

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE BOARD OF
TRUSTEES OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK**

HELD

FEBRUARY 22, 2000

**AT THE BOARD HEADQUARTERS BUILDING
535 EAST 80TH STREET – BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN**

The Chairperson called the meeting to order at 4:34 P.M.

There were present:

Herman Badillo, Chairman

**Satish K. Babbar
John J. Calandra
Kenneth E. Cook
Michael C. Crimmins
Alfred B. Curtis, Jr.
Randy M. Mastro**

**John Morning
Kathleen M. Pesile
George J. Rios
Nilda Soto Ruiz
Jeffrey S. Wiesenfeld**

Md. Mizanoor R. Biswas, ex officio

Bernard Sohmer, ex officio

**Secretary Genevieve Mullin
Roy P. Moskowitz, Acting General Counsel and Acting Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs
Hourig Messerlian, Executive Assistant
Kisha Fuentes
Anthony Vargas
Towanda Washington**

**Chancellor Matthew Goldstein
Interim Deputy Chancellor Patricia Hassett
President Fred W. Beaufait
President David A. Caputo
President Dolores Fernandez
President Ricardo R. Fernandez
President Frances Degen Horowitz
President Christoph M. Kimmich
Interim President Howard L. Lapidus
Interim President Sidney I. Lirtzman
President Gerald W. Lynch
Interim President Roberta S. Matthews**

**President Antonio Perez
President Allen Lee Sessoms
President Marlene Springer
President Carolyn G. Williams
Interim President Michael Zibrin
Dean Kristin Booth Glen
Interim Vice Chancellor Sherry Brabham
Vice Chancellor Jay Hershenson
Vice Chancellor Emma E. Macari
Vice Chancellor Brenda Richardson Malone
Vice Chancellor Louise Mirrer**

The absence of Vice Chairman Benno C. Schmidt, Jr., and Trustee Ronald J. Marino was excused.

A. VIDEOTAPING OF BOARD MEETING: Chairman Badillo announced that as in the past, CUNY-TV is transmitting today's meeting of the Board of Trustees live on cable Channel 75.

The calendar items were considered in the following order:

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the following resolutions were adopted: (Calendar Nos. 1 through 9)

NO. 1. UNIVERSITY REPORT: RESOLVED, That the University Report for February 22, 2000 (including Addendum Items) be approved:

(a) **ADDENDUM:** Withdraw the following:

D.12. THE COLLEGE OF STATEN ISLAND – ADMINISTRATIVE DESIGNATION – COMMITTEE APPROVAL NOT REQUIRED: The entry for Sam Ross is withdrawn.

(b) **ADDENDUM:** Add the following:

D.19. BROOKLYN COLLEGE – CHANGE IN TITLE FOR EXECUTIVE COMPENSATION PLAN PERSONNEL – (AFFIRMATIVE ACTION REPORT ON FILE EXCEPT ACTING APPOINTMENTS) (SW INDICATES WAIVER OF SEARCH):

DEPARTMENT TITLE	LAST NAME	FIRST NAME	CURRENT TITLE	PRIOR TITLE	EFFECTIVE DATE
Administrative Affairs Senior Vice President (Senior Vice President for Administrative Affairs)	Hassett	Patricia	Senior Vice President	Vice President	9/1/00

This action reflects a return from a leave of absence and a modification in title.

NO. 2. CHANCELLOR'S REPORT: RESOLVED, That the Chancellor's Report for February 22, 2000 (including Addendum Items) be approved:

(a) **ADDENDUM:** Withdraw the following:

D.2. HUNTER COLLEGE CAMPUS SCHOOL UPGRADE OF THE PLAYGROUND AND ADJACENT BUILDING PERIMETER: The item is withdrawn. This entry is included in Addendum Item D.1.

(b) **ADDENDUM:** Add the following:

PART C: FISCAL MATTERS
SECTION II: CONTRACTS FROM \$20,000 TO \$100,000 (CAPITAL BUDGET)

D.4 HUNTER COLLEGE CAMPUS SCHOOL RENOVATION OF THE SCIENCE LABORATORY FACILITIES:

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York authorize the Secretary of the Board to execute a contract with the firm of Graf & Lewent Architects for professional design and construction-related services as required for renovation of the science laboratory facilities at Hunter College Campus School, CUNY Project No. HC006-099. The contract cost of \$82,004 shall be chargeable to the City Capital Budget Project No. HC006-099. The contract shall be subject to approval as to form by the University Office of General Counsel.

EXPLANATION: This project will upgrade the science laboratories at Hunter College Campus Schools to accommodate computer teaching technology and to comply with current safety standards and accessibility requirements.

The proposed firm was selected in accordance with law and the procedures established by the University.

NO. 3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: RESOLVED, That the minutes of the regular Board meeting and Executive Session of January 24, 2000 be approved.

At this point Trustee Calandra joined the meeting.

NO. 6. COMMITTEE ON FACULTY, STAFF, AND ADMINISTRATION: RESOLVED, That the following item be approved:

A. THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK – EXECUTIVE COMPENSATION (SALARY) PLAN:

Statement of Trustee Morning regarding the Executive Compensation Salary Plan:

I think there is concern with regard to this and I would like to express it. It seems to me that we have done a great deal to break apart this University in some actions we have taken in the past, specifically in regard to remediation where I think we have sort of a two-class system, frankly. It seems to me that to take this approach on executive salaries, breaking it out into four categories, is a further stratification that I think may prove to be ultimately harmful to the sense of unity of the University. I think one of the strengths of our system in contrast to others is that we do have a great a sense of parity and equality among all of the executives. I certainly believe that definitely we must have an increase in salaries for presidents and other key executives in the University. But I think my response to this would be to move that this be referred to the appropriate Committee again for further consideration. More specifically, I think one possibility might be to look at a way to provide increases in the appropriate areas but without this sort of caste system, these four strata. I think the Chancellor's discretion could be relied upon to provide appropriate raises for these individuals, but without having this kind of block-step of categories.

