment of my colleagues in the colleges, of my colleagues in the Central Office, and not least on the Board of Trustees, and that’s been enormously satisfying.

In conferring upon me the honor of the Presidency of Brooklyn College, and with all your kind words in the process, I am confident that we can move forward in where we want, not only these colleges, and this particular College, but also the University, to be. And I am confident also that we will be satisfied in the college work that lies ahead.

As a final statement I would say that as you are conferring this honor upon me, I conclude that the work that we have done together over the twenty-one months that I have been here has been satisfactory and productive, and has led this University in the ways we want to lead it, and that we are agreed on all of that. So, thank you, very much.

**Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the Public meeting was adjourned at 5:51 P.M.**

**SECRETARY GENEVIEVE MULLIN**

(This is a detailed summary of the Board of Trustee's meeting. The tapes of the meeting are available in the Office of the Secretary of the Board for a period of three years.)