The meeting was called to order at 6:08 p.m.

There were present:

**Committee Members:**
- Hon. Valene L. Beal, Chair
- Hon. Rita DiMartino, Vice Chair
- Hon. Carol A. Robles-Roman
- Hon. Jeffrey S. Wiesenfeld
- Prof. Stefan Baumrin, alternate faculty member
- President Carolyn G. Williams, COP liaison

**University Staff:**
- Chancellor Matthew Goldstein
- Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost
- Alexandra Logue
- Executive Vice Chancellor and Chief Operating Officer
- Allan H. Dobrin
- Vice Chancellor Gloriana Waters
- Mr. Kenneth Norz

**Trustee Observer:**
- Hon. Manfred Philipp
- Hon. Cory Provost

**Trustee Staff:**
- Senior Vice Chancellor and Secretary of the Board
  - Jay Hershenson
- Senior Vice Chancellor and General Counsel
  - Frederick Schaffer
- Deputy to the Secretary
  - Hourig Messerlian
- Mr. Steven Quinn

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cal. No.</th>
<th>DISPOSITION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

The agenda items were considered in the following order:

### I. ACTION ITEMS:

A. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF FEBRUARY 1, 2010.** The minutes were approved as submitted.

B. **POLICY CALENDAR**

2. Reappointment of a Sitting Commissioner of The City University of New York Civil Service Commission (Attachment I-B-2). Vice Chancellor Gloriana Waters gave an oral presentation on this item. Following discussion this item was approved for submission to the Board.

3. Amendments to the Governance Plan of the Graduate School and University Center (Attachment I-B-3). Senior Vice Chancellor and General Counsel Frederick Schaffer stated that the resolution involves three amendments to the governance plan for the School of Professional Studies. First, it authorizes the School of Professional Studies' counsel to establish an academic appeals committee and a student government body in accordance with the Bylaws or policies of the Board of Trustees. It corrects an oversight in the original governance plan which had omitted such a provision. Second, the proposed amendments delete the provision prohibiting the School of Professional Studies from offering degree programs other than online programs that are the same as those
currently offered by another CUNY college. This provision was unique to the School of Professional Studies and does not apply to any other college or school within CUNY. The existence of appropriate academic competition within the University appears to have been beneficial overall and should be extended to the School of Professional Studies. Finally, the proposed amendments delete the provision that revenue generated by the school should be used for doctoral support to the extent possible. Since the creation of the School of Professional Studies, the University has established a major program of support for doctoral students making this provision unnecessary.

Committee Member Stefan Baumrin stated that extensive discussions with the Doctoral Student Council about the adequacy of the additional funding directed by the University had indicated that funding is still insufficient for dissertation year coverage, travel, research, and doctoral student support. He noted that the Doctoral Student Council would like to have the School of Professional Studies revenue support continued.

Chancellor Matthew Goldstein stated that the University has provided an enormous amount of support for graduate students beyond what it has done in the past. A significant amount of money has been placed into doctoral support of stipends, tuition remission and full benefits for health care. This is a university that needs a lot more money. To go back and tax the School of Professional Studies, which would be a modicum of support in any case, is not the appropriate thing to do.

Committee Member Baumrin stated that the Chancellor's fellowships, which are quite handsome for incoming students, do not reach into the sixth year, in which most students do their dissertations.

Chancellor Goldstein agreed but pointed out that among graduate schools there is rarely a commitment beyond five years of doctoral support. It has only been in its recent past that the University took the major leap forward of establishing a commitment for five years.

In response to a question regarding the possibility of leaving the provision as it currently stands, Chancellor Goldstein stated that it was not a good thing to begin with and was done for expediency at the time.

Trustee Manfred Philipp noted that at its inception the School of Professional Studies was mainly a continuing education operation and it was the view of many people that it would support other aspects of the University. That support has not been forthcoming for the last few years. So, in fact, continuing it would have no effect. He noted that in terms of the non-compete clause of the School of Professional Studies, it has a governance document that is appropriate for a school of continuing education, not for a college. It does not have departments, P&BS, or a college senate that is primarily elected. He voiced his support for competition, but cautioned that it is a bad thing for the health of the University if one unit has a governance structure that is so much in contrast with the others, and has no faculty of its own. He encouraged the Board to insure that the as the school matures it adopts a mature governance structure that provides for academic freedom, a rigorous appointment process, extended appointments, and protection for faculty opinion.
Chancellor Goldstein stated that governance plans are living documents. They change as the needs of the entity they were designed to govern change. He agreed that, as time progresses, the governance plan should be adjusted and will be.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