Statement of Trustee Curtis regarding the Executive Compensation Salary Plan:

This Committee has worked long and hard to get this proposal on the table and I am sure that Trustee Morning understands that this is a step in the right direction, that it is imperative that we pass this compensation plan today. The ECP has not undergone significant revision since its adoption in 1987, and salaries paid to senior executives have not kept pace with the national market, placing the University at a competitive disadvantage. Recognizing that competitive compensation for the Chancellor, the presidents, and other senior executives is imperative to the success of The City University of New York, the Board engaged the services of William M. Mercer, Inc. in Spring, 1999, to conduct a market analysis and review. Based primarily on this review and other studies of comparable institutions, a revised salary plan has been designed. The primary objective of the proposed salary plan is to provide a total composition program that addresses the need to be competitive with the national market and a need to acknowledge the complexity of individual institutions.

We have got presidents and executives who are underpaid. We need to attract and keep good presidents. The pay scale has not kept pace with the economy in other institutions, and we must reward presidents and senior staffers for the excellent job they do. The plan includes recommendations for modifying salaries and other non-base compensation features. The plan also introduces a performance-based compensation structure with future salary growth tied to annual performance reviews. I strongly urge that we approve the recommendation of this Committee and at a future date, if we so desire, we can revisit it and perhaps provide some modification, but I strongly urge that we pass this proposal.

Statement of Chancellor Goldstein regarding the Executive Compensation Salary Plan:

City University is well out of lockstep with respect to any other system that I know. We have done our due diligence to look at other systems and tried to align compensation relative to the complexity of an organization, market conditions, and what is consistent in higher education across these United States. To pretend that one particular institution's chief executive deserves the same compensation when the level of complexity and depth of the institutions are very, very different seems to me not to be consistent or appropriate for a great University. So I would take exception that this is a caste system. It is not a caste system at all. There is no hierarchical rank with respect to one institution's importance or value relative to another and I would ask that you look very deeply at this compensation plan. The fact is that vice presidents and deans at institutions are invariant with respect to their compensation. There is not going to be any different levels of compensation, so there is no caste system or value placed in the administrative ranks. What we are doing is saying very simply that to attract and maintain chief executive officers at our colleges requires that we must be attentive to market conditions and the market conditions very, very clearly dictate a plan very comparable to what it is that we are proposing.

At this point Trustee Mastro joined the meeting.

Statement of Trustee Wiesenfeld regarding the Executive Compensation Salary Plan:

This University is, whether we desire it so or not, at this moment a federation of many colleges. Together they represent four different market sectors and each of them are part of the larger market. We don't create the market. We don't control the market. As much as every one of us and every faculty member, not only those who testified at the public hearing last week, but all of the faculty believes that City University is a unique University with a unique mission, nonetheless, it is part of a marketplace. Everything is part of a marketplace and we have to respond to it.

There has also been concern expressed that we are paying attention to the needs of the senior executives of this University, but what about the faculty. I think the most eloquent testimony regarding this issue was presented, very briefly and probably not knowingly, by President Horowitz of The Graduate Center when she said that in doing this we add, if you will, water and we will eventually lift all boats, and that will lead us to look at the equability of compensation of other units of this University, particularly faculty. We have to start somewhere. We are exceedingly behind the times. This is the best result certainly for the moment and we should move ahead because the postponement may make us look more deliberative, but I don't think it will make us look any more logical. I would urge that we move forward, vote this out in the affirmative, and move ahead.

Statement of Trustee Sohmer regarding the Executive Compensation Salary Plan:

It is difficult to ignore John Morning's argument. And it is not an argument which says that we don't need to compensate our executives, but it does say that the very structure differentiates them needlessly. Most conditions can be met very easily by merely broadbanding the salary range and leaving it to the discretion of the Chancellor and the Trustees where in that broadband folks fit. To automatically classify schools by a now defunct procedure, the Carnegie classification, and then say this has something to do with compensation for chief executives is just the kind of strawman which I think is not terribly meaningful. I would strongly suggest that it either be considered now or in the very near future to broadband the chief executive's salaries and place them, because of the complexity of their jobs, some place in that broadband and not automatically say that there are four roman numerals to which you either do or do not fit.

WHEREAS, Executive Compensation Plan (ECP) resolutions in 1987 and in 1994 state "that periodically...but no less frequently than every five years, the Board of Trustees shall review national peer data to compare and reassess its Executive Compensation (Salary) Plan", Board Minutes, June 27, 1994, Cal. No. 6.D.; and

WHEREAS, The last salary study undertaken by the University was completed in May 1994; and

WHEREAS, In February 1999, the Board of Trustees engaged the services of William M. Mercer, Inc., to perform such a review on its behalf; and

WHEREAS, Chapter 263 of the Laws of 1987 authorizes the Board of Trustees to establish and implement a Salary Plan for executive staff following consultation with the Governor's Office of Employee Relations and the Division of the Budget, and further requires the Board of Trustees to file a proposed Salary Plan Report with the Chairs of the Senate Finance Committee and the Assembly Ways and Means Committee and the Director of the Budget at least 60 days prior to the effective date of the Plan; now therefore be it

RESOLVED, That the Salary Plan Report (dated January 21, 2000) for the Executive Compensation Plan be approved effective May 1, 2000; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Chancellor is authorized to take all necessary actions to effect the implementation of the Salary Plan pursuant to Chapter 263 of the Laws of 1987 and to develop appropriate guidelines thereunder.

