

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
NOVEMBER 2, 2015

The meeting was called to order at 4:50 p.m.

There were present:

**Committee Members:**

Hon. Barry Schwartz, Chair  
Hon. Peter S. Pantaleo, Vice Chair  
Hon. Valerie L. Beal  
Hon. Una S. T-Clarke  
Hon. Carol A. Robles-Roman  
Hon. Terrence F. Martell, faculty member  
Ms. Cecilia Salvi, student member  
President Felix V. Matos Rodriguez, COP Liaison

**University Staff:**

Chancellor James B. Milliken  
Executive Vice Chancellor and Chief Operating  
Officer Allan H. Dobrin  
Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza  
Vice Chancellor Frank Sánchez  
Vice Chancellor Brian Cohen  
Senior University Dean/Special Counsel to the  
Chancellor Dave Fields  
University Budget Director Catherine Abata

**Ex-officio:**

Hon. Benno Schmidt

**Trustee Observer:**

Hon. Joseph K. Awadje

**Observer:**

Prof. Kay Conway

**Trustee Staff:**

Senior Vice Chancellor and Secretary of the  
Board Jay Hershenson  
Ms. Towanda Lewis  
Ms. Fenella Ramsami  
Mr. Anthony Vargas

---

**Cal. No.**

**DISPOSITION**

---

The agenda items were considered and acted upon in the following order:

**I. ACTION ITEMS:**

**A. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 9, 2015.** The minutes were approved as submitted.

**B. POLICY CALENDAR**

1. The City University of New York – Tuition for the Doctor of Medicine in Medical Education at the CUNY School of Medicine. Committee Chair Barry Schwartz asked for the Committee's approval of a revised schedule of tuition charges for the Doctor of Medicine in Medical Education at City College. The proposed tuition at the CUNY School of Medicine is \$38,000 per year for full-time resident students and \$63,260 per year for full-time non-resident students. The tuition rate is the same as the rate charged by the State University of New York (SUNY Downstate) system for its medical school. The entire tuition will be retained by the CUNY School of Medicine to fund direct costs of the degree program, and the student activity fee schedule is the same rate as that charged to all other graduate students at City College and will be retained by the CUNY School of Medicine to benefit its students.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
NOVEMBER 2, 2015

---

In response to a question from Committee Chair Schwartz, City College Provost Maurizio Trevisan stated that one of the challenges that City College was facing was trying to establish the CUNY School of Medicine with appropriate funding without impacting the funding of the College, and that philosophically and problematically it would be good to match the tuition of the medical school to the other states. There are four SUNY medical schools: SUNY Downstate Medical Center; University at Buffalo; Syracuse University; and Stony Brook University, and they all charge exactly the same amount of tuition so the College decided that this would be appropriate, being a state school, to be tied to their tuition. It will allow City College to generate the appropriate resources that it needs in order to support accreditation.

In response to a question from University Faculty Senate (UFS) Chair and Trustee Terrence Martell, Provost Trevisan stated that the \$1.45 senate fee represents a similar fee other students have at City College.

In response to a question from Prof. Kay Conway, City College Provost Trevisan stated that there will be no limitations on out-of-state versus in-state student attendees. He added that historically in the last 43 years, the College has never had an out-of-state student.

Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza stated that for clarification purposes, the CUNY School of Medicine did set its tuition rate to the SUNY rate, but the tuition is not going to be sufficient to cover its expected costs so the College will be requesting funds for its medical school in the FY2016-2017 Operating Budget Request, to help cover all the costs for the new school.

In response to a question from Committee Chair Schwartz, City College Provost Trevisan stated that the College contemplates 70 students for each class of the CUNY School of Medicine. He added that students are recruited from high school to attend its BS/MD degree program. For the first three years, students focus on their undergraduate degree, achieving their Bachelor of Science. At that juncture, the students complete their fourth year, and then go on to attend the CUNY School of Medicine for seven years.

In response to a question from Trustee Una Clarke, City College Provost Trevisan stated that the College has a strong affiliation with St. Barnabas Healthcare Center in the Bronx, and is in the process of finalizing an affiliation agreement with the Health and Hospitals Corporation (HHC) of New York. The College has already established a series of affiliations with community health centers throughout Manhattan and the Bronx.

In response to another question from Trustee Clarke, Committee Chair Schwartz stated that this Committee will have further discussion at a subsequent meeting in regards to City College affiliating with healthcare centers in Brooklyn.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board, as revised as follows: remove "Excellence Fee" from schedule; and, delete "for full-time resident students" on the second line of the Explanation portion of the resolution, after "\$38,000.00 per year". Trustee Valerie Beal and Ms. Cecilia Salvi ABSTAINED.

