The meeting was called to order at 4:52 p.m.

There were present:

**Committee Members:**
- Hon. Joseph J. Lhota, Chair
- Hon. Peter S. Pantaleo, Vice Chair
- Hon. Valerie L. Beal
- Hon. Kathleen M. Pesile
- Prof. Terrence Martell, faculty member
- Mr. Jermaine Morris, student member
- President James Muyskens, COP liaison

**University Staff:**
- Chancellor Matthew Goldstein
- Executive Vice Chancellor and Chief Operating Officer Allan Dobrin
- Senior Vice Chancellor Marc Shaw
- Associate Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza
- University Controller Barry Kaufman
- Chief Investment Officer Janet Krone
- University Deputy Executive Controller Miriam Katowitz

**Ex-officio:**
- Hon. Benno Schmidt

**Trustee Observer:**
- Hon. Sandi E. Cooper
- Hon. Kafui K. Kouakou

**Trustee Staff:**
- Senior Vice Chancellor and Secretary of the Board Jay Hershenson
- General Council and Senior Vice Chancellor Frederick P. Schaffer
- Mr. Steven Quinn

The agenda items were considered in the following order:

**I. ACTION ITEMS:**

**A. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF FEBRUARY 6, 2012.** The minutes were approved as amended, as follows: under the SUBCOMMITTEE ON AUDIT section, IV. INFORMATION ITEMS: A. 2011 Audit of Auxiliary Enterprise Corporations and College Associations, the third full paragraph is revised to “In response to a question from Professor Terrence Martell with reference to the citing of three weaknesses in two different institutions, Mr. Douglas Zimmerman noted that his firm adjusted its 2011 audit plan as part of the 2011 Audit.”

**B. John Jay College of Criminal Justice – NYC Justice Corps Procurement.** Following discussion, the item was unanimously approved for submission to the Board.

**C. The City University of New York – CUNY Career Path Tuition Waivers.** Following discussion, the item was unanimously approved for submission to the Board.

**D. College of Staten Island – Bus Transportation Services.** In response to a question regarding the sources of funding for the proposed contract, Associate Vice Chancellor
Sapienza stated that the college currently has three separate contracts through for transportation services: one to go from the ferry terminal to the campus, one for the loop on the campus, and one for bus services for special events like sporting events. This RFP is to consolidate all of those contracts into one contract, so all the funding that's necessary for this RFP is already incorporated in the college's and the association's budget.

In response to a question regarding the potential in the future of the college purchasing its own bus and operating it to save money, Associate Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that with maintenance and upkeep of the bus he did not know if there would be any savings from that. The University will always look at ways to try to be more efficient and find savings.

Following discussion, the item was unanimously approved for submission to the Board.

II. INFORMATION ITEMS:

A. Report by Associate Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza


***PRESENTATION BY ASSOCIATE VICE CHANCELLOR MATTHEW SAPIENZA***

Chancellor Matthew Goldstein stated that the presidents were informed that the University will be doing iteration two of the community college investment program which was started in fiscal year 2003 through 2004. The presidents were asked to work with their faculties, with their students, to give the administration guidance on how best those funds can be utilized. It is going to be a wonderful new addition for revenue to support more faculty hiring, more academic support services, greater instrumentation in laboratories, more technology. This is going to be a very good thing for the community colleges. The University worked hard for that $150 base aid increase. In its budget the University asked for a minimum of $100, getting the $150 is a real windfall for CUNY.

Chairperson Benno Schmidt stated that back in October–November when the University was putting together the budget, he was quite worried about the economic condition in Albany. This is far beyond what was expected. I didn't think we would be in this position and it is good to be in this position.

In response to a question regarding changes to Pell Grant eligibility, Associate Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that University financial aid folks have run the data and think that there could be well over 1,000 students who currently have Pell eligibility that will be affected. That doesn't mean that they will all lose eligibility but some of them may not be eligible for the maximum award. Some of them may lose eligibility altogether. The administration can certainly provide the details on who is affected and some of the data by campus.

Vice Chairperson Philip Berry stated his hope that there is a plan to proactively work with students to help them understand and look at options and alternatives as opposed to just waiting for them to come to CUNY staff.

Associate Vice Chancellor Sapienza noted that the University has already committed to, and the Board of Trustees approved back in November, implementation of a student financial assistance program. The University is going to set aside $5 million next year,
part of which will go toward direct student financial aid to help students who may lose their Pell eligibility. Part of that $5 million will go toward the textbook initiative and some of it will go toward additional work study programs. The administration is hopeful that whatever students might lose, the University will be able to bridge the gap with this $5 million initiative.

In response to a question regarding changes to the State mandated remediation study, Associate Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that the study does not include the K through 12 educators who are initially responsible for educating those students. Maybe something will come out of the study that you create a part two. As of now it is just higher education, just CUNY and SUNY.

Trustee Valerie Beal stated her strong belief that we need to hold K through 12 responsible. CUNY is willing and able and always anxious to do what higher education is supposed to do, but I would hate to see those responsibilities shift dramatically.

Chancellor Goldstein stated that Commissioner King was here two weeks ago when we met with the presidents for a full day discussion on various areas. He is supportive of putting the burden back on the various school districts where that focus of responsibility should reside. He will be a part of the commission or task force whenever it is fully staffed and we will be there as strong advocates for that because we understand where the problem resides.

In response to a question regarding the makeup of the task force, Chancellor Goldstein stated that that is something the University can only make recommendations on. It will be formed outside of the university.

In response to a question Associate Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that community college charge-backs do not occur internal to New York City or within the CUNY system.

Trustee Sandi Cooper stated that faculty have struggled with the remediation issue as long as she has been at CUNY. In the 1990's, maybe '91, there was launched something called a college preparatory initiative, which was supposed to have professors go down into the 9th grade and start campaigning for what ought to be taken to prepare for college. It was dropped when the Regents decided to change the standards for passing the Regents. The belief was that the Regents initiative would obviate the need for the CPI. If anybody has the energy to do it, it might be valuable to go back to that other practice—or attempt, it was not really developed. The effect of bridge programs between the math department at Bronx College and the high schools in that borough was fairly successful.

Chancellor Goldstein stated that in conversations with the people who pushed this remediation task force in the Legislature have openly acknowledged that CUNY by far is the most innovative leader in the State of New York as it relates to remediation.

Chancellor Goldstein noted that the University spends $30 million a year in its budget doing things that should be done in the high schools. SUNY spends $50 or $60 million. And those dollars could be much better utilized.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:24 p.m.