4. Amendments to the Governance Plan of Lehman College (Attachment I-B-4). Special Counsel to Lehman College President Ricardo Fernandez Esdras Tulier stated that the main objective of the proposed changes in the governance plan of Lehman College is to make it easier for the college senate to meet quorum requirements. Each time a new ex officio appointment is made in the administration, additional senate seats are triggered for faculty and student representatives. As a result, the senate has grown over time to have 138 slots. The proposed changes would establish a set membership of 102. There are also changes to departmental representation on the Senate and membership in department P& Bs. Under the proposal departmental representatives must have two years of service before being eligible to be on the senate, and four of the five members of each department's P & B would need to be tenured unless there are fewer than four tenured faculty members in the department.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

5. Amendments to the Governance Plan of Bronx Community College (Attachment I-B-5). Bronx Community College President Carolyn Williams stated that the college is proposing five amendments to the governance plan. Several of the amendments come directly from the Open Meetings Law, including the changing of the definition of quorum, voting requirements and the rules of order to be followed. With the changes in the quorum requirements under the Open Meetings Law the college also recommends instituting the option of alternates to serve on the senate and eliminating a provision to create vacancies which has rarely, if ever, been implemented.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

6. Amendments to the Governance Plan of Borough of Manhattan Community College (Attachment I-B-6). Borough of Manhattan Community College President Anthony Perez stated that the first proposed change to the governance plans deals with CLT representation. There were two provisions that duplicated representation and this will eliminate the duplication. The next change deals with how adjuncts are selected to be delegates to the college governance body, making the process less cumbersome and changing the term of office from one year to three. The next change establishes that the executive committee of the college council should be comprised in the same manner as the executive committee of the academic senate, providing faculty to serve on committees. The last change eliminates a sentence in the governance plan that required every committee of the academic senate to have an equal number of faculty. Some committees require more members than others and this change gives the committee on committees the latitude to appoint people to the standing committees based on need.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.
7. Naming of The Lanza Family Medical Simulation Lab at Borough of Manhattan Community College (Attachment I-B-7). Borough of Manhattan Community College President Perez gave an oral presentation on this item. Following discussion this item was approved for submission to the Board.

8. Naming of the Herbert Kurz '41 Chair in Constitutional Rights at Brooklyn College (Attachment I-B-8). Brooklyn College President Karen Gould gave an oral presentation on this item. Following discussion this item was approved for submission to the Board.

9. Revisions to Governance Plan of the Graduate Center (Attachment I-B-9). Senior Vice Chancellor and General Counsel Schaffer stated that this resolution is another revision to the governance plan of the University Center, this time to establish the Macaulay Honors College as a unit within the University Center. Over the last nine years the Macaulay Honors College has operated with great distinction as a joint program involving a number of CUNY's undergraduate colleges. This resolution establishes Macaulay Honors College formally as a unit with a governance plan. As a result the Macaulay Honors College will be able to offer joint undergraduate degrees with participating colleges. Approval of curricular programs and the awarding of undergraduate degrees will require action by both the governing bodies of the Macaulay Honors College and each of the participating colleges.

Committee Member Baumrin stated that the Bylaws of the University require that the University Faculty Senate be involved in the origination of governance plans of University-wide programs. When the Macaulay Honors College was created it was not yet a University-wide program so it made sense for its originating resolution not to have gone to the Senate for consideration. This resolution creates it as a University-wide body and should have been shared with the Senate before coming to the Committee. Secondly, the document as presented does not integrate in any way the connection between the Macaulay Honors College and the Graduate School and University Center.

Committee Member Baumrin stated that the constitution of the consortial faculty in the document is unworkable. The faculty consists of annual appointees. Hence, their experience in that teaching role is not going to function necessarily to inform planning, curriculum revision, admission standards, etc. for the years subsequent. The Graduate School when it was created established the concept of consortial faculty with each appointee remaining on the faculty for two years succeeding the year of their active service. It would be basically impossible for the committees to operate successfully because by the time they were beginning to operate in September they would not actually have a faculty member, and if they were then operating in the spring they would be operating with a faculty member whose position would go out of existence at commencement. He recommended that the item be withdrawn for reconsideration.

