

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
JUNE 1, 2015

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 p.m.

There were present:

**Committee Members:**

Hon. Joseph J. Lhota, Chair  
Hon. Peter S. Pantaleo, Vice Chair  
Hon. Valerie L. Beal  
Hon. Barry F. Schwartz  
Hon. Terrence F. Martell, faculty member  
Ms. Mariam Jakhshvili, student alternate  
President Felix V. Matos Rodriguez, COP Liaison

**University Staff:**

Chancellor James B. Milliken  
Executive Vice Chancellor and Chief Operating  
Officer Allan H. Dobrin  
Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza  
Senior Advisor Marc V. Shaw

**Ex-officio:**

Hon. Philip A. Berry

**Observer:**

Prof. Kay Conway

**Trustee Staff:**

Senior Vice Chancellor and Secretary of the  
Board Jay Hershenson  
General Counsel and Senior Vice Chancellor  
Frederick P. Schaffer  
Ms. Towanda Lewis  
Mr. Anthony Vargas

---

<b>Cal. No.</b>	<b>DISPOSITION</b>
-----------------	--------------------

---

The agenda items were considered and acted upon in the following order:

**I. ACTION ITEMS:**

**A. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF APRIL 6, 2015.** The minutes were approved as submitted.

**B. POLICY CALENDAR**

1. Queens College – Academic Excellence Fees: Aaron Copeland School of Music, Department of Economics, Department of Linguistics and Communications Disorders, Department of Psychology, and Department of Sociology. Committee Chair Joseph Lhota asked for the Committee's approval to adopt a schedule of academic excellence fees for students in certain graduate level programs at Queens College, effective with the Fall 2015 semester. Revenue from the proposed fees will be returned directly to the respective programs. The selected programs will remain very affordable in comparison to other programs in the metropolitan area. The College will continue to administer financial aid to assist students with the completion of their studies. The Aaron Copeland School of Music (MM, MA, MS degrees, Advance Certificate Programs in Music Performance, and Music Education) proposed fee will be \$150 per semester for a student enrolled in one to five credits, and \$300 per semester for a student enrolled in six or more credits. The Department of Economics (MS in Risk Management) will have a proposed fee of \$500 per student per academic semester. The Department of Linguistics and Communication Disorders (MA in Applied Linguistics, MS in Education in TESOL, Post-Masters Advance Certificate in TESOL, Advanced Certificate in

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
JUNE 1, 2015

English Language Teaching, Post-Masters program in TESOL and Bilingual Education, and MA in Speech-Language Pathology) proposed fee for the MA in Speech-Language Pathology will be \$500 per semester per full-time or part-time students. All other programs will be \$25 per credit for full-time and part-time students. The Department of Psychology (Advanced Certificate in Applied Behavioral Analysis) proposed fee will be \$150 per semester for full- and part-time students; and the Department of Sociology (MA in Data Analytics and Applied Social Research Master's program) will have a proposed fee for full-time and part-time students at \$50 per graduate credit hour, up to a maximum of \$1,500 per student.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

2. John Jay College of Criminal Justice – Academic Excellence Fees: MA in Forensic Psychology, MA in Forensic Mental Health Counseling, Post Graduate Certificate in Forensic Psychology, and MA-JD Dual Degree with NY Law School. Committee Chair Lhota asked for the Committee's approval to adopt an excellence fee to allow John Jay College to successfully compete for highly prepared students in this increasingly competitive market. Moreover, it will permit the College to provide a level of support students seek in a rigorous plan of study, which will bolster the students' academic achievement and further accomplishment of their career goals. The proposed programs are the MA program in Forensic Psychology, the MA program in Forensic Mental Health Counseling, the Postgraduate Certificate in Forensic Psychology, and the MA-JD Dual Degree Program with NY Law School. This will represent a semester increase of \$125 for every three credits, for a maximum of \$500 for a full-time course load of 12 credits.

