

MINUTES OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING OF THE
BOARD OF HIGHER EDUCATION OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK

HELD

MARCH 11, 1969

AT THE BOARD HEADQUARTERS BUILDING
535 EAST 80 STREET - BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

At the request of the Chairman of the Board, the Committee on Campus Planning and Development met with the Executive Committee.

In the absence of the Chairman, The Honorable Porter R. Chandler called the meeting to order at 4:30 p.m.

There were present:

Porter R. Chandler
David I. Ashe
Herbert Berman

Frederick H. Burkhardt
James Oscar Lee
Jack I. Poses

N. Michael Carfora, Secretary of the Board
Arthur H. Kahn, General Counsel

Chancellor Albert H. Bowker
Vice-Chancellor Robert Birnbaum

Vice-Chancellor Seymour C. Hyman
Vice-Chancellor Bernard Mintz

The absence of Mr. Keppel and Mr. Quero Chiesa was excused.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the following resolutions were approved or action was taken as noted: (Calendar Nos. A. through 4)

NO. A. ACQUISITION OF THE JAMAICA JEWISH CENTER: RESOLVED, That the Board approve a purchase price not to exceed \$1,400,000 for the acquisition of the Jamaica Jewish Center premises and its furnishings at 150-91 87th Road, Jamaica, New York, as a temporary facility for York College together with an additional payment equal to the actual direct and indirect cost to the Center for alterations required to make the premises suitable for occupancy by York College; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the City University Construction Fund be requested to authorize the Dormitory Authority to enter into an agreement of sale to acquire said renovated property.

EXPLANATION: The Executive Committee of the Board on October 15, 1968 (Cal. No. 2) authorized the acquisition, renovation and equipping of the Jamaica Jewish Center as an interim facility for York College. On November 25, 1968 (Cal. No. 4), the Board amended a prior resolution relative to the funding of temporary facilities for York College to include estimated amounts of \$1,500,000 for acquisition of the Center and \$825,000 for renovation work therein.

The Jamaica Jewish Center consists of a three-story, basement and cellar fireproof structure erected about 43 years ago, located on a nearly rectangular parcel 100.5 feet by 159.7 feet at the Northwest corner of 87th Road and 155th Street in Jamaica, Queens.

The building presently contains a swimming pool, gymnasium, a game room, locker room, a dining room and kitchen, a small library, a synagogue, a number of classrooms and several offices. It is intended to alter the building to provide a College facility containing:

BASEMENT: Gymnasium, swimming pool, handball court, dance studio, men's and women's shower rooms and locker facilities, a student lounge and supervisors' offices, storage rooms, etc.

FIRST FLOOR: Auditorium, three classrooms, two individual music practice rooms, a student lounge, faculty offices for Teacher Education and Physical Education.

SECOND FLOOR: A classroom, two seminar rooms, a group rehearsal room, an ensemble rehearsal room, two individual practice rooms, music faculty offices and storage areas.

THIRD FLOOR: A classroom, a lecture room, Fine Arts studios and faculty offices, a faculty lounge and storage areas.

A tentative estimate of \$750,000 for the alteration work plus 10% for fees and contingencies has been advanced by the College Architect/Planners.

NO. 1. BROOKLYN COLLEGE ADDITION TO SCIENCE BUILDING AND GYMNASIUM AND OUTDOOR ATHLETIC FACILITIES: The Executive Committee, the Committee on Campus Planning and Development and members of the Chancellor's staff discussed, at length, the proposed resolution to approve increased estimated cost of construction for the Brooklyn College Addition to Science Building and Gymnasium Building and Outdoor Athletic Facilities.

