

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE BOARD OF
TRUSTEES OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK**

HELD

APRIL 27, 1981

**AT THE BOARD HEADQUARTERS BUILDING
535 EAST 80 STREET—BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN**

The Chairperson called the meeting to order at 4:45 P.M.

There were present:

**James P. Murphy, Chairperson
Edith B. Everett, Vice Chairperson**

**Blanche Bernstein
Armand D'Angelo
Judah Gribetz
Harold M. Jacobs**

**Albert V. Maniscalco
Robert L. Polk
Joaquin Rivera
David Z. Robinson
Margaret Titone**

Ann M. Burton, ex officio

Garth Marchant, ex officio

**Martin J. Warmbrand, Secretary of the Board
David B. Rigney, General Counsel and Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs**

**Chancellor Robert J. Kibbee
Acting Deputy Chancellor Leon M. Goldstein
President Roscoe C. Brown, Jr.
President Flora Mancuso Edwards
Acting President Israel Glasser
President Robert L. Hess
President Leonard Lief
President Gerald W. Lynch
President Harold M. Proshansky
President Kurt R. Schmeller
President Ursula Schwerin**

**President Joel Segall
President Donna E. Shalala
President Joseph Shenker
President Joshua L. Smith
Acting President Arthur Tiedemann
President Richard D. Trent
President Edmond L. Volpe
Vice Chancellor Richard M. Catalano
Vice Chancellor Julius C.C. Edelstein
Acting Vice Chancellor Ira H. Fuchs
Vice Chancellor Jerald Posman
Vice Chancellor Leonard O. Roellig**

The absence of Mr. Baard, Mr. Badillo, and Mr. Cavanagh was excused.

A. MEMORIAL RESOLUTION MARKING THE DEATH OF MARY SHOTWELL INGRAHAM:

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the following resolution was adopted:

WHEREAS, Mary Shotwell Ingraham was appointed to the Board of Higher Education in 1938 by Mayor Fiorello LaGuardia and over the next three decades, selflessly served the interests of public higher education in New York City with dignity, dedication, and distinction; and

WHEREAS, As a lifelong resident of the Borough of Brooklyn, she brought both passion and insight to her work as a Member and for sixteen years, Chairman of the Board's Committee of Brooklyn College, thereby guiding the growth of Brooklyn College from temporary quarters in Downtown Brooklyn to permanent quarters in Midwood and furthermore, encouraging those standards of academic and scholarly excellence that were to bring the College national repute; and

WHEREAS, In recognition of her intellectual prowess, her sound judgment, and her keen foresight, she was appointed in 1959 to chair the Board's Committee to Look to the Future, which in the following year, brought forth its historic proposal for the transformation of the municipal college system into The City University of New York; and

WHEREAS, In keeping with her commitment to extend undergraduate opportunities to a diversified citizenry, she championed the cause of higher education for adults and spearheaded efforts to provide programs and professors in the Evening Session comparable in quality to those in the Day Session; and

WHEREAS, Throughout her thirty-year tenure as a Member of the Board, she fought for freedom from external influences that might compromise the quality or integrity of the academic experience; and

WHEREAS, Beyond her endeavors on behalf of The City University of New York, she distinguished herself as both President of the National Board of the Y.W.C.A. and Founder and Vice President of the United Service Organizations, pioneering progress in both these positions towards racial harmony, equality, and justice; therefore be it

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees acknowledges its profound debt of gratitude to Mary Shotwell Ingraham whose vision, vitality, and devotion to public service so shaped the character and the mission of The City University of New York and that the Board furthermore extends its heartfelt sympathy to her bereaved family on the occasion of her death.

