The meeting was called to order at 5:59 p.m.

There were present:

**Committee Members:**
- Hon. Valerie Beal, Chair
- Hon. Peter S. Pantaleo
- Hon. Jeffrey S. Wiesenfeld
- President Carolyn G. Williams, COP liaison
- Mr. Daniel Muchnick, student member

**University Staff:**
- Chancellor Matthew Goldstein
- Executive Vice Chancellor and Chief Operating Officer Allan H. Dobrin
- Vice Chancellor Gloriana Waters

**Ex-officio:**
- Hon. Philip Alfonso Berry

**Trustee Observers:**
- Hon. Manfred Philipp

**Trustee Staff:**
- Senior Vice Chancellor and Secretary of the Board Jay Hershenson
- Senior Vice Chancellor and General Counsel Frederick Schaffer
- Mr. Steven Quinn

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cal. No.</th>
<th>DISPOSITION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

The agenda items were considered in the following order:

**I. ACTION ITEMS:**

A. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JANUARY 5, 2009. The minutes were approved as submitted.

B. POLICY CALENDAR

3. Naming of the William Randolph Hearst Professorship at Hunter College (Attachment I-B-3). President Jennifer Raab stated that this item proposes to name a professorship in nursing supported by the William Hearst Foundation with a gift of $300,000 and a commitment to increase it to $500,000. It was started before the current naming standards were put in place, but University Dean for Institutional Advancement Carlos Flynn has approved the gift amount. This is the college’s second nursing chair. One of the biggest challenges in nursing is recruiting faculty at the state level, so this is an important part of Hunter’s initiative to improve and invest in its School of Nursing.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

1. Naming of the Joseph L. Buttenwieser Conference Room at The City College of New York (Attachment I-B-1). President Gregory Williams stated that this item proposes to name the Joseph Buttenweiser Conference Room at City College. A member of the
class of 1883, Joseph Buttenwieser led the first fundraising drive at City College. The Family Student Center had previously been named for him, but was torn down in 1986. This conference room, named some time ago, had been inadvertently excluded from the college’s initial namings inventory.

2. Naming of the Michael and Irene Ross Program for Jewish Studies and the Michael and Irene Ross Chair in Hebrew and Yiddish at The City College of New York (Attachment I-B-2). President Gregory Williams stated that this item proposes to name a program in Jewish Studies and a chair in Hebrew and Yiddish, as the college has received a $10 million gift from Michael and Irene Ross for this purpose.

Following discussion, items I-B-1 and I-B-2 were approved for submission to the Board.

4. Proposed Amendments to the Governance Plan of Brooklyn College (Attachment I-B-4). Provost William Tramontano stated that Brooklyn College proposes changes in its promotion and tenure process, approved by both the Council on Administrative Policy and the Policy Council, after consultation. The proposed changes will reduce the college's current six-level promotion and tenure process to four levels. The college would put in place four divisional promotion and tenure review committees. Each of these committees will review candidates for promotion and tenure recommended by the department and the division and will then forward the recommendations to the college-wide Promotion and Tenure Committee, which will send its recommendations to the president of the college. The proposed changes will achieve greater transparency, avoid duplication of efforts, and give departments a voice in all the promotions in their particular disciplines.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

5. Proposed Amendments to the Governance Plan of the CUNY School of Law (Attachment I-B-5). Dean Gregory Koster stated that the Law School proposes to make a technical amendment to its governance plan relating to the promotion and tenure process that was adopted by its faculty. Unlike most other CUNY campuses that have departmental Personnel and Budget (P&B) Committees, The Law School has only one P&B for all promotion and tenure matters. In order to deal with the overwhelming workload in gathering data, the current practice is that the P&B delegates other tenure and promotion committees. The proposed technical amendment to the governance plan will reflect what has been the historical practice for the entire existence of the Law School.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

6. Proposed Amendments to the Governance Plan of Kingsborough Community College (Attachment I-B-6). Provost Stuart Suss stated that the college proposes to amend its governance plan. First adopted in 1972 and slightly amended in 1982, the governance plan needs several language changes and modifications to provide a greater continuity in governance from year to year.

Professor Michael Sokolow, Chairman of the college’s Legislative Committee, explained that the seven or eight standing committees on the College Council have one year memberships. Every September, members are reappointed to each of the committees, including those of the Committee on Committees that processes all appointments. Accordingly, the College Council has adopted a motion to streamline the process and to
lengthen the membership terms on the individual committees so that there would be stability and continuity from year to year.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

C. CHANCELLOR’S UNIVERSITY REPORT

1. Appointment of Mark Gibbel as Vice President for College Advancement at Baruch College, effective February 3, 2009 (Attachment I-C-1). President Kathleen Waldron gave an oral presentation on this item. Following discussion this item was approved for submission to the Board.

