The meeting was called to order at 6:13 p.m.

There were present:

Committee Members:
Hon. Fernando Ferrer, Chair
Hon. Judah Gribetz, Vice Chair
Hon. Rita DiMartino
Hon. Ken Sunshine
Prof. Kathleen Barker, faculty member
Ms. Rachelle Antoine, student member
President Marcia Keizs, COP member

University Staff:
Chancellor James B. Milliken
Vice Chancellor Gloriana Waters
University Dean for Recruitment and Diversity Arlene Torres
University Director Anne Chamberlain

Trustee Observers:
Hon. Lorraine A. Cortés-Vázquez
Hon. Sandra Wilkin
Hon. Kay Conway
Hon. Chika Onyewuje

Trustee Staff:
Senior Vice Chancellor and Secretary Jay Hershenson
General Counsel and Senior Vice Chancellor Frederick P. Schaffer
Deputy to the Secretary Hourig Messerlian
Ms. Doris Wang

Cal. No. DISPOSITION

The agenda items were considered and acted upon in the following order:

I. ACTION ITEMS:

A. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 7, 2016. The minutes were approved as submitted.

B. POLICY CALENDAR

1. Amendment to the Governance Plan of the Graduate School and University Center. General Counsel and Senior Vice Chancellor (GC&SVC) Frederick Schaffer stated that this amendment to the Governance Plan of the Graduate School and University Center is minor, but there is a procedural process for making changes to programs and apparently a change was proposed without all of its relevant constituencies knowing about the proposal. All that is being added is language—that upon an affirmative vote—to consider a change from a program that the affected faculty and students get notice of it before it goes to the faculty council.

   Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

2. Appointment of Gary Johnson as Commissioner of The City University of New York Civil Service Commission. Vice Chancellor Gloriana Waters stated that this resolution proposes that Gary Johnson be appointed to fill the vacancy left by the resignation of Marilyn Flood, who has served since 1994. Therefore, this resolution authorizes the Chancellor to appoint
Gary Johnson as a commissioner of the CUNY Civil Service system for a prorated six-year term, commencing October 6, 2016, and expiring May 31, 2022. Mr. Johnson, who holds a JD from Fordham University School of law, has served as Director of the New York State's Governor's Office of Employee Relations since 2007. Previous positions included associate counsel and director of litigation for the New York State Public Employee Relations Board, and administrative law judge for the New York State Public Service Commission. He has also served as an assistant district attorney for Kings County. The appointment of Mr. Johnson will enable the University to continue to operate under the rules and regulations of its civil service commission as approved by the New York State education law and governed by the state and civil service laws.

In response to a question from Prof. Kathleen Barker, Vice Chancellor Waters stated that this is not a paid position, it is a volunteer position.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

3. **Naming of the Skirball Science Learning Center at Hunter College.**

4. **Naming of the James M. and Cathleen D. Stone Center on Socio-Economic Inequality at The Graduate Center.**

Vice Chancellor Waters stated that these naming opportunities at two CUNY colleges together represent monetary gifts to the University of nearly $3 million. These matters have been vetted by the Office of Human Resources Management (OHRM), the Office of Institutional Advancement, and the Office of General Counsel to ensure that they meet the University's guidelines and are now recommended for approval. They are the Skirball Science Learning Center at Hunter College—a $450,000 gift, and the James M. and Cathleen D. Stone Center on Socio-Economic Inequality at the Graduate School—a $2.5 million gift.

Following discussion, items I.B. 3 and I.B.4 were approved for submission to the Board.

C. **CHANCELLOR’S UNIVERSITY REPORT**

1. **Appointment of Kenichi Iwama as Vice President for Economic Development, Continuing Studies and Government Relations at the College of Staten Island.**

2. **Appointment of Stephen Di Dio as Interim Vice President and Chief Communication and Marketing Officer at Queensborough Community College.**

3. **Appointment of Jonathan Sandville as Vice President of Institutional Advancement at Medgar Evers College.**

4. **Appointment of Vincent Banrey as Vice President for Student Development at York College.**

Vice Chancellor Waters gave a brief presentation on each item. Following discussion, items I.C.1 through 1.C. 4 were approved for submission to the Board.
II. REPORT OF THE VICE CHANCELLOR

***PRESENTATION ON THE QUARTERLY REPORT ON EMPLOYEE DIVERSITY BY VICE CHANCELLOR GLORIANA WATERS, UNIVERSITY DEAN FOR RECRUITMENT AND DIVERSITY ARLENE TORRES, AND MS. ANNE CHAMBERLAIN***

In response to a question from Committee Chair Fernando Ferrer, Vice Chancellor Waters confirmed that the total University headcount for full-time employees is 20,002.

In response to a comment by Committee Chair Ferrer, University Dean for Recruitment and Diversity Arlene Torres noted that the determination of labor market availability will change depending on the category of workers and their availability nationally and regionally.

In response to a question from Committee Chair Ferrer, Vice Chancellor Waters stated that market availability measures are evaluated and reviewed, but this has not been done in the last five years, so the University can certainly take another look. One of the things would be to establish where CUNY recruits from, for each of the various groups.

In response to a follow up question from Trustee Lorraine Cortés-Vázquez, University Director Anne Chamberlain noted that market availability is the demographic composition of the group from which one would normally recruit, if hiring a new person into a job. She agreed that if there is underrepresentation in the markets CUNY hires from, then it is in comparison only to what is available in the marketplace.