B. HOSTOS COMMUNITY COLLEGE —HONOR: The Chairperson reported that two teams of radiologic technology students from Hostos Community College won first and third prizes in a prestigious, city-wide radiologic technology seminar competition sponsored by the New York City Society of Radiologic Technologists and held on April 16 at the New York Hospital, Cornell Medical Center. This competition regularly includes teams from some of the nation's best known colleges, hospitals and medical centers. Hostos was permitted to enter two teams because of the size of the College's program - 24 seniors as compared to 5 to 10 students in most other programs. The Chairperson congratulated the President, faculty and students of Hostos Community College on this accomplishment.

C. THE CITY COLLEGE - BEQUEST: The Chairperson reported the receipt of a bequest of \$400,000 from the Estate of the late Julius Isaacs to establish the Betty Lewis Isaacs and Julius Isaacs Scholarship Fund for English majors at The City College who are also studying foreign languages and the classics. Mr. Isaacs was an attorney, lecturer, former New York City magistrate and an alumnus of the College.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the following resolutions were adopted or action was taken as noted: (Calendar Nos. 1 through 6)

NO. 1 UNIVERSITY REPORT: RESOLVED, That the University Report for April 27, 1981 (including Addendum Items) be approved, as amended as follows:

(a) Item AI. Resolution Proposing the Establishment of a Department of Special Education at Hunter College: Withdrawn.

(b) Item AI 4.1. Resolution Proposing the Establishment of a Department of Film at Brooklyn College: Withdrawn.

(c) Items listed in PART E - ERRATA, to be withdrawn or changed as indicated.

EXPLANATION: The University Report consists of annual instructional appointments at a salary of \$15,000 and above and other resolutions of a non-policy nature which require approval by the Board of Trustees.

NO. 2. CHANCELLOR'S REPORT: RESOLVED, That the Chancellor's Report for April 27, 1981 (including Addendum Items) be approved, as amended as follows:

(a) Item AIV. 20.4. Change of Program Name (Graduate School and University Center): The change in name of the Ph.D. Program in Engineering to Ph.D. Program in Engineering and Computer Science is withdrawn.

(b) Items listed in PART E - ERRATA, to be withdrawn or changed as indicated.

EXPLANATION: The Chancellor's Report consists of standard resolutions and actions of a non-policy nature which require approval by the Board of Trustees.

NO. 3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: RESOLVED, That the minutes of the special meeting of the Board of Trustees held March 6, 1981, and the minutes of the regular meeting held March 23, 1981 be approved as circulated.

NO. 3.A. EXPRESSION OF CONDOLENCES: On behalf of the Board, the Chairperson extended to Mrs. Kibbee condolences on the death of her mother, Mrs. Bridget Rockwitz and expressed the Board's sympathy to the Chancellor and his family on this loss.

NO. 4. COMMITTEE ON FACILITIES PLANNING AND MANAGEMENT AND CONTRACT REVIEW: RESOLVED, That the following items be approved:

A. QUEENS COLLEGE - EXTERIOR REPAIRS:

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York approve the contract documents as prepared by Castro-Blanco, Piscioneri & Feder, Architects, and authorize the Office of Facilities Planning and Management to advertise, bid and award the contract to the lowest responsible bidder for furnishing all labor, materials and equipment required for Exterior Restoration and Handicapped Access Projects at Queens College, at an estimated cost of \$254,000, chargeable to Capital Projects HN-203 and HN-233.

EXPLANATION: The proposed contract provides for exterior repairs to the stucco finish and exterior trim on three of the original Queens College Buildings (Building "I," "B" and Jefferson Hall). The proposed contract also includes work to provide greater access for the handicapped, including various exterior ramps to facilitate access to the Library, Dining Hall and Colden Auditorium.

B. HUNTER COLLEGE BELLEVUE CAMPUS - ELECTRICAL SERVICE:

RESOLVED, That the Board approve plans, specifications and contract documents and authorize the Business Manager of Hunter College to advertise for, receive and open bids and award a contract to the lowest responsible bidder for new electrical service at the Brookdale Health Sciences Center (26th Street Campus), at an estimated cost of \$275,000 chargeable to Bellevue Matching Fund and/or any funds available to the College.