Senior Vice Chancellor and General Counsel Schaffer stated that, as with all governance plans, the administration had provided a copy of the draft governance plan to the chairperson of the University Faculty Senate. Second, this is not the first unit created under the umbrella of the University Center in which the president of the Graduate School and University Center plays no role in the appointment of the dean. That is true of the Dean of the Graduate School of Journalism and the Dean of the School of Professional Studies. Finally, with respect to the faculty, faculty who teach at the Macaulay Honors College generally agree to do so for two or three years so there is a fair degree of continuity. Governance plans are living documents and they grow and change as the
institution grows and changes. The structure of Macaulay Honors College right now is a simple consoritual one and this simple and streamlined governance structure is the right structure for Macaulay Honors College as it exists today. If problems arise, the University will come back and address them as it goes forward.

Committee Member Baumrin stated that to say that the governance plan can be fixed later, when there is an obvious flaw right now makes no sense. It does not appear that it will work as a living document, because if it takes three or four or five meetings to make an amendment, and if there are only four meetings a year, there is no guarantee it could be amended at all.

Trustee Philipp stated that there are two issues here, the issue of process and the issue of the document itself, but that they are intertwined. The University Faculty Senate takes it seriously when it gets a document like this. This was not on the agenda of this meeting at the time when the UFS held pre-meetings with the vice chancellors, and therefore was not high on the UFS priority list. With limited resources there was not time to consider it in an adequate way—consideration which includes consultation with college senates. Governance documents are important, but this one is being treated as if it were a throwaway document. He suggested that action be delayed until there can be serious consideration of the document.

Chancellor Goldstein stated that the University Center is a shell that gives degree granting responsibility to the elements that become part of that shell, which is what is being sought here. What the Macaulay Honors College is doing is nothing more than adopting the curriculum that each individual college’s governance body has adopted. The faculty at each of the institutions has already acted. If in the future the Macaulay Honors College wishes to adopt its own curriculum, that is something different—but that is not being asked for at this time.

Committee Chair Beal asked Senior Vice Chancellor and General Counsel Schaffer to work with the UFS before the full Board meeting to address its concerns.

Chancellor Goldstein stated that the voices of the college senates have already been heard on all of the curricula and the other factors involved.

Trustee Philipp stated governance documents not only deal with curriculum, they create structures that protect academic freedom and deal with hiring practices.

In response to a question, Chancellor Goldstein stated that these joint degrees will be awarded not to current students, but only to students admitted after the governance plan revisions are adopted by the full Board.

Committee Chair Beal noted that if the item is tabled at this meeting the revisions would not likely apply to students admitted in the coming fall semester.

Committee Member Robles-Roman stated her agreement with the substance of the revisions, but noted a concern over even the perception of a lack of consultation with the University Faculty Senate.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board with Committee Members Stefan Baumrin and Carol A. Robles-Roman abstained.
C. CHANCELLOR’S UNIVERSITY REPORT

1. Appointment of Stephen E. Joyner as Vice President for Enrollment Management at Brooklyn College, effective June 1, 2010. (Attachment I-C-1). Brooklyn College President Karen Gould gave an oral presentation on this item. Following discussion this item was approved for submission to the Board.

2. Appointment of Lloyd S. Blanchard as Senior Vice President and Chief Operations Officer at Medgar Evers College, effective April 8, 2010. (Attachment I-C-2). Medgar Evers College President William Pollard gave an oral presentation on this item. Following discussion this item was approved for submission to the Board.

3. Appointment of Carmen Coballes-Vega as Vice President for Academic Affairs and Provost at Hostos Community College, effective July 1, 2010. (Attachment I-C-3). Dr. Felix Matos Rodríguez gave an oral presentation on this item. Following discussion this item was approved for submission to the Board.

4. Appointment of Dr. Thomas Matte as Professor with Tenure in the School of the Health Professions at Hunter College, with waiver of §6.2.d.(2) of the Bylaws, effective February 1, 2010. (Attachment I-C-4).

5. Reappointment of Dr. Lorna Thorpe as Associate Professor with Early Tenure in the School of the Health Professions at Hunter College, with waiver of §6.2.d.(2) of the Bylaws, effective September 1, 2010. (Attachment I-C-5)

Mr. Kenneth Norz of the Office of Academic Affairs gave an oral presentation on Items I.C.4 and I.C.5. Following discussion Items I.C.4 and I.C.5 were approved for submission to the Board.

