The meeting was called to order at 4:05 p.m.

There were present:

**Committee Members:**
- Hon. Wellington Z. Chen, Chair
- Jill O’Donnell-Tormey, Vice Chair
- Hon. Charles A. Shorter
- Prof. Karen Kaplowitz, faculty member
- Ms. Chika Onyejiukwa, student alternate

**University Staff:**
- Chancellor James B. Milliken
- Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost
- Vita Rabinowitz
- Senior University Dean Robert Ptachik
- University Dean David Crook

President Russell K. Hotzler, COP liaison

**Trustee Staff:**
- Deputy to the Secretary Hourig Messerlian
- Ms. Doris Wang

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cal. No.</th>
<th>DISPOSITION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

The agenda items were considered and acted upon in the following order:

**I. ACTION ITEMS:**

A. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JUNE 6, 2016.** The minutes were approved as submitted.

B. **POLICY CALENDAR**

1. **Borough of Manhattan Community College – AA in Economics.** Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost (EVC&UP) called on Borough of Manhattan Community College (BMCC) Provost and Senior Vice President Karrin Wilks who stated that she was very pleased to present and propose BMCC’s new associate degree in economics, which is part of the college’s strategic plan to create degree programs within the liberal arts. Liberal arts is the largest major at BMCC, with over 7,000 students. She added that it is known from the literature that if the college can give students guided pathways and a direction toward their career choices and toward their transfer choices, than it has a better chance at student success in improving retention and graduation rates. This is also seen as a way to spotlight faculty expertise and give students opportunities to work with faculty in ways that they would not be able to without a major.

Provost Wilks called on Prof. Aldo F. Balardini of the Department of Social Sciences, Human Services and Criminal Justice who stated that the students will have the opportunity to be prepared to go on to a four-year degree and finish their economics degree. BMCC surveyed approximately four hundred and sixty students, of whom about 30 percent showed interest in a major in economics. He added that the idea is to basically provide these students with a first experience of what it is to study economics, and what it is to conduct research in economics. This would create the incentive to move on to the four-year degree. He noted that BMCC has an articulation agreement with Brooklyn College, and they are working with at least another three colleges in the system.
2. Queensborough Community College/John Jay College – AS/BS in Computer Science and Information Security. Dr. Vita Rabinowitz called on John Jay College Provost and Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs Jane Bowers who stated that this is the College’s first joint degree, dual admissions program in the CUNY Justice Academy in Computer Science and Information Security. John Jay College has four degree programs jointly, with its community college partners, including an AS/BS in criminal justice, and an AS/BS in forensic financial analysis. This will be a new set of degrees. There are six community college partners with John Jay in the CUNY Justice Academy who have expressed great interest in together developing dual admission joint degree programs in computer science and information security, which at John Jay has a cyber security focus.

Provost Bowers called on Prof. Douglas Salane of the Department of Mathematics and Computer Science who thanked his colleagues at Queensborough Community College (QCC) for their very hard work on developing a couple of extra courses and helping John Jay College to mesh this all together and make it a reality. It will be a great smooth transition for the students, as it gives them a path from an AS degree to a BS degree and possibly beyond to a Master's degree.

Chairperson of the Department of Engineering Technology at QCC, Prof. Stuart Asser added that cyber security is a very important field today. The John Jay program is an excellent bachelor’s degree program, and it really gives QCC students an excellent career choice to move to.

Committee Chair Wellington Chen stated that this is very important for national and global security. He commended John Jay College and QCC for doing phenomenal work on those fronts.

Following discussion, Items I.A. (The Minutes), and Item I.B.2 were approved for submission to the Board.


Dr. Rabinowitz called on Vice Chancellor Judy Bergtraum for a presentation on Start-Up New York.

***PRESENTATION BY VICE CHANCELLOR JUDITH BERGTRAUM***

In response to a question from Committee Chair Wellington Chen on projected spatial needs, VC Bergtraum stated that there are two types of businesses in this program. We have an example today of both a small business, and an example of a business that basically wants to move from another state. I think the one we are going to see today is an $8 million or $9 million business. It depends on the nonprofit. In order to get into this program, you have to have a relationship with our schools. It takes three to five months for the schools to go back and forth. And, we have had businesses that have been rejected. So I think at the beginning, it's going to be very slow. The other piece that we added that SUNY did not have is an integrity piece. Because I do capital construction, I am really concerned about who we do business with. We have basically put in a check on businesses that I use when I do capital construction. Now, for a small business, there is not too much to check except who is basically giving them money. But for the larger
companies, we made it more bureaucratic. One of the questions when this came up a year and a half ago is CUNY's liability. This is what the program looks like and the qualifications for the businesses. It is not so easy to get into this program.

In response to a comment from Dr. Rabinowitz, VC Bergtraum noted that the thing she has learned from this program is that it would best come from the academic side of CUNY and from the campuses. They can give you the best picture. This is the possible academic affiliation: full-time jobs. You have to give internships. That is part of the program. A school can ask for other things, such as for a donation. It is really up to the school. Businesses want to be in this program. If the schools push back and forth, they are going to get a lot more.

