

BOARD OF TRUSTEES
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING
JUNE 2, 2014

The meeting was called to order at 4:04 p.m.

There were present:

Committee Members:

Hon. Joseph J. Lhota, Chair
Hon. Peter S. Pantaleo, Vice Chair
Hon. Valerie L. Beal
Hon. Carol A. Robles-Roman
Hon. Barry F. Schwartz
Hon. Terrence F. Martell, faculty member
Mr. David Rosenberg, student member

University Staff:

Chancellor James B. Milliken
Executive Vice Chancellor and Chief Operating
Officer Allan H. Dobrin
Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza
Chief Investment Officer Janet Krone
University Controller Leonard Zinnanti
University Deputy Controller Miriam Katowitz

Ex-officio:

Chairperson Benno Schmidt
Vice Chairperson Philip Alfonso Berry

Trustee Staff:

Senior Vice Chancellor and Secretary of the
Board Jay Hershenson
General Counsel and Senior Vice Chancellor
Frederick P. Schaffer
Deputy to the Secretary Hourig Messerlian
Mr. Steven Quinn

Cal. No.	DISPOSITION
-----------------	--------------------

Committee Chair Joseph Lhota welcomed Chancellor James Milliken to the meeting.

The agenda items were considered and acted upon in the following order:

I. ACTION ITEMS:

A. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF APRIL 7, 2014.** The minutes were approved as submitted.

B. **POLICY CALENDAR**

1. LaGuardia Community College – Building Maintenance Services. Committee Chair Lhota asked that the Committee approve this resolution to authorize the General Counsel to execute a contract on behalf of LaGuardia Community College to purchase building maintenance services. The contract shall be awarded to the lowest responsive and responsible bidder after public advertisement and sealed bidding by the College pursuant to law and University regulations. Such purchase shall not exceed a total estimated cost of \$3.2 million for the first year of the five-year term, chargeable during fiscal years 2014-2015 and 2015-2016. The contract shall include the right for the University to terminate the contract in its best interest.

Following discussion, this item was approved for submission to the Board.

2. Baruch College – MPA Program Excellence Fee. Committee Chair Lhota asked that the Committee approve this resolution requesting that The City University of New York adopt an academic excellence fee of \$500 per semester for students in the MPA Program at the

BOARD OF TRUSTEES
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING
JUNE 2, 2014

Baruch College School of Public Affairs, effective in the Fall 2014 semester. This fee will permit greater support for career services, scholarships, and graduate assistantship support, and it will also support greater academic capacity overall. As with current academic excellence fee spending in the School of Public Affairs, the large majority will go to direct student services.

In response to a question from Trustee Barry Schwartz, Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza stated that Baruch College has had academic excellence fees for the last several years in the graduate degree programs and all the revenues from the fees have been specifically reinvested back into those programs. Most of the funds go to direct student services and for student scholarships, yet some of the funds are used for additional faculty. But 100 percent of the dollars are mandated to go back into those individual programs that the students are paying additional funds for. This academic excellence fee for the MPA program at the School of Public Affairs would bring consistency with the other graduate programs at Baruch College, and specifically with the other graduate programs in the School of Public Affairs. The MPA program at the School of Public Affairs is an outstanding program with great student outcomes in terms of employment after graduation, thus this fee is fair and equitable.

In response to a question from Chairperson Benno Schmidt, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that the MBA program at Baruch College also has an academic excellence fee of \$500.

In response to a question from Trustee Valerie Beal, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that as per state law the same tuition rates have to be applied for like degrees, so CUNY has had to charge the same tuition rate for all MPA programs, all MBA programs, and all masters of arts programs within the University. This is a way to acknowledge that there is value in certain programs at the University, although the degree offering is the same.

Trustee Beal stated that she assumes that CUNY does this fee because it does not have the ability to differentiate in terms of tuitions at the graduate level and the fees are more representative of probably what should be inclusive in tuitions. She added that she hopes the University will move one day towards being able to have tuitions reflective of the differentiation.

Following discussion, this item was approved for submission to the Board.

