

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
JUNE 6, 2016

The meeting was called to order at 4:08 p.m. Committee Vice Chair Valerie L. Beal chaired this meeting in absence of Committee Chair Barry F. Schwartz.

There were present:

**Committee Members:**

Hon. Valerie L. Beal, Vice Chair  
Hon. Una S. T-Clarke  
Hon. Terrence F. Martell, faculty member

**University Staff:**

Chancellor James B. Milliken  
Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza  
Vice Chancellor Brian Cohen  
Senior Advisor Marc V. Shaw

**Ex-officio:**

Hon. Benno Schmidt  
Hon. Philip A. Berry

**Observer:**

Prof. Kay Conway

**Trustee Staff:**

Senior Vice Chancellor and Secretary of the  
Board Jay Hershenson  
General Counsel and Senior Vice Chancellor  
Frederick P. Schaffer  
Ms. Towanda Lewis  
Ms. Fenella Ramsami  
Mr. Anthony Vargas

---

<b>Cal. No.</b>	<b>DISPOSITION</b>
-----------------	--------------------

---

The agenda items were considered and acted upon in the following order:

**I. ACTION ITEMS:**

**A. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF APRIL 4, 2016.** The minutes were approved as submitted.

**B. POLICY CALENDAR**

1. Hunter College – Tuition differential for the Doctor of Education in Instructional Leadership. Committee Vice Chair Valerie Beal asked for the Committee's approval, effective fall 2016, to adopt a tuition schedule for the Doctor of Education (Ed.D) in Instructional Leadership at the Hunter College School of Education that will have tuition set at \$210 above the regular Master's tuition level. With Master's level tuition for fall 2016 at \$425 per credit, the effective tuition rate in fall 2016 at the inception of the doctoral program will be \$635 per credit for resident students and \$990 per credit for non-resident students. This will be the first Ed.D program at CUNY.

In response to a question from Trustee Una Clarke, Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza stated that since the Ed.D. in Instructional Leadership is a unique degree, the University can charge a differential rate. Therefore, Hunter College has chosen to set tuition at \$210 above the regular Master's level, and the Office of Budget and Finance (OBF) is confident that even with the additional tuition differential, it will still be extremely competitive. The two Ed.D programs that Hunter College is going to be competing with are NYU's Steinhart and

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
JUNE 6, 2016

---

Columbia's Teachers College, and their rates are almost three times more than what a student at Hunter College will have to pay.

Chairperson Benno Schmidt requested that Hunter College report back to the Committee on whether the College is losing a large number of students in the part-time Ed.D. program versus full-time Ed.D. program.

In response to a question from Prof. Kay Conway on what thought was given to the part-time/full-time mix and to what extent is CUNY supporting the full-time students, President Jennifer Raab stated that the College's first priority was to get the program approved and to get the first class started and then to talk about how to support student needs. One of the reasons that the College is asking for this marginal increase above the typical doctoral tuition at CUNY was to make sure that it was supporting students, whether through placements, significant attention to their research, the video labs, etc. She added that the College looked at its experience with the Doctor of Nursing Practice (DNP), as that program started as a full-time program and immediately there was a demand for a part-time program because there were many people in the field who wanted to move up and get a doctoral degree, but were not able to give up a career. In retrospect, it was a mistake to have started the DNP without a part-time option. That is why Hunter College started the Ed.D. program this way. President Raab noted that of the 16 students who enrolled, some plan to attend part-time, and that she will get back to Prof. Conway on the actual distribution.

University Faculty Senate (UFS) Chair and Trustee Terrence Martell stated that it is critical that there be a part-time Ed.D. program. It is almost a requirement to have a doctoral degree for superintendents and heads of curriculum at the K-12 level, so the University is providing students a real opportunity to take a giant step forward as the part-time program is more socially important than the full-time program.

Chancellor James Milliken stated that there are many people already fully engaged at all levels of education who are seeking this opportunity to advance their careers, so it is essential for this kind of program, and it is important for CUNY's mission, to be able to offer this.