EXPLANATION: The Salary Plan covering executive staff at the University, known as the Executive Compensation Plan (ECP), has not undergone significant revision since its adoption in 1987. Salaries paid to senior executives have not kept pace with the national market and have placed the University at a competitive disadvantage.

The Board recognizes that competitive, market driven compensation for the Chancellor, the Presidents and other senior executives is necessary and critical to the success of The City University of New York and central to the Board's mandate to improve standards and promote accountability.

To this end, the Board has taken two actions designed to address this need. First, effective September 1, 1999, the Board increased the salary of the Chancellor to \$250,000 thus achieving parity with the salary paid to the Chancellor of the State University of New York (SUNY) at that time.

Second, The Board engaged the services of William M. Mercer, Inc., through competitive bid, to conduct a market analysis and review.

The primary objective of the proposed Salary Plan is to provide a total compensation program that addresses the need to be competitive with the national market and the need to acknowledge the complexity of individual institutions while promoting and recognizing individual excellent performance. The Salary Plan Report provides recommendations for the total compensation package including salary ranges for each title within the Executive Compensation Plan, as well as recommendations for modifications to the non-base compensation component of the plan (i.e., housing, severance, etc). The salary ranges for all titles are such that the salaries of incumbents are absorbed within the proposed ranges, thus eliminating the need to immediately increase current ECP salaries or incur other costs. For the title of President, salary ranges have been developed which reflect the division of the colleges into four distinct groups. The senior college groupings are based, in part, on the size, nature and complexity of the institutions. Movement of ECP staff through the ranges (toward the maximum) will be based on annual assessments of individual performance. These merit assessments will be pursuant to stated criteria and a well defined process that will be developed by the Chancellor and reviewed by the Board of Trustees. Any future modifications of salaries, within the appropriate range, and within the ECP, will be at the discretion of the Board of Trustees. **Trustee John Morning abstained.**

NOTE: See Appendix B

NO. 4. COMMITTEE ON FISCAL AFFAIRS: RESOLVED, That the following item be approved:

A. THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK (CENTRAL OFFICE) – UNIVERSITY INITIATIVE FOR THE PURCHASE OF COMPUTER EQUIPMENT:

WHEREAS, New York State law permits the Board of Trustees (the "Board") of The City University of New York (the "University") to make purchases through contracts let by the United States, the State of New York, the City of New York, or the Board of Education of the City of New York; and

WHEREAS, The University is committed to providing state-of-the-art technology to every faculty member, maximizing computer access for students, streamlining administrative applications at the colleges of the University (the "Colleges") and effectuating cross-campus compatibility in computer hardware, software, applications and connectivity; and

WHEREAS, The University is committed to decreasing costs through volume purchasing where appropriate; and

WHEREAS, The Chancellor wishes to streamline the procurement process for colleges; now therefore be it

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York authorize the colleges to purchase workstations, servers, networking equipment, and related peripheral devices under existing General Services Administration, or City of New York, or State of New York, or Board of Education of the City of New York contracts pursuant to law and University regulations. Such purchases shall not exceed a total estimated cost of \$5,000,000 chargeable to New York City or New York State Capital Budget or tax levy funds during the fiscal year ending June 30, 2000; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the colleges of The City University of New York submit proposed acquisitions under this resolution to the Chancellor for review; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Chancellor report such acquisitions to the Board by September 30, 2000.

EXPLANATION: This initiative will ensure increased standardization of computer equipment, promote articulation between systems, decrease costs based on volume acquisitions, and expedite college procurement of computer equipment.

NO. 5. COMMITTEE ON ACADEMIC POLICY, PROGRAM, AND RESEARCH: RESOLVED, That the following items be approved:

A. BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN COMMUNITY COLLEGE – CERTIFICATE IN OFFICE AUTOMATION:

RESOLVED, That the program in Office Automation leading to a Certificate to be offered at Borough of Manhattan Community College be approved, effective September, 2000, subject to financial ability.

EXPLANATION: The purpose of the proposed program is to provide students with the essential skills and knowledge necessary to perform effectively within the integrated electronic modern office environment. The program is designed for individuals who are currently employed and need to upgrade their skills, as well as for those who need to prepare for immediate employment. Borough of Manhattan Community College has, for many years, offered courses that enhance employment possibilities of individuals by upgrading their skills. The proposed Certificate program would offer courses in a sequential framework that would enable students to attain employment in a short period of time.

All of the courses required in the proposed curriculum are already offered on a regularly scheduled basis and support other degree programs at the College. In addition, all credits earned in completing the Certificate can be applied towards the Associate degree program in Office Automation.

B. BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN COMMUNITY COLLEGE – A.A. IN WRITING AND LITERATURE:

RESOLVED, That the program in Writing and Literature leading to the Associate in Arts degree to be offered at Borough of Manhattan Community College be approved, effective September, 2000, subject to financial ability.

EXPLANATION: The purpose of the proposed program is to provide the opportunity for students to prepare in the basic liberal arts and sciences for the first two years of college education with particular emphasis on writing and literature so they may transfer into a broad spectrum of upper division baccalaureate programs in English Literature, Language Arts, or related disciplines at four-year colleges. The program is designed to focus, enrich, intensify, and strengthen students' education in communication arts and critical thinking in order to provide them with the diverse

humanistic literacy that today's global market demands. Specific articulation agreements have been secured with Brooklyn College and Hunter College. The proposed curriculum builds on existing courses in the liberal arts and sciences. Since students will be drawn from those currently enrolled at the College and since qualified faculty are in place to teach all the courses in the program, no additional costs are anticipated to implement this program.

