The meeting was held at 4:03 p.m.

There were present:

**Committee Members:**
- Jill O’Donnell-Tormey, Vice Chair
- Hon. Mayra Linares-Garcia
- Hon. Charles A. Shorter
- Prof. Karen Kaplowitz, faculty member
- Ms. Alyssa Desouza, student member

**University Staff:**
- Chancellor James B. Milliken
- Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost Vita Rabinowitz

**Trustee Observer:**
- Hon. Chika Onyejiukwa

**Ex-officio:**
- Hon. William C. Thompson, Jr.

**Trustee Staff:**
- Senior Advisor to the Chancellor and Secretary of the Board Gayle M. Horwitz
- Interim General Counsel and Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs Jane Sovern
- Deputy to the Secretary Hourig Messerlian
- Ms. Doris Wang

### Action Items:

#### A. Approval of the Minutes of the Meeting of September 7, 2016

The minutes were approved as submitted upon motion made by Prof. Karen Kaplowitz and seconded by Trustee Charles Shorter.

#### B. Policy Calendar

1. **College of Staten Island – Ed.D. in Community-Based Leadership**

   Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost (EVC&UP) Vita Rabinowitz stated that this groundbreaking program for the College of Staten Island (CSI) will prepare students to become effective practitioner-leaders who are able to apply current research to school community collaborations and to craft those into effective practice. The program is designed to meet the needs of working educators who already hold graduate degrees. All entrants will have a master's degree plus 12 additional credits or their equivalent in a variety of related fields including a graduate certificate as school building or school district leader. The proposed program is unusual among education doctorates in that it is going to offer a more holistic approach to secondary education. That will distinguish it from Hunter College’s existing Ed.D. program in Instructional Leadership, for example, which focuses more traditionally on curricula and pedagogy. This program focuses on all of the disciplines that reasonably affect children and adolescents as they are educated and
crosses social work and public health, as well as education. The program will work on preparing students to conduct and interpret research as well as focus on students' socioeconomic context, community partnerships and family engagement. Graduates will be uniquely prepared to lead across larger systems such as superintendents, district level directors, policy developers, advocates, and officers in educational nonprofits. Although CSI has been successfully offering graduate programs in education for a number of years this is its first doctoral program in education and thus will require a master plan amendment from CSI.

In response to questions from Trustee Charles Shorter a) on the level of students that CSI expects will enroll in this program, and b) on the field instruction provided through this program:

Dean of CSI's School of Education Kenneth Gold stated that the Ed.D. in Community-Based Leadership program will primarily attract mature students who already hold master's degrees, and possibly have some credits beyond their graduate degree. This program is expected to be the culmination of their academic pursuits. He further stated that this is an applied program that is concerned with giving students experiences that are in school and/or community settings. He also indicated that as it does not lead to any sort of state certification or license, this program does not need to comply with any particular state regulations for numbers of hours of field work. Normally one might see something like that in a particular course description, linking it to the field experience, but in this case it is more implied in the descriptions and the syllabi because it does not need to make an explicit reference to clinical or field experiences. It really varies by each course. Locations for applied work would be reviewed by a college committee that would include faculty from both departments within the School of Education as well as faculty from other departments outside of the school. Locations are likely to be primarily on Staten Island with some in Brooklyn.

In response to a question from Ms. Alyssa Desouza on student interest in the Ed.D. in Community-Based Leadership program:

Dean Gold noted that there was a strong student interest in this program. It was primarily marketed to graduates from CSI’s Educational Leadership Program. There is one other additional area of interest which has been fascinating as it was really unanticipated: a lot of professionals at the college who have aspirations for a doctoral degree have informally come to him or to the faculty involved and expressed their interest in this program. The vision of the campus as a whole is very much in serving the community around it. This is going to be a degree that is going to support those aspirations.

In response to a question from Trustee Shorter on the career aspirations of students getting into the Ed.D. in Community-Based Leadership program:

Dean Gold stated that students in the program, many of whom already are school principals, would be interested in becoming policymakers or non-profit leaders. He added that there will be some interest from people working for community-based organizations who already have a master's degree in a related field and that is the reason why the college is not just looking at people with master's degrees in education. The college anticipates that a variety of professionals would see this degree as something that would still enhance their career aspirations.