EXPLANATION: This contract will provide for an upgraded electric service necessary to adequately provide for the classroom, laboratory and office facilities at the Bellevue Campus of Hunter College.

C. LEHMAN COLLEGE - GILLET HALL ALTERATIONS:

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York approve an increased estimate in the amount of the aggregate low bids received, \$121,463, for contract for furnishing all labor, materials and equipment required to permit the relocation of the Lehman College Department of Health Services from an off-campus based facility to Gillet Hall, the cost to be charged to Capital Project No. HN-203.

EXPLANATION: The altered facility will provide laboratory space, located at the rented Poe Center (2641 Grand Concourse) to be relocated on to the main campus on the fourth floor of Gillet Hall for use by the Health Services Department. Completion of said work will permit the University to terminate use of the leased facility.

On December 22, 1980 (Cal. No. 4A) the Board approved contract documents, etc. for this work at an estimated cost of \$104,745.

Low bids received for this work on January 9 and February 24, 1981 aggregate \$121,463. In view of the number and range of bids received, it is the recommendation of the design architect, Joseph Tonetti and Associates, that the contracts be awarded to the low bidders. The Office of Facilities Planning and Management concurs with this recommendation.

At this point Prof. Burton left the meeting.

D. UNIFORMED GUARD SERVICE:**(1) HUNTER COLLEGE:**

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York authorize the Business Manager of Hunter College to advertise for, receive and open bids, and award a contract to the lowest responsible bidder to provide Uniformed Guard Service to the Hunter College Community for the period July 1, 1981 to June 30, 1982, with a one-year option to renew, at an estimated cost of \$661,088 chargeable to the following expense codes, subject to financial ability:

Hunter College: Expense Code 7003-176-8201-806-23480-14-00, \$568,128.00

Hunter Campus Schools: Expense Code 2-34801-400, \$92,960.00

EXPLANATION: This contract is required to provide Uniformed Guard Service to safeguard the faculty, staff, students and property of the college.

(2) COLLEGE OF STATEN ISLAND - UNIFORMED GUARD SERVICE:

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York approve the renewal of the Unarmed Guard Service contract entered into with Globe Protection Inc. of 15 Park Row, New York, N. Y. for the period of July 1, 1981 - June 30, 1982 at an estimated cost of \$449,242.00 of which \$424,236.00 is chargeable to code 7010-176-8201-806-2-21770-14-00 and \$25,006.00 to Auxiliary Services Parking Fund.

EXPLANATION: The continuance of proper guard service is essential for the security of the college community. Therefore, the college wishes to exercise its option to renew the contract under the terms and conditions as specified in Paragraph 10 "Renewal of Contract" Schedule A. of current contract.

(3) HOSTOS COMMUNITY COLLEGE:

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees approve documents and specifications and authorize Hostos Community College to advertise for, receive and open bids and award a contract to the lowest responsible bidder for furnishing Uniformed Guard Services, as required, for the buildings and campus areas of Hostos Community College for the period from July 1, 1981 through June 30, 1982, with the option of one-year renewals, up to three such renewals, for the estimated amount of \$277,841.00 chargeable to Code 2-348-01-400.

EXPLANATION: Uniformed Guard Services are necessary for the safety and security of the college. Increased cost over prior year is necessitated by the additional number of guards required to cover newly acquired facility at 500 Grand Concourse on a full-year basis.

(4) NEW YORK CITY TECHNICAL COLLEGE:

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees approve the contract documents and specifications and authorize New York City Technical College to advertise for, receive, and open bids and award contracts to the lowest responsible bidder for furnishing Uniformed Guard Service at New York City Technical College for the period of July 1, 1981 through June 30, 1982 at an estimated cost of \$288,000.00 chargeable to Code 348-01-400 Contractual Services General, with an option to renew for two (2) additional years. (See also Cal. No. 2 (b) 4, 4/20/64).

EXPLANATION: Uniformed Guard Service is essential to the College to provide protection and security of personnel, facilities, equipment and supplies.