At this point Trustee Curtis left the meeting.

C. LEHMAN COLLEGE – CUNY INSTITUTE FOR IRISH-AMERICAN STUDIES:

RESOLVED, That the CUNY Institute for Irish-American Studies be established at Lehman College in accordance with the Policy Guidelines on Research Centers and Institutes set forth by the Board of Trustees in February, 1995.

EXPLANATION: The purpose of the proposed Institute is to foster educational, scholarly, and artistic activities that focus on various aspects of the Irish-American experience and culture, their origins, and their role in shaping the development and culture of New York City and the nation. The University currently sponsors a number of significant centers and institutes for ethnic and area studies. The development and collaboration of these institutes broadens the understanding of different cultures and how they have contributed to the development of American society and culture. This interchange also results in educational and cultural opportunities for CUNY students and the larger New York City community.

The proposed Institute will evolve as financial support becomes available. An Advisory Board, comprised of representatives from the colleges, as well as appropriate cultural and educational institutions, will assist in providing leadership and guidance to the Institute.

At this point Trustee Cook joined the meeting.

NO. 7. COMMITTEE ON FACILITIES, PLANNING, AND MANAGEMENT: RESOLVED, That the following item be approved:

A. HUNTER COLLEGE – CENTRAL CHILLER AND BOILER PLANT PROJECT:

WHEREAS, Pursuant to an Energy Cost Reduction Program ("ENCORE") Agreement dated February 14, 1997 among the Power Authority of the State of New York ("NYPA"), The City of New York ("City"), the Board of Education of the City School District of the City of New York ("BOE"), The City University of New York ("CUNY"), and the New York City Health and Hospitals Corporation ("HHC"), NYPA agreed to finance the cost of and provide program management and implementation services for certain energy efficiency programs of CUNY, BOE, and HHC; and

WHEREAS, Pursuant to the ENCORE Agreement the sum of \$10.7 million is available for CUNY senior college programs; and

WHEREAS, CUNY has identified as the most urgent senior college energy program need the replacement of aging and inadequate decentralized refrigeration equipment with a new, more efficient central heating and cooling plant at Hunter College ("the Project"); and

WHEREAS, The total cost of the Project is estimated not to exceed \$19.5 million; and

WHEREAS, NYPA will provide design, construction and project management for the Project and will finance a portion of the Project cost, not to exceed \$10.7 million (the "NYPA Share"), pursuant to a Customer Installation Commitment ("CIC") as authorized by the ENCORE Agreement; and

WHEREAS, The NYPA share will be repaid over a 10-year period from energy savings realized in the CUNY operating budget; and

WHEREAS, The Dormitory Authority of the State of New York ("DASNY") will, pursuant to a memorandum of understanding among NYPA, CUNY, and DASNY (the "MOU"), serve as the CUNY Authorized Representative for the Project and provide the balance of Project cost from CUNY bond proceeds in an amount estimated not to exceed \$8.8 million (the "CUNY Share"); now therefore be it

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York authorize the Secretary to execute an initial and a final CIC, the MOU, and all other instruments, documents, or agreements necessary to give effect to this resolution; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the City University Construction Fund is hereby requested to authorize DASNY to serve as the CUNY Authorized Representative for the Project and to provide the CUNY Share.

EXPLANATION: The Project will provide Hunter College with (i) a central, expanded chiller plant to replace aging and inadequate equipment and provide sufficient capacity to meet Master Plan goals and reach spaces not currently air conditioned and (ii) a central high-pressure boiler plant to replace the existing expensive and corrosive Con Edison steam service. The energy cost savings from these installations have been calculated as sufficient to repay the NYPA share over a 10-year period.

NO. 8. HONORARY DEGREES: RESOLVED, That the following honorary degrees, approved by the appropriate faculty body and recommended by the Chancellor, be presented at the commencement exercises as specified:

COLLEGE	DEGREE
THE CITY COLLEGE	
Ms. Joyce Coppin	Doctor of Humane Letters
Dr. Nathan Glazer	Doctor of Humane Letters
Mr. David Halberstam	Doctor of Humane Letters
Mr. George Lamming	Doctor of Humane Letters
Mr. Henry J. Stern	Doctor of Laws
(To be awarded at the June 2, 2000, Commencement)	
THE GRADUATE SCHOOL AND UNIVERSITY CENTER	
Dr. Anna Jacobson Schwartz	Doctor of Humane Letters
Dr. A. Jess Shenson	Doctor of Humane Letters
Dr. Walter J. Turnbull	Doctor of Music
(To be awarded at the June 1, 2000, Commencement)	
HUNTER COLLEGE	
George J. Mitchell, Esq.	Doctor of Humane Letters
(To be awarded at the April 6, 2000, Public Leadership Program)	

HUNTER COLLEGE

Dr. Rose Dobrof	Doctor of Humane Letters
-----------------	--------------------------

Dr. Harold Lewis	Doctor of Humane Letters
------------------	--------------------------

Dr. Irwin Redlener	Doctor of Science
--------------------	-------------------

(To be awarded at the June 1, 2000, Commencement)

HUNTER COLLEGE

Mr. James Earl Jones	Doctor of Fine Arts
----------------------	---------------------

Richard Riley, Esq.	Doctor of Humane Letters
---------------------	--------------------------

Dr. Oscar Arias Sanchez	Doctor of Humane Letters
-------------------------	--------------------------