Prof. Karen Kaplowitz commended CSI for this wonderful proposal and stated that she hoped that it becomes the model whereby the cover page of all such proposals in the
future will have all of the governance processes and their dates of approval by the Faculty Senate of the colleges, as it is very helpful.

Following this discussion, Item I.B.1 was approved for submission to the Board as moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Ms. Alyssa Desouza.

2. Borough of Manhattan Community College – AS in Public Health. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that the AS in Public Health has been designed primarily for students interested in transferring to one of the senior colleges. The program provides the foundational courses in science and public policy so that students may seamlessly enroll in a Bachelor of Science in Public Health. An articulation agreement has already been signed with York College, and Borough of Manhattan Community College (BMCC), and BMCC is pursuing possible articulation agreements with other CUNY senior colleges. This initiative follows BMCC's many other successful initiatives to create powerful transfer programs with CUNY senior colleges.

3. Borough of Manhattan Community College – AA in Gender and Women's Studies. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that Women's Studies was established as a formal discipline in the 1970’s. It is interdisciplinary in nature and courses using feminist methodology are dispersed throughout the curriculum. In the 1980’s the field expanded to study masculinity through similar lenses and the discipline added gender or sexuality studies to its name. This program is yet another example of BMCC’s strategic initiative to cluster liberal arts courses together into majors with the intent to connect students more closely to faculty at BMCC and to make transfer to senior colleges more seamless. There will be a minimal additional cost to the college to run the program and an articulation agreement between BMCC and John Jay College has already been signed. BMCC may possibly be developing articulation agreements with other colleges as well.

In response to a question from Trustee Shorter on articulation agreements for the AS in Public Health and AA in Gender and Women’s Studies programs:

EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that New York State Education Department requires that associate degree programs articulate with a senior college to ensure that students have a path. What typically happens is that as soon as colleges form an acceptable articulation agreement, they apply for the degree. But that does not stop them from pursuing relationships with other colleges. The articulation agreement helps in other ways. It really makes transfers easier. Even today when transfer has probably gone as smoothly at CUNY as it has gone in a long time, thanks to Pathways and to other initiatives, the truth is students do sometimes worry whether the courses taken at CUNY community colleges will transfer to CUNY senior colleges--and they do not always. Even within a major. In fact, senior colleges understandably jealously guard their majors and there can be some friction. An agreement like this assures that any issues are worked out in advance and there is no chance that these students will lose credits in the transfer or the courses will be noncontributory. Every one of these courses will transfer.

BMCC Dean for Academic Programs and Instruction Erwin Wong noted that once an affiliation agreement is secured, the college has enough to go forward with the program. But that does not preclude the college from pursuing others. For example, for the AA in Gender Studies and Women’s Studies program, BMCC actually provided two, because two articulation agreements were secured concurrently. He added that BMCC has ongoing discussions with all the senior colleges as long as they are in appropriate areas of study. Certainly York College was chosen as one of the primary candidates for public health because it has a concentration in public health. Part of the goal is obviously to
make these smaller, niche programs. Similarly with public health, part of it follows CUNY’s initiative with public health but it is also taking a look at BMCC’s undeclared health majors, because many students come in with undeclared health majors wishing to become nurses. That is critical. There are only so many seats, it is very competitive and not every student will get into the nursing program. In the past the fallback would be that the student then would have to become a liberal arts major which did not necessarily respond to what their needs were. Then at BMCC we also had respiratory therapy, paramedic, and health information technology. Yet those areas did not necessarily respond to a student’s interest in nursing. So we have created a lot of health programs like community health, school health education, and now public health because those offer viable alternatives for students who are interested in pursuing a health field like nursing.

In response to a question from EVC&UP Rabinowitz on whether BMCC has been charting the correlation between participation in these new programs, some of the earlier programs that were started, and persistence rates:

Dean Wong stated that BMCC’s Institutional Effectiveness and Analytics Department is taking a look at the correlation between participation in these new programs, some of the earlier ones that were started and persistence rates, because certainly the college also created other niche type programs such as Learning Academies and ASAP.