II. INFORMATION ITEMS:

A-F. Appointment with Immediate Tenure pursuant to §6.2.c. of the Bylaws.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>College</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Previous Tenure</th>
<th>Effective Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. City</td>
<td>Rajan Menon</td>
<td>Political Science</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Lehigh University</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Graduate Center</td>
<td>Alva Nöe</td>
<td>Philosophy</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>University of California at Berkeley</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Graduate Center</td>
<td>Paul Julian</td>
<td>Hispanic and Luso-Brazilian Literatures and Languages</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>University of Cambridge</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Graduate Center</td>
<td>Uday Singh</td>
<td>Political Science</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Amherst College</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Graduate Center</td>
<td>Ruth Wilson</td>
<td>Earth and Environmental Sciences</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>University of Southern California</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. School of Law</td>
<td>Penelope Andrews</td>
<td>Law</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Valparaiso School of Law</td>
<td>August 2, 2010</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
G-O. Reappointment with Early Tenure pursuant to § 6.2.D of the Bylaws.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>College</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Basis for Action</th>
<th>Effective Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>G.</td>
<td>Jamal Jalilian-Marian</td>
<td>Natural Sciences</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>Best Interests of the College</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H.</td>
<td>Vilna Treitler</td>
<td>Black &amp; Hispanic Studies</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>Best Interests of the College</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>Donna Gitter</td>
<td>Law, Zicklin School of Business</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>Best Interests of the College</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J.</td>
<td>Nicole Marwell</td>
<td>School of Public Affairs &amp; Planning</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>Best Interests of the College</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K.</td>
<td>Isolina Balesteros</td>
<td>Modern Languages &amp; Comparative Literature</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>Best Interests of the College</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.</td>
<td>David John Connor</td>
<td>Special Education</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>Best Interests of the College</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M.</td>
<td>Peter Marcotullio</td>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>Best Interests of the College</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N.</td>
<td>John Chin</td>
<td>Urban Affairs &amp; Planning</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>Best Interests of the College</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O.</td>
<td>Geoffrey Burleson</td>
<td>Music</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>Best Interests of the College</td>
<td>Sept. 1, 2010</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q. Appointment with Waiver of §11.11.B. of the Bylaws.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>College</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Requirement Waived / Basis for Action</th>
<th>Effective Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q. Queens</td>
<td>Billy Hart</td>
<td>Aaron Copeland School of Music</td>
<td>Adjunct Associate Professor</td>
<td>Ph.D. / Best Interests of the College</td>
<td>Jan. 28, 2010</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

R. Report of the Vice Chancellor

Vice Chancellor Waters stated that the first item on her report was the computer monitoring report which will be presented by Vice Chancellor Schaffer.

Senior Vice Chancellor and General Counsel Schaffer stated that under the policy related to the use of computer resources at the University he is requested to report each year as to how many instances occurred during the prior year when the University viewed the contents of a particular computer as an exception to the policy that the University does not routinely monitor computer use. In the past year there were two such instances; neither involved the computer hard drive of a faculty member.

Vice Chancellor Waters stated that this year, for the first time, the affirmative action summary data report will be produced by CUNY First. The following are preliminary numbers: On the instructional staff, the number of employees has risen by 11% or 1,164 individuals. Women are currently 51.5% of the instructional staff and total minority representation has risen from 37.9% in 2007 to 39.3% in 2009. On the classified staff side the number of employees grew by 322, which is a 5.8% change between 2007 and 2009. White collar workers increased by 281, blue collar employees rose from 1,734 to 1,792, and our skilled trades group declined slightly from 746 to
732 employees. Females in the classified staff increased slightly from 2,651 in 2007 to 2,820 in 2009 and the representation of minority groups changed from 67.9% to 68.7%. On the faculty the total number was 7,186, an increase of 627 since 2007. Women held a total of 3,358 appointments, an increase of 348, which is 11.6%. And total minorities rose by 289 to 2,274, which represents an increase from 30.3% to 31.6%. In the professoriate, the total minority representation rose 12.4%.

In response to a question, Vice Chancellor Waters confirmed that the faculty numbers represented full time faculty.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:23 p.m.