2. Appointment of E. Ramone Segree as Vice President for Institutional Advancement at LaGuardia Community College, effective February 3, 2009 (Attachment I-C-2). President Gail Mellow gave an oral presentation on this item. Following discussion this item was approved for submission to the Board.

II. INFORMATION ITEMS:

Appointments with Tenure, §6.2.d of the Bylaws, effective September 1, 2009.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>College</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Basis for Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Sophie Davis</td>
<td>Sanna M. Goyert</td>
<td>Microbiology &amp; Immunology</td>
<td>Medical Professor</td>
<td>Best Interests of the College</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School of Biomedical Education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Basic Sciences)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. City College</td>
<td>Barbara Zajc</td>
<td>Chemistry</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>Best Interests of the College</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appointments with Waiver, §11.10 of the Bylaws, effective February 1, 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>College</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Requirement Waived/ Basis for Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E.</td>
<td>Teddy Cruz</td>
<td>Architecture, Urban Design &amp; Landscape Architecture</td>
<td>Visiting Professor</td>
<td>Ph.D./Best Interests of the College</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

III. REPORT OF THE VICE CHANCELLOR:

Vice Chancellor Waters noted that a report on ECP appointments below the level of vice president had been distributed to the Committee members at the start of the meeting. She noted that there could be other appointments entered into the February 2009 Chancellor’s University Report Addendum section prior to the Board of Trustees’ Board Meeting on February 23rd. Vice Chancellor Waters also reported that there were five HEO appointments with Waiver of Bylaws, one at the Law School and four at Central Office, and that there was one Search Waiver at City College.

Vice Chancellor Waters stated that The Office of Recruitment and Diversity headed by University Dean Henry Vance Davis has been quite active since its inception: It spearheaded a successful conference entitled Making Excellence Inclusive, held at the Graduate Center and attended by over 350 attendees. The conference was noteworthy for a lot of positive responses from the
participants on how helpful it was to hear about best practices in Inclusive Excellence; The Office also established an electronic database which has placed applicants in over 180 searches at CUNY, 90% of whom are from federally protected classes. The applicants are found through direct mail and email and through recruiting at conferences. Vice Chancellor Waters added that under its Inclusive Excellence initiative, the Office has been working with CUNY campuses to create a plan of coordinated action that builds upon the diversity at CUNY. Thirteen campuses have completed the first three phases of a five-phase process. The Office is also currently working on a faculty exchange program with Historically Black Colleges and Universities and other minority serving institutions. Lastly, it continues to monitor progress in hiring and retention of protected classes in the workforce.

Vice Chancellor Waters noted that Committee members had previously received a packet of material on diversity at CUNY over the past three years, and that a detailed analysis for the fall of 2008 had been distributed around the table at the start of the meeting. She then made a short presentation on the diversity statistics.

Instructional staff increased by 1,088 individuals between 2006 and 2008, for a 10.9 percentage change. On the classified staff side an additional 413 employees were hired, for a percentage increase of 7.7%. Dividing this data into title groupings, between 2006 and 2008, CUNY hired 526 additional faculty; 38 additional people in the ECP, or a 9.8% increase; 511 additional people in the HEO series, or an 18.9% increase; 13 individuals were hired under Other Instructional Titles, for a 2% increase.

Looking at the ethnic and gender representation of full time faculty between 2006 and 2008: for women we have increased our numbers by 300, a 10.6% increase; for blacks we have 61 additional hires for a 7.8% increase; for Puerto Ricans 19 new hires for a 12.7% increase; for Hispanics, other than Puerto Rican, 36 additional hires for a 10.8% increase; for Asian Pacific Islanders, 99 new hires for a 16.6% increase; for Italian Americans, 82 new hires for a 22.7% increase; on the American Indians, CUNY lost three, for a decrease of 20%. Vice Chancellor Waters explained that while the number of faculty has increased in total, the percentage representation of the various groups within the faculty has pretty much remained constant.

Vice Chancellor Waters stated that during the same period, the University had hired 26 females, 3 blacks, 2 Puerto Ricans, 2 Hispanics, 4 Asians and 14 Italians for the ECP; and, 341 more women, 144 Blacks, 65 Puerto Ricans, 106 Hispanics, 39 Asians, 2 American Indians and 41 Italian Americans in the HEO series. Again, the percentage representations pretty much stayed constant between 2006 and 2008.

Vice Chancellor Waters noted that Other Instructional Staff is one area where there are some decreases. These are titles that CUNY does not traditionally do a lot of hiring in, such as registrars, research associates, and CLTs. However, there is a jump of 18 individuals of Asian descent, primarily in the CLT and research categories.