(To be awarded at the June 2, 2000, Commencement)

HUNTER COLLEGE

Ms. Bel Kaufman	Doctor of Humane Letters
-----------------	--------------------------

Gabrielle Kirk McDonald, Esq.	Doctor of Laws
-------------------------------	----------------

(To be awarded at the January 25, 2001, Commencement)

QUEENS COLLEGE

Dr. Erika Eichhorn Bourguignon	Doctor of Humane Letters
--------------------------------	--------------------------

Mr. Arnold Franco	Doctor of Humane Letters
-------------------	--------------------------

Mr. George Perle	Doctor of Music
------------------	-----------------

(To be awarded at the June 7, 2000, Commencement)

NO. 9. COMMITTEE ON STUDENT AFFAIRS AND SPECIAL PROGRAMS:**Report of Committee Chairman Crimmins:**

Although there weren't any action items before the Committee on Student Affairs and Special Programs this month, the Committee received a report from the New York Public Interest Research Group (NYPRIG). The CUNY Bylaws provide that recipients of extramural student activity fees shall present an annual report to the Chancellor for the appropriate Board Committee detailing the activities, benefits, and finances of the extramural body as they pertain to the colleges where students are paying an extramural fee. NYPRIG is a Statewide student-directed research and advocacy group. It is funded through student activity fees that are voted upon by students through the referendum process. Currently NYPRIG chapters exist at seven CUNY campuses. This year the activities of the Brooklyn College Chapter were highlighted. Students learn public speaking, writing, research, and media skills while working on such issues as voter registration, citizenship, anti-sweatshop legislation, toxic wastes, and public transit. A copy of the complete report is on file in the Office of the Secretary.

B. TRUSTEE CONGRATULATIONS: Chairman Badillo, on behalf of the Board of Trustees and everyone at the University, offered congratulations and best wishes to Trustee Mizanoor Biswas on his marriage to Tajan on January 28.

C. BROOKLYN COLLEGE – INTRODUCTION OF NEW PRESIDENT: Chairman **Badillo** stated that on behalf of the Board of Trustees, I would like to extend a very hearty welcome to **Dr. Christoph Kimmich**, who became the eighth President of **Brooklyn College** on February 1. And as we all know, Dr. Kimmich served as Interim Chancellor for almost two years and we are delighted to have him here with us again in his new position. Congratulations and best wishes.

D. STUDENT/ALUMNI HONORS: Chairman **Badillo** called on **Trustee Crimmins**, who announced the following:

1. **Vivian Ka**, a student in **City College's Sophie Davis School of Biomedical Education** was named to USA Today's 11th Annual All-USA College Academic First Team, and **Sherry Hsu**, another **Sophie Davis** student was named to the Academic Second Team. Both students have perfect 4.0 academic averages.

The teams consisting of twenty students each were selected by a panel of judges from 828 students nominated by colleges throughout the country. Students chosen to participate in these academic teams are being honored for their academic excellence and community service throughout the country.

I am happy to say they are both with us today with **Dr. Judy Meyer, Associate Dean for Student Affairs of the CUNY Medical School**, and I would like them stand up and take a bow. We congratulate them on their academic achievements and for their leadership roles and activities on and off campus.

2. **Ann Cammet**, a third-year law student at the **CUNY School of Law**, has been selected by Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher, & Flom to be one of twenty-seven Skadden Fellows for the year 2000. This Fellowship was established eleven years ago to fund law students and judicial clerks who provide civil legal services to the poor. Ms. Cammet is only the fourth **CUNY Law School** student to receive this prestigious Fellowship and so we congratulate her too.

E. CONDOLENCES: Chairman **Badillo** announced the following:

1. On behalf of the Board of Trustees and the Administration, I would like to offer condolences to the family of the late **Samuel J. Silberman**, who passed away on January 29, 2000. Mr. Silberman was a strong advocate for social work education and research and he created awards for educators and scholarships for students. It was through his largess that the **Hunter College of Social Work** was constructed.

2. I would also like to offer condolences on behalf of the Board of Trustees and the Administration, to the family of the late **Norman Henkin** who passed away on January 30, 2000. He served as a member of the **Board of Higher Education** from February 28, 1969 to December 31, 1973. Mr. Henkin was a member of the Board during the University's expansion years.

3. It is with a note of sadness that I extend condolences on behalf of the Board of Trustees and the Administration to the family of the late **Etta Proshansky**, who passed away on February 12, 2000. The wife of former **Graduate School President Harold Proshansky**, she was a part of **The Graduate Center** community for many years and a generous participant in its activities.

F. PRESIDENTS HONORS: Chairman **Badillo** called on **Trustee Calandra** who announced the following:

1. On February 2, **President Antonio Perez** of the **Borough of Manhattan Community College** was recognized for the work he and the College have been doing to meet the educational needs of Chinese Americans, particularly in New York's Chinatown, by the New York City Hall Lions. He was also named an "Advisor" to the City Hall Lions.

On March 30, **President Perez** will receive a Good Scout award from the Boy Scouts of America at a reception in Washington Heights. This award recognizes his contributions in creating more educational opportunities in the communities of upper Manhattan, and in particular in Washington Heights.