NO. 5. COMMITTEE ON ACADEMIC POLICY, PROGRAM, AND RESEARCH: RESOLVED, That the following items be approved:

A. KINGSBOROUGH COMMUNITY COLLEGE - A.S. IN ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH AND SCIENCE:

RESOLVED, That the Environmental Health and Science Program leading to the degree of Associate in Science to be offered at Kingsborough Community College of The City University of New York be approved, effective September 1981, subject to financial ability.

EXPLANATION: The program is designed to train individuals for entry level positions in environmental health and science as well as to prepare them for advanced studies at the baccalaureate level. The college had identified a high demand for individuals with this preparation and has made articulation arrangements with Brooklyn College.

B. KINGSBOROUGH COMMUNITY COLLEGE - A.A.S. IN TRAVEL AND TOURISM:

RESOLVED, That the program in Travel and Tourism leading to the degree of Associate in Applied Science to be offered at Kingsborough Community College be approved, effective September 1981, subject to financial ability.

EXPLANATION: The A.A.S. in Travel and Tourism is designed to provide training for entry-level positions in the travel and tourism industry within the metropolitan region. The program's curriculum incorporates many of the College's existing academic offerings together with several newly-developed courses in the area of travel and tourism. Prospective graduates will thus be provided with both specific state-of-the-art training in the field as well as a broad exposure to the liberal arts.

C. QUEENS COLLEGE - CHANGE IN NAME FROM DEPARTMENT OF MUSIC TO SCHOOL OF MUSIC:

RESOLVED, That the Department of Music at Queens College be renamed the School of Music of Queens College of The City University of New York, effective May 1981; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the School of Music continue to exercise the educational and governance functions of a department in accordance with the charter of the College and the Bylaws of the University; and be it further

RESOLVED, That with the approval of the President, the chair shall be designated Director of the School of Music; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Director of the School of Music shall report to the Dean of Arts Division.

EXPLANATION: The Department of Music at Queens College, long regarded as a distinguished one, has been functioning in recent years as a school of music in nearly every way but in name. It currently offers four different degree programs: The Bachelor of Arts, the Bachelor of Music, the Master of Arts (in Music History, Music Theory, Composition, and Performance), and the Master of Science in Secondary Music Education. In addition, the variety of performance activities and external programs sponsored by the Department correspond more closely to those of a school of music than a college music department.

D. BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN COMMUNITY COLLEGE - A.A.S. IN CHILD CARE - EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION (TRANSFER FROM NEW YORK CITY TECHNICAL COLLEGE):

RESOLVED, That the program in Child Care-Early Childhood Education leading to the A.A.S. degree to be offered at the Borough of Manhattan Community College be approved, effective September 1981, subject to financial ability.

EXPLANATION: In 1978 the Board of Higher Education approved a resolution to close the Voorhees campus of New York City Community College (now New York City Technical College), to relinquish its facilities at the Voorhees site, and to accommodate programs currently housed at Voorhees at the Brooklyn Campus of the College. One of the programs concerned was the A.A.S. in Child Care-Early Childhood Education. In that the University currently sponsors a program in this field at one of its colleges in Brooklyn, Kingsborough Community College, the relocation of the Voorhees program to the Brooklyn Campus of New York City Technical College would duplicate unnecessarily the University's programs in child care in the Borough of Brooklyn. A transfer of the program to Borough of Manhattan Community College is therefore appropriate. It will continue to provide training in child care by The City University in Manhattan, a borough in which no other such CUNY program exists.

Support for the program will be provided through a transfer of faculty from New York City Technical College to Borough of Manhattan Community College.

Students currently enrolled in the program who have completed more than half of the credits required for the degree at New York City Technical College will be permitted to receive their degrees from that College.