Following discussion, the following revision was accepted as a friendly amendment and approved for submission to the Board by unanimous consent: Explanation section of the resolution; the third (to fourth) sentence to read: The Excellence Fee will ~~allow the college to successfully compete for highly prepared students for these programs in an increasingly competitive market. Moreover, it will permit the college . . . .~~

3. Brooklyn College – Private Music Lesson Fees: Private Lessons in Music Performance, MM Private Lessons in Music Performance, Private Lessons in Advance Certificate in Music Performance, and Private Lessons in Advanced Diploma in Music Performance. Committee Chair Lhota asked for the Committee's approval to maintain and strengthen the quality of Brooklyn College's music instruction, by authorizing the establishment of a fee for Private Music Lessons. It is quite common at other institutions, for both public and private schools, to charge an extra fee for private lessons. The proposed fee would apply for the following programs: Private Lessons in Music Performance; MM Private Lessons in Music Performance; Advanced Certificate in Music Performance Private Lessons; and Advanced Diploma in Music Performance Private Lessons. The proposed \$250 fee will be added to each registration.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

4. CUNY School of Law – Revised Schedule of Material Fees. Committee Chair Lhota asked for the Committee's approval to adopt a revised schedule of Material Fees for students in the full-time and part-time Juris Doctor programs at the CUNY School of Law, effective with the Fall 2015 semester. The CUNY School of Law currently charges all students a Material Fee that includes the cost of textbooks, which are purchased and distributed by the School. Effective Fall 2015, the School will be eliminating its bookstore and partnering with an online textbook retailer, allowing students the freedom to select and purchase textbooks on their own. As the School will no longer require Material Fees revenue to support textbook distribution, the proposed fee schedule reflects the remaining expenses currently covered by the Material Fees, including the cost of one-time expenses, such as printing diplomas and

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
JUNE 1, 2015

---

recurring expenses, such as student ID card allocation each semester. The proposed changes to the fee schedule are contained in the resolution.

In response to a question from Trustee Barry Schwartz, Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza stated that this resolution is a great example of colleges learning from best practices used by other campuses. This year, John Jay College eliminated their physical bookstore, and entered into an agreement with a partner organization, Akademos, to be the online bookstore provider to its students. This is a radical change given the online bookstore, but the administration, faculty and students have all given very positive feedback to that change as it has helped the students in terms of having a larger network from where to buy their books, helping to direct them to various places where they can purchase books online, and, overall, helping them save money in terms of what they are paying for their textbooks. Historically, the CUNY School of Law has always charged \$700 to its students for the purchase of textbooks; however, by being able to partner with this outside organization, the Material Fees will be reduced significantly.

In response to a question from Committee Chair Lhota, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that the CUNY School of Law has selected Akademos as their online bookstore provider, the same firm that John Jay College has partnered with.

In response to a question from Trustee Schwartz, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that in terms of utilization of space at the CUNY School of Law, it did not have a physical bookstore. The School purchased the books for the students so overall this is a great benefit to the students.

In response to a question from Trustee Valerie Beal, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that the School's expectation is that this will save the students money at the end of each term.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

5. The City University of New York – Purchase and Delivery of Computer-Based Remedial Tests. Committee Chair Lhota asked for the Committee's approval to authorize the General Counsel to execute a contract on behalf of the University for the purchase and delivery of computer-based remedial tests. The initial term shall be three years with two one-year options for the University to renew in its best interest. Such services shall not exceed a total estimated cost of \$1,215,000. CUNY requires these tests to assess the college readiness of post high school level students to determine a student's level of proficiency in reading, writing, and mathematics.

In response to a question from Committee Chair Lhota, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that The City University of New York has had multi-year agreements for computer-based remedial tests in the past; however, the last agreement is expiring.