G. FACULTY HONORS: Chairman Badillo called on Trustee Calandra who announced the following:

1. **Professor Rose Dobrof**, the Founding Director of **Hunter College's Brookdale Center on Aging**, and a member of **Hunter's School of Social Work** faculty until her retirement in 1995, was awarded the prestigious **Claude Pepper Award for Excellence**. This award is presented to a professional in the field of aging, who has demonstrated ongoing commitment to the development of a continuum of services to enable older people to live with dignity, independence, and autonomy.
2. **Dr. Katherine Nelson**, Distinguished Professor of Psychology at **The Graduate School and University Center**, received the 1999 Award for Distinguished Scientific Contributions to Child Development from the Society for Research and Child Development.
3. **Dr. Glenn Peterson**, Professor of Anthropology at **The Graduate School and University Center**, was appointed a member of the Federated States of Micronesia's Mission to the United Nations. In this position he will serve as the Mission's representative to the Third Committee on Social, Cultural, and Humanitarian concerns.
4. **Professor Ana Celia Zentella** of **Hunter College** was the recipient of the 1999 ALLA Book Award for her publication, *Growing Up Bilingual*. The ALLA Book competition is held every three years and the award is given for the best book published within the last five years on any facet of anthropology that concerns issues related to the U.S. Latinas/Latinos and their communities.

H. COLLEGE HONORS: Chairman Badillo called on Trustee Ruiz who announced the following:

1. **Hunter College** is listed as Number 276 on the Philanthropy 400 listing in the November 4, 1999 issue of *The Chronicle of Philanthropy*. To be included in the list of 400, organizations had to raise at least \$22 million from private sources, that is foundations, corporations or individuals. **Hunter College** was the only CUNY institution to be on the list.
2. **Brooklyn College** has been recognized for leadership in the field of student character development by "The Templeton Guide: Colleges that Encourage Character Development," a guidebook released nationwide last year. **Brooklyn College** was cited for its Freshman Year Program, which was inaugurated in 1984 to equip first year students with the skills they need for academic achievement.

I. GRANTS: Chairman Badillo presented for inclusion in the record the following report of Grants of \$100,000 or above received by the University subsequent to the January 24, 2000 Board meeting:**THE CITY COLLEGE**

- | | | |
|----|-----------|---|
| A. | \$954,726 | NIH to Roman, S., Administration, for "Cellular/Molecular Basis of Development: Research Center." |
| B. | \$555,595 | NIH to Roman, S., Administration, for "Cellular/Molecular Basis of Development-Research Center (Supplement)." |
| C. | \$404,883 | WHITAKER FOUNDATION to Weinbaum, S., Mech. Engineering, for "Establish an Interdepartmental Ph.D. Program in Biomedical Engineering." |
| D. | \$399,775 | US DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION to DeJongh, J., Education-Admin., for "Underground Railroad Educational and Cultural Programs." |
| E. | \$360,774 | US DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION to Paaswell, R., Transportation, for "University Transportation Research Center-Administration (Parent Account) (YR12)." |
| F. | \$348,421 | NSF to Lazaridis, T., Chemistry, for "Career: Molecular Modeling of Membrane Protein Folding and Membrane Fusion." |
| G. | \$322,382 | NIH/DHHS to Rowland-Scott, S., Med. School-Admin., for "Health Careers Opportunity |

Program.”

- H. \$285,634 **NIH** to Boto, W., Biology, for “Minority International Research Training Grant.”
- I. \$153,350 **US DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION** to Shapiro, N., Education-Admin., for “Preparing Tomorrow’s Teachers to Use Technology.”
- J. \$145,100 **NIH** to Spatz, L., Microbiology, for “Viral Etiology of Systemic Lupus Erythematosus.”
- K. \$137,000 **BMDO** to Gertner, I., Computer Science, for “Designing Radar Waveforms Processing the Thumbtack Ambiguity Functions.”
- L. \$120,000 **ARO** to Agrawal, A., Civ. Engineering, for “Development of a Laboratory for Dynamic Testing of Structures & Materials at The City College of New York.”

NEW YORK CITY TECHNICAL COLLEGE

- A. \$170,000 **NEW YORK CITY HEALTH AND HOSPITALS CORPORATION** to Melikian, Y., for “Medical Billing & Coding Specialist Training.”
- B. \$137,000 **US DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION** to Falk, W., for “Child Care.”

QUEENS COLLEGE

- A. \$300,000 **NATIONAL ENDOWMENT FOR THE HUMANITIES** to Cogswell, M., The Louis Armstrong House and Archives, for “Repair and Restoration of The Louis Armstrong House.”
- B. \$211,495 **NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION** to Leiner, M., The School of Education, for Townsend Harris High School/Queens College Collaborative Project.”
- C. \$149,298 **NIH/NATIONAL INSTITUTE ON DRUG ABUSE** to Magazine, H., The Biology Department, for “Vascular Smooth Muscle Opioid Receptors.”
- D. \$134,959 **NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION** to Longo, P., The School of Education, for “Louis Armstrong Middle School and The Queens Partnership for Middle School Reflective Practice.”
- E. \$118,102 **PACE/PAPER, ALLIED-INDUSTRIAL CHEMICAL & ENERGY INTERNATIONAL UNION** to Markowitz, S., The Center for The Biology of Natural Systems, for “Medical Surveillance of Former Workers at the Gaseous Diffusion Plants of the DOE: Phase II Implementation.”

THE COLLEGE OF STATEN ISLAND

- A. \$218,911 **NEW YORK STATE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT** to Sonnenblick, C., for “Literacy/GED – Workforce Investment Act.”
- B. \$151,063 **NIH** to Kest, B., w/University of Illinois, for “Sex-Specific Genetic Mediation of Pain & Analgesia.”
- C. \$137,485 **DHHS** to Reese, L., for “Scholarships for Disadvantaged Students.”