VC Bergtraum called on City College Associate Provost for Research Ashiwel Undieh, who stated that he has been associated with the program right from the beginning. He is very much aware of the ups and downs and the mirages they have encountered, particularly with regard to space, and he thanked VC Bergtraum and her staff for their leadership and support in driving this program forward. City College's Start-Up campus plan emphasizes the creative strengths of the college in science and engineering, as well as in technology and biomedicine. So in our plan, we expected to sponsor companies that would take advantage of the resources, intellectual as well physical, that we have to advance their technologies. In so doing, we find ways in which we can interact in a mutually beneficial way. Chexology is the startup company that is focused on innovative technologies for transactions. Their starting area was in coat check, essentially going to places where people have to hang up their coats. By having a system that identifies the owner and identifies the property, automatically they increase efficiency and security in that transaction. When you come back, you do not have to wait in long lines. As you are approaching your item, it is identified and brought back to you. It also increases security because you do not have situations of misplaced tags and where perhaps something that was clipped on the coat comes off because this would be much more secure. The coat technologies and the computer software that this business uses and expects to develop and use are squarely within the expertise and resources of City College. The academic affiliation agreement that we have negotiated and agreed to, with Chexology provides for multiple benefits.

Associate Provost Undieh added that while our initial expectation had been that we would have space on campus to house these companies, as it turned out, we do not have the space on campus available and ready for this purpose. We went through a three-way arrangement, involving the New Baptist Church, as they had space that they were not using. This company found the space suitable, and we entered into an arrangement that now makes that space available to the company. This space is located off-campus, which means there is less of our involvement related to a situation where the space would have been part of the campus space. The benefits that we have identified include a minimum of three paid internships per semester from among our students with opportunities for full-time positions as well. They will advertise available positions on our campus, student service job placement sites. And, they will interview our students for those positions as well. Chexology will donate $6,000 to the college each year. We found that it would be really beneficial if the company sponsored seminars and workshops related to their technologies and similar technologies, as well as entrepreneurship and other student initiatives. Rather than have the company come in to organize these activities, they would make a donation of $6,000, and then we will internally use that to support these programs. Thirdly, Chexology will collaborate with the Zahn Innovation Center to judge our annual entrepreneurship competitions. They will also select from among the winners a company that they will mentor in the process of that company developing their technology from conception towards the proof of concept.
stage. This is perhaps one of the two top benefits to the college because finding mentorship to support the development of these ideas by the students is usually one of the limiting factors to the progress of their technologies. They will be there, they have the experience, and they will provide hands-on mentoring to our students.

Associate Provost Undieh stated that the other very important benefit is that the company will host one annual event with students and faculty from the School of Engineering. This will be an opportunity to lay out what problems and challenges they are encountering, receive ideas from our students and faculty in terms of solutions to those problems. There will be a partnership with the company where the intellectual property coming out of that will be owned by the students or faculty who are developing them, and they are licensed out to the company. This is a potential avenue for generating additional challenges and opportunities for our students. Lastly, Chexology will assist the branding and integrated communications program of City College in developing a curriculum area regarding sales and marketing of new technologies. Chexology will do that also by delivering two lectures within that course, essentially sharing from their experience and answering questions with the students. Chexology's business model fits well with the strengths and mission of City College, and the campus is pleased to strongly recommend the board's approval of the proposed sponsorship of Chexology for the Start-Up New York program.

In response to several questions, Associate Provost Undieh noted that the space is located on 145th Street. The school of engineering is on 141 Street. And 145th Street is one block also from where the campus shuttle stops, so we think it is very convenient indeed. For the internships, the company will send out job descriptions to our coordinator of student job internship office, and they will publicize it. Students who show interest will be forwarded to the company for interviews. The company will make the selection process. But we set the minimum criteria that the company will use. So that will ensure that we have a wide net to cast to get the right students. He added that in terms of the lease, it is strictly between the company and the church. But we expect that with the company putting in a lot of investment to renovate the space, they are looking at a 20-year lease term. Chexology's business plan shows five-year job projections of four jobs per year. The company will be held to what they projected that they would be able to generate, even if the business does not grow beyond its current level. They also use a lot of part-time job situations. For example, they were at U.S. open last year. During such occasions, they can hire up to 200 students for the event.

VC Bergtraum called on York College Professor and Dean of Arts and Sciences Donna Chirico, who stated that her team has approached Start-Up New York basically as kids in a candy store. With York Analytic Laboratories, we have an opportunity here to get a great number of benefits for our students, faculty, and programs, and we have not hesitated in asking for those pieces for those three things. We want internships and scholarships. We want to be able to have faculty research and work in our labs. We want to be able to build our academic programs, not at the undergraduate level, but at the Master's level, because that's where we believe we can attract more students to CUNY, not simply at the undergraduate level. We already have an environmental health science program. We already have faculty testing air, water, and the other things that York Analytic Laboratories does. So we are prepared to take advantage of these companies, let them bring what they're not paying in taxes to us to benefit our faculty, students, and programs.