NO. 6. COMMITTEE ON FACULTY, STAFF, AND ADMINISTRATION: RESOLVED, That the following items be approved or action taken as noted:

A. DISTINGUISHED PROFESSOR: RESOLVED, That Herbert Gutman be designated Distinguished Professor in the Department of History at the Graduate School and University Center for the period 5/1/81-8/31/81, with compensation at the rate of \$5,000 per annum in addition to his regular academic salary, subject to financial ability.

Prof. Gutman was introduced, and Pres. Proshansky expressed his great pleasure at bringing Prof. Gutman's name before the Board as he is not only a distinguished social historian but one of the best teachers at the Graduate School. Prof. Gutman recently secured federal funding from the Reagan Administration to support a major program involving both the community colleges and the Graduate School.

The Chairperson then made the following statement:

It is with a mixture of understanding and regret that I accept Chancellor Kibbee's announcement today that he plans to leave the Chancellery to return to teaching at the end of the next academic year in June of 1982. He will by then have completed his eleventh year of service as the chief educational and administrative officer of The City University. He has given amazingly good service to the University, its students, and the people of the City of New York during the past decade.

In 1971 when he joined the University the Open Admissions Program had just gotten underway and he helped to guide and implement this Program in a very positive and constructive manner. In the fiscal crisis of 1975-76, his strong leadership helped the University to buffet the considerable conflicting pressures and storms of that period wherein the University was able to effect an orderly continuation and to establish a new focus under extremely difficult fiscal conditions. During the period 1977 through 1979 he helped spearhead efforts on the part of the University's many constituencies and supporters for the preservation of CUNY which resulted in the creation of the new funding model whereby the State has assumed the capital and operating cost of the senior colleges with the City continuing to provide for support of the community colleges in partnership with the State.

Since the new Board of Trustees was appointed a year ago, Bob Kibbee has been giving help so that we can direct the University and we are now poised to function effectively in the 1980's as the people's University notwithstanding the many challenges which lie ahead.

I have been privileged to have him as a personal friend for the past decade. I wish him and his wife Peggy the best of happiness and fulfillment. The people of New York owe Bob Kibbee a debt of gratitude.

I am in the process of appointing a search committee which I will chair to begin the important and critical task of identification for consideration by the full Board of Trustees of a new Chancellor for the University who would join us in mid-1982. The search committee will be comprised of the following Trustees: Edith Everett, Armand D'Angelo, Judah Gribetz, Robert Polk, Joaquin Rivera, Ann Burton, and Garth Marchant. It will also include additional faculty and student representation, as well as alumni representation by Stanley Lowell, former president of the City College Alumni and currently chairman of the Committee for Public Higher Education. It will also contain as a member President Leonard Lief of Lehman College, representing the Council of Presidents. I hope to have the full committee in place by next week. We will also be assisted by two consultant advisors who are of outstanding national reputation in education and administration to advise the search committee on criteria for the successor, procedures and help in identifying potential candidates. The remainder of the Trustees will constitute an advisory group to be consulted from time to time during the search process.

Let me conclude by saying: Bob, you have and are serving this University in outstanding fashion. You've been with us ten years. That's cruel and inhuman punishment under the terms of our Federal Constitution. We're happy that you'll be able to bear with us for another fourteen months, and I think it makes a great deal of sense to give us an opportunity to search in an orderly fashion for the best possible successor who will have, whether it be he or she, a very large pair of shoes to fill.

On behalf of the Board, I wish to say, we receive your decision with regret, and we applaud the great work that you have done and are doing for us. We wish you the very best.

* * * * *

The Chancellor was given a standing ovation by all present.

B. BYLAW AMENDMENT:

Notice was served of an amendment to Article XIV of the Bylaws of the Board to revise the requirements for the positions of College Office Assistant A and College Secretarial Assistant A.

In accordance with the Bylaws, the text of the amendment will be included in the May calendar for action at the May meeting of the Board.

C. DESIGNATION OF THE AARON COPLAND SCHOOL OF MUSIC AT QUEENS COLLEGE:

RESOLVED, That the School of Music at Queens College be named The Aaron Copland School of Music of Queens College of The City University of New York, effective May 1981.