J. ORAL REPORT OF THE CHANCELLOR: Chancellor Goldstein reported the following:

1. It is wonderful to see **Dean Kristin Glen** back at the table. We wish you a very speedy recovery and we miss you at the **Law School**, even though I know that you have been back several hours a day. It is wonderful to see you and we wish you a total recovery in your health.

2. I would like to extend my congratulations to **President David A. Caputo (Hunter College)** on having been offered and subsequently accepting the position of President at Pace University. David will stay with us until Bastille Day when he will formally leave the University. We will miss you and it is wonderful that you will still be in New York, and we look forward to closely working with you as well. Congratulations, David.

3. I, too, welcome **Christoph Kimmich** to the Council of Presidents. He did a very distinguished job as Interim Chancellor and I know he is going to bring **Brooklyn College** to even greater heights. It is wonderful to see you here, Christoph, and I look forward to working with you.

4. Dr. Irwin Polishook has stepped down after twenty-four years of service as President of the Professional Staff Congress. Dr. Richard Boris, the First Vice President, succeeds him for the remainder of his term. We note our profound appreciation for the very fine work that Dr. Polishook did on behalf of this University for over three decades, and we certainly look forward in the weeks and months ahead of showing our appreciation for his exemplary work.

5. With respect to the State budget, I testified on February 2 before the Assembly Ways and Means and Senate Finance Committees of the Legislature in Albany. We presented a very balanced statement about the Governor's budget, which I said publicly was a very good start. In fact, it is a turn for the better from what we have seen in recent years. We will continue to work closely with the Governor's office and the legislative leadership on budgetary improvements to the Executive Budget and are hopeful at the end of this process that we will get restorations and favorable consideration on some of the items that we think are vital in order for this University to continue its process of renewal.

There are a whole panoply of activities planned around our CUNY Legislative Action Committee (CLAC). Presidents have been asked to represent their boroughs with legislators in their districts and we expect a very, very important and expanded set of outreach to get consideration, especially on several items that we think are so vitally important for this University.

First and foremost, in the last twenty years since 1980, this University has lost over 19% of its full-time faculty. Great universities cannot continue to be great unless they are able to attract and maintain full-time faculty. And it is not just full-time faculty. It is academic support personnel that we have lost in large numbers over this period of time as well. This will be the focal point for the actions that we take over the next several months and we are hopeful that we will get many of the things restored, especially in the area of full-time faculty.

The Board of Trustees will be in Albany on March 6 and 7. A number of presidents and members of the Chancellery will accompany the Board, and we have a series of events planned for those two days to work with the various legislators.

6. The statements about enrollment are not positive. FTE's are down by about 1.8% at the senior colleges and 1.7% at the community colleges. CUNY's enrollment is declining in part because the number of students who leave the University every year exceeds the number of new students that come in. CUNY must do more than attract new students, it also must retain its students until they graduate. Certainly, much of the public discussion that started in the summer and proceeded through the fall, until the Regents vote, did not serve us well in that so many students and stake holders felt somewhat at bay with respect to knowing what the University was prepared to do for students.

We have tried very, very desperately to get those messages across. I will be sending a letter out to over 80,000 juniors in the schools in this City to talk about the great opportunities that this University has, and trying to convince them of how important this University is to their life's ambitions. I, personally, have been involved in a number of radio and TV spots, not only talking with our students but talking about this great University and why students ought to give serious consideration to coming here. The campaign for changing the conversation about City University continues and you will see in the next several weeks and in the months ahead other ads positioning this University in ways that we haven't seen before.

And, lastly, I have directed that each of our presidents and colleges within each of the boroughs have a series of receptions for guidance counselors and others who are involved in student decisions to go to one university as opposed to another. I will be attending each of those borough meetings and hopefully we will be able to answer questions that may be certainly not answerable by certain people right now.

7. Presidential searches are moving ahead. We expect to conclude the President's searches at **Baruch, LaGuardia, and Queensborough**, and shortly thereafter **Kingsborough**. It is my intention also, working with Chairman Badillo, to expedite the search for the next President of **Hunter College**.

8. Efforts at **City College** are proceeding at a quiet but methodical level. We have gone through our very, very complete analysis of workload issues at **City College**, and issues around centers and institutes. On March 2, I believe, we will have a science, engineering and technology strategic planning committee ready to go. **Stanford Roman**, our **Interim President** at **City College**, is putting together yet another team that ultimately will have a strategic plan for the Middle States visit that occurs in early fall. We hope to announce publicly, given that we have done all of this work in a very quiet way, working with various faculty groups and administrators at **City College** and putting in people at key positions, a search for a new President at **City College** as well.

9. I am pleased to say that we have received a very warm and gracious letter from the Director of the Whitney Museum of American Art, Mr. Maxwell Anderson. In a letter to **Professor Sally Webster** of **Lehman College**, he has indicated that all students at CUNY for this next academic year will be admitted to the Whitney Museum free of charge. This is very consistent with a vision, if you will, a wish and a hope that I have, as we launch the CUNY Honors Academy, to provide a cultural passport for our students who wish to avail themselves of the great cultural depth that exists in this wonderful City. The Whitney Museum is the first to come on board and we expect many other announcements in that way as well.

Chairman Badillo stated that apropos of what the Chancellor said on the question of enrollment, I think you should all know that the Chancellor and I recently had a press conference with President William Thompson and Chancellor Harold Levy of the Board of Education, in which we agreed to extend the College Now program to every high school in the City and to cover every grade, beginning with the 9th grade and going through the 10th, 11th and 12th grades. All of you college presidents will be assigned to individual high schools to make sure that we cover all of them, because what I am most concerned about is the incredible drop-out rate from high schools in the 9th and 10th grades, where about 50% of the students drop-out. If we can get those students to stay in high school and graduate, we will have a tremendous increase in enrollment, but more importantly we will insure that the avenues of opportunity will be open to those young people who now have no place to go. So, this is a very important development.