In response to a question from Committee Chair Beal, President Raab stated that in terms of affordability, there is more than a fifty percent differential rate between Hunter College's Ed.D program and other educational programs based in the New York City area, and that is why the College is confident that it will be serving a market that needs this.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

2. Baruch College – Tuition and Fee Schedule for the Executive Business Doctorate (EBD). Committee Vice Chair Beal asked for the Committee's approval to adopt a schedule of tuition charges and program fees for students in the Executive Business Doctorate (EBD) program leading to the Doctorate in Professional Studies (DPS) degree at Baruch College, effective the fall 2016 semester.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

3. The City University of New York – Virtual Bookstore. Committee Vice Chair Beal asked for the Committee's approval to authorize the University to choose a virtual bookstore company to provide a virtual, online substitute to the brick and mortar bookstore at some or all of the colleges, to support the educational mission of the University by providing necessary textbooks and related course materials to students at the lowest possible cost, in exchange for payment of commission on sale. The virtual bookstore company shall be a responsive and

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

COMMITTEE ON  
FISCAL AFFAIRS

MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
JUNE 6, 2016

---

responsible offeror chosen on the basis of best value after public advertisement and timely submission of sealed proposals through a Request for Proposal (RFP) solicitation and evaluation process conducted by the University pursuant to law and University regulations. The term of the contract is expected to be five (5) years with one three-year and one two-year renewal option as determined in the University's best interest. A first cohort of colleges has opted to participate in the RFP; any and all other colleges may choose to participate at a later date. This arrangement will not involve the expenditure of any tax levy funds.

Following discussion, the item was approved for submission to the Board.

**II. INFORMATION ITEM:**

Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that he would like to update the Committee on where the University stands in terms of senior and community college budgets and allocations for Fiscal Year 2017, which begins on July 1<sup>st</sup>. OBF is finalizing the allocations for the senior colleges. The State-enacted budget did not cover all of CUNY's mandatory needs and increases, fringe benefits, energy, building rentals and the like, and received no additional money through tuition and revenue. There was no tuition revenue increase, and the Predictable Tuition Policy was not extended as part of the State-enacted budget so there were no new revenues to cover programmatic enhancements or new initiatives for the campuses. As a result, the University has communicated to the senior college presidents and senior college financial leaders that they should expect a reallocation from their budgets of two percent for Fiscal Year 2017. In the current Fiscal Year 2016, there was a reallocation of three percent, so this two percent would be on top of that baseline action of three percent. There are plans to do deeper cuts for the Central Administration, similar to what was done in the current year so that rate of reduction will be greater than two percent. OBF is working with the vice chancellors and the other heads of departments to effectuate those cuts.

The community college allocations are going to have to wait a little while longer because the City budget has not been finalized and Mayor Bill de Blasio issued his Executive Budget about five weeks ago. The Mayor and the City Council are now negotiating a renewed budget for Fiscal Year 2017. OBF is optimistic that there will be an early agreement this year, and it is hopeful that if this happens the University will be able to roll out the community college allocations thereafter. Community colleges are in a different position than the senior colleges as they were provided additional state aid this year. They also have enrollment increases that are part of their base formula, which are being recognized in the State budget this year. The City has also provided additional funds to the community college budget, so they are in a much stronger fiscal position than the senior colleges.

In response to a question from Committee Vice Chair Beal, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that effectively the University has instituted a 5 percent decrease over two years.

In response to another question from Committee Vice Chair Beal, Vice Chancellor Sapienza stated that OBF is certainly hopeful that the Predictable Tuition Policy will be extended going forward—it will expire on July 1<sup>st</sup>—as the University is not able to raise undergraduate tuition at the senior colleges this year. OBF will continue to work with this Committee as well as the full Board of Trustees, and work with the folks in Albany—both at the Executive and legislative levels—as part of next year's budget cycle coming up in the fall. As a reminder, Governor Andrew Cuomo did include an extension of the Predictable Tuition Policy in his Executive Budget. It was not part of the final State-enacted budget, but OBF will try again for next year.

Committee Vice Chair Beal stated that it makes more sense to have the Predictable Tuition Policy—even if it is at a lower rate than previously—but it should be in the best interest of all student families, particularly those who are struggling.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:31 p.m.