Vice Chancellor Waters stated that based on the latest available statistics on national faculty representation, minority representation for faculty across the nation is about 16.3% compared to CUNY's 30.8%; women nationally are 40.6% compared to CUNY's 46.2%; blacks nationwide are 5.2% compared to CUNY's 12.4%; Hispanics are 3.4% compared to 7.9% at CUNY; Asians are 7.2% nationally compared to 10.2% at CUNY; and, American Indians throughout the nation are slightly higher than what we see here at CUNY, .5% as opposed to .2%.
Vice Chancellor Waters stated that while CUNY’s diversity statistics are certainly good, it is important to see how this diversity is distributed among the campuses. For instance, 16% of the black faculty are at Medgar Evers College; 10% are at BMCC; 7.7% are at Bronx Community College. Far fewer black faculty are at the Graduate School, at 1.1%; College of Staten Island at 1.3%; Queensborough Community College, at 2.7%; and Hostos Community College at 2.6%. While CUNY’s numbers overall are quite impressive, there is certainly a disparity in the way that the protected classes are distributed amongst the campuses, and certain campuses need to work on certain areas and vice versa.

She noted that among Puerto Rican faculty, 16% are at Hostos Community College; 16% are at Hunter College; and 9% each are at Lehman College and Bronx Community College. Queensborough Community College has none, while the Graduate School and Medgar Evers College each have .6% of the Puerto Rican faculty in the University. The College of Staten Island and the Law School are at 1.2% each. Among Hispanic faculty Hunter College is at 11.4%; City College at 9%; BMCC at 9%; Lehman College at 8.9%; Medgar Evers College at 1.4%; The Graduate School at 1.9%, and York College at 3.0%. Among the Asian faculty, the majority are found at Baruch College at 11.8%; City College at 11%; and, Queens College at 10.4%. At the other end of the spectrum is Hostos Community College at 2%; Bronx Community College at 2.2%; and, Medgar Evers College at 2.3%. Among the Italian faculty, Hunter College has 10.4%; Kingsborough Community College has 10%; New York City College of Technology has 8%; The Graduate School and Medgar Evers College are both at .5%; and, Hostos Community College at 2.3%. Finally, Vice Chancellor Waters pointed out that different views of the diversity distribution by title groups are listed in Tables 8, 9 and 10 at the back of the three-year comparison report.

Vice Chairman Berry, Trustee Peter Pantaleo, and Prof. Manfred Philipp commended Vice Chancellor Waters for a thoroughly researched and exceedingly useful report.

In response to a question, Vice Chancellor Waters stated that under CUNY’s affirmative action plans each campus identifies its areas of underutilization and specifies a plan to address the issue. She added that progress continues to be made in the areas where there is underutilization, but pointed out that one has to look at what hires have actually taken place in a particular department to judge whether or not there is intent to do the right thing, versus the way the statistics are calculated to indicate progress. On the other hand, if this department has had six searches and none of them have addressed the underutilization, one needs to ask the question as to what special efforts have been made. There are affirmative action officers on each campus whose responsibility it is to monitor and hold departments accountable at times when there does not seem that real effort is being made.

Chancellor Goldstein stated that CUNY has an aged faculty relative to many higher education institutions in the United States. If one looks at the distribution on the basis of age, the University has a fairly large group of people whose ages are above 55 to 60. In a few years there is going to be a highly contentious auction for the best faculty talent across the United States. This will create great opportunities for the University to further diversify its workforce, provided it has the resources.

In response to a question, Chancellor Goldstein stated that anecdotally the University does very well in identifying people to be interviewed, but less well in closing the deal and getting people employed at the colleges. While some campuses do better than others, overall the numbers have grown, and in many areas they have grown impressively. This is still a work in progress.
Committee Chair Valerie Beal noted that it appears that the campuses that have had success previously continue to have success and the campuses that have not had success continue to not have success. The Chancellor is very engaged in talking to the presidents, and we have had discussions at different campuses about how presidents are engaged. As seen from the individual campus results, while the overall number continues to grow, the trend on individual campuses seems to be pretty consistent in terms of who is growing and who is not.

Vice Chairman Philip Alfonso Berry noted that when the Committee last received a presentation on this information, there was a similar conversation regarding the probable reasons why some of the deals are not closed, and the committee had asked at that time that the University make efforts to determine the reasons and take proactive action to improve the situation. The Chancellor’s continuing attention to this matter has provided the impetus to make it an important priority. He added that on a micro level, individuals need to research current best practices to come up with proactive ways to assist and help each of the campuses to expedite their efforts in areas where there is underutilization.

Vice Chancellor Waters stated that the University has set aside additional dollars to provide a panoply of options that presidents can tap into to help with recruitment, and it has investigated ways of providing relocation and housing assistance.

In response to a question, Vice Chancellor Waters explained that the percentages for substitutes do not vary significantly from that of full time faculty. If anything, there are probably more protected class members in the substitute ranks. She noted that she would also do an analysis of the part time faculty and share it with the committee upon completion.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:38 p.m.