The Vice-Chancellor for Campus Planning and Development discussed the content of letters from the Project Architects dated February 28, 1969, the Cost Consultants dated March 3, 1969 and the proposed Construction Management firm dated March 4, 1969. The unanimous consensus of these reports was that the increased cost reflected in the bids submitted is attributable to the present construction market and the inordinate cost escalation experienced in the last few months. The Committees discussed possible alternatives to acceptance of the low bids including reduction in scope of work, rebidding the general construction and heating contracts, etc. The former possibility was rejected on the basis that the project, as proposed, was required for the educational purposes of the Institution and that serious modifications to the plans would require time to effect and any possible saving could be negated by further cost escalation during the redesign period. The latter alternative was also rejected in consideration of the number and range of bids received for the general construction and heating work.

It was ultimately concluded that all things considered, the most reasonable course of action would be to proceed with the award of contracts to the low bidders.

Vice-Chancellor Hyman reported that the architects and cost estimators were requested to re-examine and re-estimate their costs on two other buildings at Brooklyn College in the light of this situation.

RESOLVED, That the Board of Higher Education approve an increased estimated cost of construction from \$20,486,500 to \$23,973,470, the aggregate of low bids received on February 20, 1969, for the construction of Additions to the Science and Gymnasium Buildings and Outdoor Athletic Facilities at Brooklyn College; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the City University Construction Fund be and is hereby requested to
(1) approve said increased estimated cost of construction,
(2) authorize the Dormitory Authority to award contracts to the successful low bidders in the aggregate amount of \$23,973,470;
and be it further

RESOLVED, That the action of the Board of Higher Education of September 30, 1968, Calendar No. 5(b) be amended to increase the total estimated cost of the project from \$27,000,000 to \$30,300,000 and that the Note Agreement be amended accordingly.

EXPLANATION: On September 30, 1968, the Board approved an estimated construction cost for these facilities of \$20,236,500, plus an allowance of \$250,000 for escalation to an estimated bid date of November 8, 1968, as submitted by Evans & Delehanty, Architects.

On February 20, 1969, bids were taken by the Dormitory Authority and the aggregate of the low bids was \$23,973,470. These bids may be summarized as follows:

Contract	Low Bids	High Bids	Number of Bidders
1. General Construction	\$14,969,000	\$15,955,000	3
2. HVAC	4,476,000	4,957,000	4
3. Plumbing	1,629,000	2,878,000	3
4. Electric	2,899,470	4,130,000	6
	<u>\$23,973,470</u>		

The bids have been analyzed by the Dormitory Authority, the architects and the estimators. Conferences have been held with the contractors for General Construction and HVAC to determine if possible where the discrepancy between the estimates and the low bids might lie.

The consensus of opinion that has evolved from these activities is that the difference between the estimates and the bids are attributable primarily to differences of opinion as to the pricing and not the quantities involved in the major elements of the construction. The architects and the estimators attribute the sizable increases in pricing to an extraordinary escalation in costs of construction which has apparently developed in the past several months. It is also considered to be of major significance that the value of construction work now underway in the Metropolitan Area is at an unprecedented high level and that the drain on the labor market has affected bidding conditions adversely.

The architect, as well as the estimators, are of the firm conviction that rebidding the job would not result in lower bids. It is also their opinion that no significant savings could be effected without major changes to the plans involving significant reduction of the programmed facilities. Any such consideration would also involve long delays in redoing the plans.

The Vice-Chancellor for Campus Planning and Development recommends that the low bids be accepted and that the project not be rebid nor that any changes be made to the plans for these urgently needed facilities.

The estimated total project cost approved in September 1968 was as follows:

<u>Item</u>	<u>Estimated Cost</u>
Architect's Fee for Final Design	\$ 533,490
Construction	20,236,000
Escalation	250,000
Supervision and Management	800,000
Equipment (15%)	3,075,000
Miscellaneous Costs	50,000
Contingency and Bid Allowance (10%)	2,048,650
Total	<u>\$26,993,140</u>
say	\$27,000,000

The revised total project cost based on the new cost of construction is as follows:

<u>Item</u>	<u>Estimated Cost</u>
Architect's Fee for Final Design	\$ 533,490
Site Utility and Railroad Work	150,000
Construction (Low Bids)	23,973,470
Supervision & Management	800,000
Equipment (15%)	3,600,000
Miscellaneous	50,000
Contingency for extras during construction	1,200,000
Total	<u>\$30,306,960</u>
say	\$30,300,000

NO. 2. MONTGOMERY WARD BUILDING: RESOLVED, That the Board approve payment by the Dormitory Authority in the sum of \$1,250,000 to the owners of premises at 150-18 Jamaica Avenue, Jamaica, New York (Montgomery Ward Building) on account of the sum which may ultimately be fixed by a court or agreed upon between the parties, as the value of said premises to be acquired for use by York College, such payment to be made upon condition that the owners of said premises convey title in a form satisfactory to the Dormitory Authority and give immediate possession to the Dormitory Authority and agree to raise no issues in opposition to the pending condemnation proceedings other than the question of value of the premises.

EXPLANATION: In the pending condemnation proceedings in Queens County the owners of the Montgomery Ward Building have offered to give immediate title and possession to the Dormitory Authority and to raise no issues, other than the question of value, provided payment on account is made in the sum of \$1,250,000. The adoption of the resolution will expedite the condemnation proceedings and enable the Board to go forward at once with the necessary planning and renovation required to make the premises suitable for use by York College.

The Dormitory Authority has appraised the value of the property at \$1,340,000. The exact terms and conditions of the herein described agreement will be developed by the Dormitory Authority and will be subject to Court approval.

NO. 3. BROOKLYN COLLEGE PRESIDENTIAL SEARCH COMMITTEE: Upon motion duly made, seconded and carried, it was agreed to request the Brooklyn College Presidential Search Committee to have, in addition to the members appointed by the Chairman of the Board, three faculty members with alternates, one student with an alternate and one member of the Alumni with an alternate, such alternates to attend meetings when the regular member is not available.

NO. 4. BUDGET CRISIS: WHEREAS, The Board of Higher Education has considered and deplored the drastic budget cuts proposed in the 1969-70 budget of New York State which would reduce the University budget from its request of \$270.1 million to a level of \$225.7 million, and the introduction of bills in the State Legislature for 1970-71 which would further reduce State support for the University (BHE minutes of February 24, 1969, Calendar A); and

WHEREAS, The Board has now been informed of the intentions of New York City to further reduce the budget of the University to \$180.0 million, an effective level of expenditure \$41.1 million below the present budget; and

WHEREAS, The City Budget Director, in analyzing the effects of two proposed levels of City support for the University, has publicly stated that

"The minimum level of cuts would be equivalent to requiring that City University stop all new enrollments for the next college year as well as eliminating evening, summer and graduate programs. The maximum cut level would be equivalent to closing four senior and four community colleges. Alternatively, the City University could be required to institute tuition charges for all undergraduate students at 4-year and community colleges - these would be in addition to non-tuition charges already required by City University."

and

WHEREAS, The budget cuts by the State and City and the proposed legislation which would further decrease State aid, would destroy the City University as a viable institution, would deny to each New York City high school student his right to an opportunity for higher education, would further exacerbate the tragic ethnic confrontations now taking place in our City, and would greatly diminish the role of New York City as a center of culture and finance, business and education; and

WHEREAS, The Faculty Senate of the City University has indicated that under the proposed budget cuts "the enrollment of new students would be unfair to them, intolerable to the faculties, and disastrous to the University"; therefore be it

RESOLVED, That the Board of Higher Education urgently request that the Governor, the leaders of the State Legislature and the Mayor reconsider and remove their announced cuts of the 1969-70 University budget; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Governor and the leaders of the State Legislature be requested to defeat the bills now before the Legislature which would further reduce State aid beginning in the 1970-71 budget year; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Board reaffirm its intentions to withhold all admission decisions until firm budget commitments are made by both the State and the City.

Upon motion duly made, seconded and carried, the meeting adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

N. MICHAEL CARFORA
Secretary of the Board