EXPLANATION: In recognition of Aaron Copland's exceptional contributions to the cultural life of the nation and of New York, his native City, Queens College wishes to name its newly designated School of Music the Aaron Copland School of Music. The faculty of Queens College, the President of the College and the Chancellor of The City University have approved this recommendation. In addition to agreeing to have the School of Music bear his name, Mr. Copland has agreed to participate in various events at the School and to contribute actively to the further development of the School of Music.

NO. 7. TWENTIETH ANNIVERSARY CELEBRATION/DINNER: The Chairperson and Acting Deputy Chancellor Goldstein reported briefly on the planning for the Twentieth Anniversary Celebration/Dinner to be held on October 1 at the Sheraton Centre.

NO. 8. RESIGNATION OF CHANCELLOR KIBBEE: Chancellor Kibbee announced his intention to step down as Chancellor of the University in June of 1982 and stated further:

I am submitting my resignation this year so that the Board may have an opportunity to go through a comprehensive and unhurried search without the necessity of appointing an acting chancellor. By that time I will have completed eleven years which is about twice the normal tenure of a chief executive officer in higher education today. I do this both because I think it will be good for me and also good for the University. I need to change my pace and look to other things and contemplate what I have experienced over these last ten years and perhaps write some about it and also to do a little research that I've contemplated for some time now. I also think that in eleven years you begin to see that many of the problems you face are *deja vu* and that you have such an investment in what is that it becomes difficult to look at it with a fresh mind and to consider the changes needed to move the University forward into new areas.

I do this willingly and I want to express my appreciation to the Board, to the Presidents, to all those in the University who have been so supportive and helpful to me in these last ten years. I also want to assure you that my reason for leaving is not reasons of health. I am not suffering. I am older than I was when I came and that makes me a little less agile, but I am feeling well and hope to be able to sit in a professorial chair if you people will give me one, for some time.

* * * * *

The Chancellor then distributed copies of the letter he had sent to the Chairperson of the Board.

Mr. Gribetz joined the meeting during the Chancellor's announcement.

Statements of praise of Chancellor Kibbee were made by:

Mr. D'Angelo:

I don't think there are more than two people who are still members of this Board who went through the critical period in 1976, I have said this publicly before and probably will continue to say it; this institution would have drowned without Chancellor Kibbee. We would have been put out of business if we didn't have the leadership of Bob Kibbee at that time. On a future occasion I hope that we will do something as a Board of Trustees to make that really clear in everybody's mind in the City, among the faculty, and in the student body of this University system.

Mr. Marchant:

I would like to echo those same words. Though we had major disagreements with the Chancellor, he had to make tough decisions. We really can appreciate that. Without his leadership the University could have fewer students than we have now.

Dr. Jacobs:

Armand and I are probably the two longest tenured members of this Board. Certainly in my position as Chairperson for so many years, I must echo the remarks that Mr. D'Angelo and others have made previously. Having worked closely with him, I don't know how I or anyone else could have stayed in the position of Chairperson without the support of the Chancellor. I enjoyed every moment we had with him, and I wish him well.

Mrs. Everett:

I guess I'm a little bit luckier since I came in 1976 after you fellows did what you had to do, and that was very wearing and troublesome and I understand that. But I've had the good fortune to be here for I guess it's about five years now and work closely with him, and, as he knows, needle him from time to time and often give him a hard time. But he's a wonderful person to give a hard time to because he's responsive and he listens and he evaluates, and it never creates a schism. You're always good friends again. I think he's a remarkable man. He's a person of high integrity and genuinely has the feeling of the students, the faculty and everyone concerned in this University. He is a very fine human being, and it's been a pleasure to be here with him. And I'm glad we'll have another fourteen months together in the same way.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the meeting was adjourned at 5:26 P.M.

**MARTIN J. WARMBRAND
Secretary of the Board**