2. The City University of New York – Hosting Services. Committee Chair Schwartz asked for the Committee's approval to authorize the General Counsel to execute a contract on behalf of the Office of the University Controller with a vendor who will provide services to migrate CUNY's current hosting operations to a new environment and to provide these hosting operations on an ongoing basis in a manner that will meet current and future needs. The hosting services estimated cost will be \$6,100,000 per year for five years, for a total maximum value of \$38,400,000, which also includes \$6,400,000 for the migration services required in the first year and an additional \$1,500,000 contingency fee for the five-year contract term. The

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
NOVEMBER 2, 2015

---

contract shall include up to five additional one-year options for the University to renew in its best interest.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

3. The City University of New York – American Museum of Natural History Online Graduate Science Seminar Courses. Committee Chair Schwartz asked for the Committee's approval to authorize the General Counsel to execute a contract for the School of Professional Studies (SPS) to purchase graduate science seminars from the American Museum of Natural History without competitive solicitation and pursuant to law and University regulations for a term of five years from January 1, 2015 through December 31, 2020. Such purchase shall not exceed a total estimated cost of \$1,935,000. SPS will use the science seminars to offer thirteen online graduate courses in life science, earth science, and physical science, and expand educational opportunities for science teachers and access to science content for students.

In response to a question from Prof. Conway, SPS Associate Dean Brian Peterson stated that SPS expects, in a given year, about 350 to 400 students from across the University to be engaged in these courses, most of them coming from Brooklyn College, Lehman College, and from the other senior colleges that offers Masters in Education through the permit system.

Vice Chancellor Sapienza added that the University is pleased with this SPS proposal because it hits on a couple of important aspects for CUNY: one, the diversifying of graduate offerings; two, the online aspect of these courses; and, three, the partnership with an institution like the American Museum of Natural History, a real positive for CUNY students.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

4. The City University of New York – Hazardous Waste Removal Services. Committee Chair Schwartz asked for the Committee's approval to authorize the General Counsel to execute a contract on behalf of the Office of the University Controller for the vendor who will provide, as needed, hazardous waste removal services for Central Office and all of the colleges. Such purchase shall not exceed an estimated cost of \$2,000,000 and the contract term shall be for five years. The services are essential for the day-to-day operations of the college campuses in order for them to be in compliance with the required federal, state, and local regulations with regards to the removal of hazardous waste.

Committee Chair Schwartz stated that he has been advised that the University is currently in compliance with all regulations. This proposal is forward-looking for the next five years.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

5. The City University of New York – Consideration of the FY2016-2017 Operating Budget Request.

\*\*\*PRESENTATION BY VICE CHANCELLOR MATTHEW SAPIENZA ON THE FY2016-2017 OPERATING BUDGET REQUEST\*\*\*

UFS Chair and Trustee Martell requested that the Office of Budget and Finance prepare for the upcoming Board meeting a chart that accurately shows the impact of TAP calculations so that the right numbers are reflected as it is a credit against the tuition bill.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
NOVEMBER 2, 2015

---

Chairman Benno Schmidt stated that the chart should also reflect federal aid that CUNY receives from PELL and research grants as it is a sizable chunk of the University's budget.

In response to a question from UFS Chair and Trustee Martell, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that the 996 new faculty lines represent a net number. They are the number of new faculty lines that were added at the colleges. It is not a net number in terms of there being some faculty who retired and who were then replaced.

Vice Chancellor Sapienza noted that during this time period, there was an early retirement incentive that took place at the state level. As a result of the early retirement, CUNY lost about 375 full-time faculty.

In response to several questions from UFS Chair and Trustee Martell, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that when the legislation was passed in 2011, CUNY's enrollment University-wide was 262,000. It is now 275,000. So despite the tuition increases, enrollment increased by six percent over that five-year time period as Senior Vice Chancellor and Secretary Hershenson mentioned during the earlier Executive Committee meeting.

Also, the city has locked in \$32 million in increases for the next fiscal year. The total amount, \$93 million, of which CUNY will receive for FY2019 is for new city funding. CUNY has been fortunate, as well, to have had four consecutive years of state aid increases at the community colleges. The basic FTE formula at the community colleges is still below 2009 levels, so CUNY is still asking the state to continue to make investments in the community college base aid. He added that the tuition increases at the community colleges of \$300 a year for five years have had greater purchasing power because their tuition is lower, and so the community colleges are in a different fiscal position than the senior colleges. On the whole, community college students have more of a fiscal challenge personally when it comes to tuition rates than senior colleges do, so for all those factors, no increase is recommended for community college tuition for next year.

Lastly, the Office of Budget and Finance is not asking this Committee to vote on a tuition increase at this point. They are asking the Committee to vote on a budget that supports the extension of the predictable tuition policy.

In response to a question from Trustee Clarke, Chairperson Schmidt stated that in regards to collective bargaining, the Executive Committee met this afternoon in Executive Session, and Chancellor James Milliken gave a report about the plans proposal. The Executive Committee was not asked to take action, but their consensus was that the Committee expresses its approval of moving the collective bargaining process forward.

Committee Chair Schwartz noted that Chairperson Schmidt has also written on behalf of the Board its support of collective bargaining, and Chancellor Milliken has spoken for the last year of the need to get a collective bargaining agreement behind the University.