In response to several questions from Ms. Desouza on a) the specific focus of the AS in Public Health program, b) on the experiential learning opportunities offered, like internships, by this program, and c) on the opportunities for students who graduate from this program and whether they are competitive:

Assistant Professor of Health Education Yuliya Shneyderman stated that the AS in Public Health program has a general focus. BMCC worked very closely with York College and they have the second piece of this program which is to design interventions; these are the higher level courses that will teach students how to do needs assessments, plan and assess interventions, etc. BMCC’s is more of a baseline degree, introducing fairly general topics without a specific area of focus in public health, but it would introduce students to epidemiology, biostatistics, etc. As far as experiential learning, all the higher level courses at York College have a very strong community component for internships. There have been more job opportunities for students graduating with associates degrees in public health. Since Healthy People 2020 called for more associates degrees in public health, the profession is going toward having more opportunities for people with those degrees.

Following this discussion, items I.B.2 and I.B.3 were approved for submission to the Board as moved by Trustee Shorter and seconded by Trustee Mayra Linares-Garcia.

4. School of Professional Studies – BA in Liberal Studies. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that this proposal is in response to the University’s strategic initiative--which you will be hearing much more about in the next few weeks--to recruit, enroll, and graduate more adult students. New York City alone has almost one million adults with some college but no degree. A bachelor’s degree could change the trajectories of their careers, and this program is focused on this large group of New Yorkers. The program’s flexibility lies in its delivery model which is 100% online. Its structure facilitates both transfer and life experience credits or a competency based credentialing--that is, if an applicant can show that they have the skills that a course might impart, they will earn those credits. Also, in its curriculum this program responds to students’ wishes to tailor their academic program to their own interests. The degree is in liberal studies and not in a typical disciplinary area, so it is broad. But it offers much that is specific and useful, such as skills in writing,
in critical thinking and in professional behavior that could be tremendously useful to a wide group of people. The program is designed to provide students with professional skills like project management, advanced writing skills, and evidence based analysis that working people need.

In response to a question from Ms. Desouza on whether this program a) would be delivered entirely online, and b) whether it would offer experiential learning opportunities for the students:

EVC&UP Rabonowitz noted that there will certainly be applied learning opportunities. She invited Senior University Dean for Academic Affairs and Dean of the School of Professional Studies John Mogulescu to the table, who stated that there are over 800,000 adults who have some college experience in this city and would really desire a degree. He added that the school is very proud that its online programs have become of national note in a short period of time and that it has such highly ranked programs.

Associate Dean for Academic Affairs George Otte noted that as far as experiential learning, this program provides an opportunity to build breadth as well as depth by applying the skills and competencies that the program is designed to foster by allowing the students to build their own portfolio of learning experiences because this is really not so much about subject matter as it is about the application of skills and competencies in written communication, in team building, in higher order reasoning and quantitative analysis.

Assistant Dean of Academic Affairs Jennifer Sparrow added that there will be a course that actually does address and requires experiential learning and because this program is geared toward adult learners, the school is looking to give people the option of a traditional place-based internship, or to do an internship type experience or research project at their current place of work. Also, credit for prior learning is an option which—and this is very important for adult learners—will help them credential the experiences and the knowledge that they are already bringing to the program.

In response to a question from EVC&UP Rabinowitz and Committee Vice Chair O’Donnell-Tormey on how life experience credit opportunities are specifically handled by the BA in Liberal Studies program:

Assistant Dean Sparrow stated that SPS has a rigorous process that actually pairs an existing syllabus with the student’s life experience. A student who might have experience in accounting and does not feel that he or she needs to sit through an accounting course can look at an accounting course syllabus and take all the learning outcomes of the syllabus and write an essay and provide supporting documentation showing his/her knowledge and proficiency. This information is evaluated by the college and the applicable credit is provided.

In response to a question from Chairperson William C. Thompson, Jr. on participation in SPS’s online programs:

Dean Mogulescu stated that in Fall 2016, approximately 2,700 undergraduate, graduate, and credit-certificate students enrolled at the School of Professional Studies (SPS). Eighty percent (8 out of 10) of the school’s bachelor’s degree programs are online, and approximately 60% (7 out of 11) of its master’s degrees are online. In Fall 2016, a total of 1,966 students matriculated at SPS in online programs, of which 1,400 were undergraduates.
In response to EVC&UP Rabinowitz’s comment that she is thrilled that the state has finally approved some very important programs, that were approved by this committee, that are going to make a big impact:

Dean Mogulescu stated that he would highlight SPS’s new Master’s in Nursing program. The school’s associate degree students have a great need now to get their baccalaureate degree, so it now has a very large undergraduate nursing program. These are all people who have an RN already, but because of changes in healthcare, hospitals are demanding that they get a bachelor's degree. At the same time, in order to go to the supervisory level, there is a need to get a master's degree, and the Master's in Nursing program, which took a long time to get state approval, was approved recently. Classes will be starting next fall.