In response to a question from Trustee Beal, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that the cost per unit is \$2.00 per exam per student. The annual cost is going to be about \$243,000. In the previous contract, it was about \$170,000, so the cost of the contract will have an increase of over \$65,000, but one of the benefits of this new agreement is that it will be web-based so each college will be able to monitor exam scores for a much better functionality. The prior exam was a Windows-based platform.

In response to a question from Trustee Schwartz, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that not all incoming students take this test. It all depends on their SAT and Regent scores.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
JUNE 1, 2015

---

In response to a question from Trustee Beal, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that this computer-based remedial test will determine if the students have remedial needs; it is not an admissions test.

In response to another question from Trustee Beal, University Dean David Crook stated that CUNY has been developing its own homegrown test to determine readiness to exit remediation. He added that this test has been gradually saving the University money from having to buy commercial tests.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

6. LaGuardia Community College – Purchase of VAV Devices for HVAC System. Committee Chair Lhota asked for the Committee's approval to authorize the General Counsel to execute a contract on behalf of LaGuardia Community College to purchase and replace existing variable air volume (VAV) devices, part of the building's HVAC system. Such purchase shall not exceed a total estimated cost of \$1 million. The new VAV boxes will lead to an estimated annual cost savings of \$122,662, arising from electricity conserved and significant reduction in wear and tear of the equipment and the need for repair and replacement.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

7. The City University of New York (Macaulay Honors College) – Gift from the Estate of Joseph M. Schor. Committee Chair Lhota asked for the Committee's approval to accept a gift of approximately \$1.5 million from the estate of Joseph M. Schor for the benefit of students of Macaulay Honors College whose home campus is Queens College or City College. Dr. Joseph Schor was a City College alumnus, a biochemist and a former executive of Forest Laboratories. His family's connections to the University run deep. He is the late husband of Dr. Laura Schor, the founding dean of Macaulay Honors College and former provost of Hunter College. In addition, Dr. Schor's first wife, Sandra Schor, was an alumna and honored faculty member of Queens College. Commemorating the dedication and commitment of the Schor family to CUNY, this gift will support the Opportunities Fund for Macaulay Honors College students on the campuses of Queens and City Colleges.

In response to a question from Trustee Schwartz, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that Macaulay Honors College will invest and administer these funds; however, the gift specifies that it be split evenly for Macaulay Honors College students at Queens and City Colleges.

In response to another question from Trustee Schwartz, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that in terms of what happens with the foundations, the University certainly encourages funds to go through CUNY's investment pool, but it is up to the individual foundation to determine that.

In response to a question from Trustee Beal, General Counsel and Senior Vice Chancellor Frederick Schaffer stated that this resolution is going through the Committee on Fiscal Affairs because it is not a naming, just a gift.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

8. The City University of New York (Macaulay Honors College) – Gift from the Anthony E. Meyer Family Foundation. Committee Chair Lhota asked for the Committee's approval to accept a gift of \$1 million from the Anthony E. Meyer Family Foundation in support of the Opportunities Fund at Macaulay Honors College. In recognition of this generous gift, the College will establish the Meyer Scholars Fund. Anthony Meyer is an entrepreneur, private investor, and philanthropist. He currently serves as the Vice Chairman of the Macaulay Honors College Foundation Board and leads its Development Committee. He has also been named as

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
JUNE 1, 2015

---

entrepreneur in residence. Commemorating the dedication and commitment of Mr. Meyer and his family to CUNY, this gift will support the co-curricular activities provided through the Opportunities Fund for Macaulay Honors College students.

Committee Vice Chair Peter Pantaleo noted that while this Committee is concerned about the investment and the management of these very generous gifts, no one should mistake it in any way as to diminishing the University's deep appreciation for these generous gifts.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

**II. INFORMATION ITEMS:**

**A. FY2016 City Executive Budget**

\*\*\*REPORT BY VICE CHANCELLOR MATTHEW SAPIENZA\*\*\*

The public meeting was adjourned at 5:29 p.m.