In response to a question on monitoring each of these benefits, Dr. Chirico noted that they will be monitoring all aspects, for a variety of reasons. One has to do with the
integrity that was mentioned earlier. We want to make sure these companies are living up to what they claim they're going to do and what they are going to bring. We also want to work with internships. We have had these conversations already with the folks at York Analytic Laboratories, saying we want to work mutually with you. We know where our students are, and we know where they should be. We have students who may have special interests that we want to target. We feel it should be a mutual decision, not just a company making certain kinds of decisions. We anticipate that the key word here is going to be collaboration between the staff at York that is going to monitor the different pieces of this project. Facilities will monitor the facility side, and the academic folks will monitor the academic side, working with York Analytic Laboratories. The space is off-campus. We have a marvelous facility literally within a half a mile of the campus that was once housed Long Island Railroad warehouses. A very clever entrepreneur took this warehouse and is subdividing it into spaces for companies. So this is where York Analytics has now taken a space in this warehouse.

In response to a question from Dr. Karen Kaplowitz on faculty involvement, Dr. Chirico stated that at York, we have really tried to look at who are the faculty who would be the most interested or have the expertise connected to these businesses. Then we worked with department chairs and the provost, getting the biographies of those individuals, and looking at what their research projects were. At one point we had 20 different faculty, and then we honed that down to the folks who seem to have the closest interest to this. So it was really faculty volunteering because they are eager to take advantage of the facilities and the equipment that York has and provide certain kinds of laboratory techniques that we do not have on our campus. It was really the faculty stepping up and saying we would like to participate. Let me just add that our faculty has said that they do not really think it is their job necessarily to turn somebody down. They feel that there are opportunities that might exist that we might not even be aware of. So I have to give our faculty a lot of credit that they have been very willing participants in this.

City College Associate Provost Undieh also responded, by stating that he made a presentation to the full faculty senate. And then the decisions were made by the College Research Council, which includes representation from all the schools, as well as from the faculty senate.

Following discussion, Items I.B.3 and I.B.4, were approved for submission to the Board.

II. INFORMATION ITEMS:

A. Report by Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost Vita Rabinowitz on Remediation

Dr. Vita Rabinowitz stated that she wanted to take a few moments to discuss an important informational item that is not on the agenda, and does not require Board approval. But nonetheless, it is one of the most important steps that a university can take. CUNY is about to launch, with your support, comprehensive reform of developmental education. As many of you know, and as some of you have read in the Master Plan, there was no greater barrier to student success at CUNY than our current developmental policies and practices. Over the past year, a task force of CUNY provosts; discipline council leaders in mathematics, English-as-a-second-language, and reading and writing; and, of specialists in developmental education has met every month. I have also consulted with the Council of CUNY Presidents, the Academic Council of CUNY Provosts, and the Department of Education, including Chancellor Farina and Deputy Chancellor Phil Weinberg, as well as with national leaders in developmental and mathematics education and read an extensive literature and studied best practices across the nation, looking
at the work that has been done in California, in Texas, in North Carolina, and in Virginia for evidence-based practice. I’ve discussed this with the Chancellor, and Chancellor Milliken is supportive. She briefly reviewed the recommendations.

In response to a comment by Committee Chair Wellington Chen, Dr. Rabinowitz noted that preparing underprepared students to succeed requires institutional vigilance and requires quality control. The University knows some of what works, including in algebra. In fact, CUNY is a national leader in certain kinds of innovations, such as ASAP or CUNY Start and MATH Start. Frankly, it is because of how very expensive those interventions are and the fact that not all of our students are willing to postpone matriculation to enter ASAP or to take CUNY Start. Can we teach math more effectively and efficiently? One of the ways CUNY wants to launch this reformation or transformation is to wrap it up in a larger STEM initiative because our students do not do as well, even in selective colleges like Baruch and Hunter and Queens and Brooklyn and City, as they might in their beginning math classes—not developmental math, gateway math. We must improve math instruction at the developmental and gateway levels. The same is true of calculus and economics and other tough quantitative majors. So that has to be part of our solution.

In response to a question from Trustee Charles Shorter, Dr. Rabinowitz stated that she would send the case statement to the members of the committee right away.

In response to another question from Trustee Shorter, Dr. Rabinowitz noted that the University Faculty Senate leadership has been briefed and with the help of Dean Crook described discussions with the Math Discipline Council.

Committee COP Liaison, President Russell Hotzler stated that speaking on behalf of the presidents, the plan that has been put together is a really viable approach to this and it has broad support.

Committee Chair Chen added that productivity gains could consume so many jobs that we are going to have to be producing a new type of workforce. We are in a new type of society that will be highly efficient, highly educated. Without these basic skills, we are not going to be a viable competitive nation. And, this University revolves around students.

Dr. Karen Kaplowitz stated that yesterday the University Faculty Senate executive committee met for the first time this semester and invited Vice Chancellor Rabinowitz to come to our first its first Plenary in September to discuss this.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:14 p.m.