In response to a question from Trustee Shorter on what kinds of outcomes are expected from the BA in Liberal Studies program at SPS:

Dean Mogulescu noted that SPS has tried to build this degree to be directly related to the workforce, and particularly related to a series of competencies that are a bit unusual in what typically might be liberal studies programs. The school expects that someone who graduates from this program will not only have a broad based education but would have developed competencies that employers want in their employees.

Assistant Dean Sparrow added that the 2012 CUNY Jobs Taskforce was actually SPS’s starting place, which looked at what employers across several sectors in New York City were interested in, so it built the program from the ground up, looking at the competencies and then looking at the courses and determining where they could embed and also assess, so that at the course level, the students are being assessed on these competencies. The focus is building and assessing the competencies and having graduates who are able to talk about the competencies in a language that will resonate with employers.

Trustee Mayra Linares-Garcia commented that colleges lose students because of whatever happens with their lives and having this program will encourage them to return and finish their studies. Giving them the opportunity to use life experience as credit is going to motivate them as it is not going to take forever. She then inquired about what would be a moderate timeline for graduation for people who are already working when they enroll in online programs at SPS:

Dean Mogulescu stated that most SPS students are adult students and will not be able to go full-time, although the school encourages them to take intersession and summer courses in addition to their regular semester coursework. The advantage of studying online is that students can take courses whenever they have the available time to do so. SPS works with the students to help them matriculate in a reasonable period of time. If a student comes in to a program with a small number of credits, it will obviously take them longer to obtain the required credits.

In response to a question from Prof. Kaplowitz on how many students are enrolled per section or per course:

Associate Dean Otte noted that pedagogically online learning works to the extent that students interact not just with the instructor but with other students, and that is absolutely critical, so the ideal class would not be much larger than two dozen students.
In response to a question from Trustee Shorter on advisement provided to students by SPS to help guide them through the development of the programs:

Dean Mogulescu stated that understanding the importance of advisors, SPS tries to put resources in advisement even at the expense of other areas.

EVC&UP Rabinowitz noted that SPS has the finest student orientation to online learning that she has ever seen. In fact it could easily be the model for all of CUNY’s online programs. It is exceedingly thoughtful and helpful and it has been assessed highly. Advising starts from the very first time a student signs up for courses, and the student to advisor ratio is approximately 150.

Following discussion, this item was approved for submission to the Board as moved by Trustee Shorter and seconded by Trustee Linares-Garcia.

II. INFORMATION ITEM:

A. Statement by Chancellor James B. Milliken.

Chancellor Milliken stated that there were a number of items in Governor Andrew Cuomo’s State of the State address earlier today that might be of interest to the Committee. First, the free tuition proposals which would position New York, CUNY and SUNY in the forefront nationally in terms of providing affordable access. In addition, it helps the University to move students to completion more quickly which is one of its highest priorities. Second, an item that CUNY has enthusiastically supported in the past, is the passage of the Dream Act which will affect so many of the students and which is great not just for the University and its students but for the state and for the country. Finally, an exciting proposal that affects all of CUNY and all of the city, but it is seated in one borough, is the proposal to transition the Institute for Basic Research (IBR) to CUNY, headquartered at CSI. The Governor intends to appoint a taskforce or a commission to look at the issues relating to that transfer. This would be terrific for CUNY, for the State, and for research in the areas of developmental disability, neuroscience and basic biology and chemistry that are done at the institute now. The University already partners with IBR at the CSI. There would be efficiencies in terms of research administration, but even more importantly, there would be additional opportunities for collaboration through the Graduate Center and doctoral education across CUNY in these disciplines that they are focused on. This is the remaining piece of the research enterprise that was associated with Willowbrook. It occupies a significant amount of space next to the CSI campus. So it makes all the sense in the world.

Committee Vice Chair O’Donnell-Tormey noted that she started her research career at IBR. She did summer internships there as a college student, and that is when she realized that she wanted to be a scientist.

Upon motion duly made, seconded and carried, the meeting was adjourned at 4:48 p.m.