University Student Senate (USS) Chair and Trustee Joseph Awadjie stated that he would like to thank the University for including USS in the discussion of tuition reform, and for not continuing to raise it at the community college level.

In response to a question from USS Chair and Trustee Awadjie, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that the MOE legislation will not impact the current year budget. If the legislation is signed, then the state would be legally required to cover CUNY's mandatory cost increases going forward, including collective bargaining, fringe benefits, and energy. The University's Budget Request calls for the state to fully fund those things without the MOE legislation. He added that CUNY supports the legislation and is grateful for the Senate and Assembly for

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
NOVEMBER 2, 2015

---

passing it. The University has until December 31<sup>st</sup> to see if Governor Andrew Cuomo will sign it.

In response to several questions from Ms. Cecilia Salvi, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that of the revenue that CUNY received over the five years of tuition increases, the University has been able to invest \$214 million of that amount directly into the campuses. The University has also hired almost 1,000 new faculty lines. Going forward, in terms of next year, a big amount will be there for investment in faculty—\$30 million from the \$39 million that would be generated from the senior colleges. CUNY wants to invest in faculty, as well as invest in other items for further enhancement at the campuses—online education, student support, scholarships, work force development. Those items will help the student experience at the campuses. In terms of what steps are in place to ensure that these funds are invested in those priorities, the University has a financial plan process with the campuses. Whenever there are new programmatic initiatives at the campuses from tuition money, CUNY requires that the college presidents develop those plans in consultation with elected student and faculty leaders. This has been in place since the tuition increases started back in the fall of 2011. In terms of advocating, at the state level, CUNY has been doing that over many years. He added that referring to what USS Chair and Trustee Awadjie mentioned earlier, the University appreciates the partnership that it has with USS, and is looking forward to continuing and strengthening the partnership to help the University advocate for things that are important.

Chancellor Milliken added that the single most important investment that this University can make to ensure its students' success, is in hiring the best faculty and retaining them. This has to be the University's highest priority, as it will have the most significant impact on the quality of students' education.

In response to another question from Ms. Salvi, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that in terms of the out years, the University is recommending that the predictable tuition policy be extended for up to \$300 a year for the next five years. The rate of each of those five years will depend on the fiscal condition. So this request assumes \$300 for the senior colleges, but CUNY is not taking a position about what the actual tuition will be in those five years. He added that the University would have the ability to raise tuition up to \$300 a year in each of those years should the Board approve it.

In regards to Ms. Salvi concerns, Trustee Beal stated that Chancellor Milliken has spent ninety-nine percent of his time advocating on behalf of the University, working non-stop for at least 18 months. He is to be commended for all his support.

In response to a question from USS Chair and Trustee Awadjie, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that TAP reform is a critical part of this whole legislation. Back in 2013, the state required SUNY and CUNY to submit recommendations on improving the TAP program, which was done. He added that as USS Chair and Trustee Awadjie mentioned, graduate TAP has been something that students have been calling for, and the University more than welcome working with USS on coming up with recommendations on how to improve TAP.

Chairperson Schmidt stated that he is in agreement about calling for TAP reform; it is an important part of what CUNY stands for in Albany because there are some changes that are justified and needed.

In response to a question from Committee Chair Schwartz, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that the Office of Budget and Finance will be in a position to give this Committee and then the Board and update in a few months. CUNY is hoping to work with SUNY to get some attention on that issue.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
NOVEMBER 2, 2015

---

In response to a question from Ms. Salvi, Committee Chair Schwartz stated that this budget, if approved, does not contemplate a tuition increase for community colleges.

Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that it is not CUNY's intention to increase community college tuition for next year, but if there is a major financial collapse or if the University is hit with large budget reductions, CUNY needs to have some flexibility.

In response to a question from Committee Chair Schwartz, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that it is too early to determine what the numbers might be in regards to experiential learning. The University is a system of 275,000 students, and while it has some terrific programs in place that include experiential learning, and while there are a lot of things that are part of a student's academic profile in terms of the classes that they have to take that include experiential learning components, CUNY is a big system. He added that if the University wants to ensure that every student has that component; it certainly is not going to be a small number.

In response to another question from Committee Chair Schwartz, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that the main metrics that CUNY will use if successful in getting funding, is calling for the campuses to use these dollars to help achieve partnerships for student internships in the private sector. But part of this also is to work with industry to find out what skills they are looking for in terms of their work force so that the campuses can work with industry to design the curriculum and develop programs that will help feed right into the industry needs. So the University has a few things within the budget on experiential learning, as well as on workforce development. He added that the CUNY Service Corps. is part of the budget as well. It has 800 students, and the University would like to grow that by 600 students. It is a successful program, giving CUNY students real work experience throughout the five boroughs.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board. Ms. Cecilia Salvi voted NO.

The public meeting was adjourned at 5:52 p.m.