II. INFORMATION ITEMS:

A. FY 2015 New York City Executive Budget

REPORT BY VICE CHANCELLOR MATTHEW SAPIENZA

In response to a question from Chairperson Schmidt, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that most of the \$7.4 million will be for the expansion of ASAP and a small portion of it will be for the STEM program. CUNY has planned for the expansion of ASAP for the last three years. In the fall of 2014, CUNY will have added 4,000 students to the ASAP program. This year CUNY had about 3,200 students, of which 800 are new students. This does not include the Stella and Charles Guttman Community College students. However, Chairperson Schmidt raised a really good point that when Guttman Community College was conceived it was tailored after the ASAP program so a lot of the support that is there for ASAP students, is available for Guttman students as well. It is a similar model, but the funding for those students is not in the ASAP budget, it is separately funded by the city.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING
JUNE 2, 2014

In response to another question from Chairperson Schmidt, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that the \$7.4 million for next year will grow to \$35 million for fiscal year 2017, so of that \$51 million in 2017, \$35 million is for ASAP. The only concern CUNY has with ASAP is how to scale it up. The fact that the mayor has put in the funding is going to help the University plan for that expansion going forward. The initial differential of the program since it started was about \$6,000 per student more than it was for a traditional community college student. CUNY has been able to bring that number down as the program keeps growing due to scale and administrative efficiencies. The number has come down to about \$4,000 per student and the University hopes to continue to bring that gap down.

Chairperson Schmidt stated that if ASAP continues to show better outcomes in terms of student credit retention and ultimately graduation success, it needs to figure out how to expand the program so that all community college students can benefit. As a fiduciary matter, if some of the students in programs are doing well—twice the success rate or more—CUNY will make it available to all the students. He added that it is great that the Mayor has put in this additional ASAP funding but the University should be looking for ways to continuously expand this program and bring up the very low community college success rate—up to 50% or better. It is less money per completed degree in ASAP per student but it is more money on a yearly basis.

Trustee Barry Schwartz stated that he shares Chairperson Schmidt's conviction and desire to get ASAP more widely funded.

In response to a question from Trustee Schwartz, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that all of these items were part of a proposal that CUNY put together and submitted to the Mayor. The request was more than the \$51 million that ended up being funded.

In response to another question from Trustee Schwartz, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that the Civic Justice Corps Program at John Jay College is something that was started under Mayor Bloomberg. He had a Commission on Economic Opportunity (CEO) and they funded various programs throughout the city and at CUNY, that provided funds for the Civic Justice Corps. This program was created for individuals who are coming out of incarceration, to help them not only with academic support, but also with vocational support in terms of finding jobs. It has been a terrific program at John Jay and the University is pleased to see that this support will continue for next year. He added that he would like to give credit to John Jay College and President Jeremy Travis, one of the leading experts in New York State and in the entire country about this topic and reducing recidivism.

Chairperson Schmidt stated that this Committee should bring this matter back as an information item at another scheduled meeting because it goes beyond John Jay College, so that each member will get the full scope of CUNY activities for the incarcerated.

In response to a question from Trustee Beal, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that ASAP is available at all the community colleges. Next year, ASAP will be at Medgar Evers College for the first time—the first senior college that will have this program. CUNY is pleased about this because the majority of students who enter Medgar Evers College are associate degree-seeking students—something that President Crew lobbied for. In addition to the 4,000 ASAP students at community colleges, there will be 300 students at Medgar Evers College for the initial ASAP program this coming fall.

Chairperson Schmidt stated that the key concern of ASAP is improving completion rates in community colleges in which forty percent of its students attend so if the University could double its completion rate, it would be huge. As an effort, CUNY's focus should be on

BOARD OF TRUSTEES
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING
JUNE 2, 2014

community college success in terms of improvement and productivity in public higher education, and as a result CUNY will be doing the country a tremendous service by providing an example that works.

In response to a question from Committee Chair Lhota, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that the \$15 million that has been added to the budget by the Mayor, is permanent and not just a one-time deal.

The public meeting was adjourned at 4:28 p.m.