In response to another question from Trustee Cortés-Vázquez, Vice Chancellor Waters stated that underutilization is helpful as a benchmark. But one of the other things to do is look at representation. If you have no representation in a certain area, then the pool might not be there, but if there are no females in a particular group that would be a cause for some concern.

In response to a question from Trustee Ken Sunshine, Vice Chancellor Waters noted that CUNY is doing better than a lot of other universities in hiring a diverse workforce. But, that does not mean that there are not areas that the University needs to focus on and improve.

In response to questions about self-identification, Dean Arlene Torres explained that when an individual is hired at CUNY and they go into the CUNYfirst system to provide their information, they have an opportunity to self-identify across broad race and ethnic categories—Hispanic, Latina, African American Black, Asian American, and so forth, but they can also identify along sub-categories within these larger categories, so in the example of Hispanic Latino, a person could check off that they are Dominican or Puerto Rican, etc.—and so that disaggregated data will be available to get a sense of what is the ethnic representation within that broader category. While this information is collected, it is not reflected in this quarterly report which reflects the University's affirmative action plan for the federal government, which does not disaggregate but only provides broad numbers.

In response to a question from Committee Vice Chair Judah Gribetz, Vice Chancellor Waters stated that adjuncts working at CUNY are not included in this report, as CUNY does not normally include adjuncts in its affirmative action plans. But, OHRM is looking into including them in future reports.

In response to a question from Prof. Kathleen Barker, Dean Torres noted that as people move up in rank, when it comes to the female population, their percentages continue to decrease. One has to consider whether or not women are being tenured, how long it is taking them to be tenured, if they are being promoted once they are tenured, are they moving into the ranks of full professor, how many are moving into distinguished professor positions, and what are the barriers to their promotion. The COACHE survey did provide a great deal of information on this, and the Office of Academic
Affairs has launched a mentoring program to help individuals who are at the associate professor level and who have been in that title for a considerable period of time.

In response to a question from Trustee Cortés-Vázquez, Vice Chancellor Waters stated that regarding campuses who may have several areas of underrepresentation, the approach would be to speak to the college president. Diversity in hiring is required to be reflected in the presidents’ plans, so the Central Administration would speak to the president about what outreach plans they have for addressing any underutilization. They can be provided with assistance in recruitment sources, etc. In some cases, they may not have hired in this area in a while, so it is going to remain stagnant.

In response to a question from University Faculty Senate (UFS) Chair and Trustee Kay Conway, Ms. Chamberlain noted that over time the geographic range has expanded as New York City has become increasingly expensive. OHRM does a survey of new hires every year, to find out if they relocated or not. OHRM does have those statistics by title.

In response to a question from Trustee Sandra Wilkin, Ms. Chamberlain stated that OHRM keeps a record of the applicants who have applied to the positions, and has started this year to get statistical data from CUNYfirst. One of the things OHRM has learned is that there are certain periods in an individual’s career progression that CUNY is at more risk of losing people. For administrators, for example, that would be around the six year period when they have become highly skilled at what they do and perhaps concerned about the forward movement of their careers. OHRM has an exit survey program that asks specific questions about employees’ impressions of working at CUNY and the reasons for their leaving.

In response to related questions from Committee Chair Ferrer and Trustee Cortés-Vázquez, Vice Chancellor Waters stated that the first thing would be to look at the labor market to assess whether or not CUNY will meet its benchmark because everything flows from that; to see if there needs to be any adjustment to the available data used; after that, to take a look at the areas of concern. Certainly for professionals and for other areas where there are searches and there is a full recruitment program, OHRM has to start looking at the targeted areas of recruitment to see how people are pulled into the pool and making them aware of the positions that are available and opportunities for professional development.

In response to a question from UFS Chair and Trustee Conway, Ms. Chamberlain noted that the federal government asks the University to consider 7 percent a benchmark for individuals with disabilities and 6.9 percent for veterans. CUNY is way under these benchmarks, but this is quite common. Many employers are finding challenges in encouraging employees to self-identify. Also, the overall unemployment rate in New York State for veterans is much lower than 6.9 percent, so to meet that goal, CUNY would have to be very aggressive with recruiting.

In response to a question from Committee Chair Ferrer, Dean Torres stated that her team was asked to assemble this report in a short period of time, and it was a monumental effort. The team manually looked at each affirmative action plan from the 24 campuses and input the data into a series of spreadsheets. She agreed with Committee Chair Ferrer that new technology and software is needed for her team to do this more effectively. CUNYfirst has the capability to do some things, but the programming of CUNYfirst has not been sufficient for OHRM to be able to extract conclusive reports.

Committee Chair Ferrer stated that he appreciates the work put into this report. This is important, and something of a paradigm shift. It is important that all understand what is being done to promote inclusion in the University and each one of its campuses and institutions. He added that he would like this committee to drill down deep into faculty, especially into the calculations and the moving targets for reports availability. That is a problem in almost every diversity operation he has ever
seen, and especially when it has not been reviewed for over five years, that is a profound problem. Committee Chair Ferrer added that the question he thinks the committee should re-evaluate is how to arrive at these baselines and perhaps come to an agreement about how that is done in the future.

Upon motion duly made, seconded and carried, the meeting was adjourned at 7:38 P.M.