Secondly, in the Winter 2000 issue of **CUNY Matters** there is a letter from me regarding a program called Child Health Plus. What this involves is the fact that we have in this City a huge percentage of people who have no health insurance at all, because they are too young for Medicare and they have a job and, therefore, they don't qualify for Medicaid. Now, I have ascertained that there are 37,000 students in The City University who have children who are under nineteen years old. We are going to be going into each college, beginning probably with BMCC, and we are going to hold a press conference very shortly. I would like the individual college presidents to identify these individuals and help us to get them enrolled in the Child Health Plus Program because it doesn't cost them anything, and even though we can't provide for the parents at least we can provide for the children, and that's very important. There is no reason why we should not insure that all 37,000 of those students are covered. So, I appreciate the support of every college president and of all the members of the Board of Trustees.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the meeting was adjourned at 5:17 P.M.

SECRETARY GENEVIEVE MULLIN

(This is a detailed summary of the Board of Trustees' meeting. The tapes of the meeting are available in the Office of the Secretary of the Board for a period of three years.)

**THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK
EXECUTIVE COMPENSATION PLAN
SALARY PLAN REPORT**

I. EXECUTIVE COMPENSATION PLAN – SALARY RANGES:

Title	Current salaries - Effective 10/1/98	Salary Ranges
Chancellor	\$250,000 (effective 9/99)	\$250,000 - \$350,000*
Executive Vice Chancellor	\$153,898	\$145,000 - \$224,500
Dean of Medical School	\$153,898	\$142,000 - \$203,000
President**	\$136,661	
Senior College: I. Research		\$136,661 - \$201,000
II. PhD/MA/BA		\$129,000 - \$177,500
III. BA/AA		\$127,500 - \$168,000
Community College		
IV. AA		\$124,500 - \$162,000
Dean of Law School	\$135,432	\$135,000 - \$199,000
Senior Vice Chancellor	N/A	\$124,000 - \$192,000
Vice Chancellor	\$116,964	\$116,964 - \$182,000
Secretary of the Board***	\$109,124	\$100,500 - \$156,000
Senior Vice President	\$96,868 - \$115,379	\$100,500 - \$155,500
University Dean/University Administrator/Vice President	\$94,928 - \$114,901	\$94,500 - \$146,000
Dean/Administrator/ Assistant Vice President	\$92,904 - \$112,602	\$84,000 - \$130,000
University Associate Dean/ University Associate Administrator	\$91,166 - \$104,844	\$77,500 - \$120,000
Associate Dean/Associate Administrator	\$82,050 - \$102,749	\$70,500 - \$109,000
University Assistant Dean/Univ. Assistant Administrator****	N/A	\$66,500 - \$103,000
Assistant Dean/Assistant Administrator	N/A	\$63,600 - \$100,000

(Revised January 21, 2000)

*Salary range of the Chancellor modified to maintain parity with SUNY. All future modifications of salaries within the appropriate range, and within the ECP, are at the discretion of the BOT.

**Senior Colleges I. Research: Baruch, Brooklyn, City, Hunter, GSUC, Queens
 II. PhD/Masters/Baccalaureate: John Jay, Lehman, Staten Island
 III. Baccalaureate/Associate: Medgar Evers, NYCTC, York

Community Colleges

 IV: Associate: BMCC, Bronx, Hostos, Kingsborough, LaGuardia, Queensborough

***Formerly included with University Administrator title.

****University Assist. Dean/University Assist Administrator & Assist Dean/Assist Administrator titles were formerly REMs

II. EXECUTIVE NON-BASE COMPENSATION PLAN

	Current CUNY policy	Modifications
Automobile/Auto Allowance	Yes - Chancellor and Presidents receive car and driver, Law School and Medical School Deans provided with car and driver; Deputy Chancellor and Vice Chancellors provided with cars	Continue
Housing	Yes - Senior College Presidents provided with campus-owned or leased residence; Community College Presidents, Medical School Dean and Law School Dean with Housing allowance of \$ 3,000 per month; Acting Presidents receive \$2,000 per month (both senior and community); Chancellor receives housing allowance of \$7,500/month	Continue with biannual review and modification of housing allowance based on cost of consultation with NYS Division of the Budget
Involuntary separation	Yes - Stipulated by "Terms and Conditions" document	Continue
Severance Pay (Voluntary Separation)	No	Institute one semester's salary (lump sum) upon retirement from The University after seven years of service as Chancellor or President in addition to any Travia (sick leave) pay and annual leave pay
Health Insurance	Yes - same health and welfare benefit options as other University Instructional staff	Continue
Retirement	Yes - same retirement options as other Instructional staff	Continue
Permission and limits to earning outside income	Permitted to engage in outside consultation and professional activities up to a maximum of two days per month; days other than regular days off are charged to annual leave	Continue
Expense Accounts	Non-tax levy expense accounts for reimbursable expenses are submitted with appropriate documentation	Continue
Memberships in clubs or associations	Most Presidents hold memberships in a limited number of professional associations or organizations	Continue
Study Leave	Three months at full salary during every 5 th year of service in lieu of vacation time for that year; available to the Chancellor, Deputy Chancellor, Vice Chancellors, Presidents, Sr. Vice Presidents, Vice Presidents; also available to Deans and Administrators who report directly to the President	Continue with substitution of Executive Vice Chancellor for Deputy Chancellor and addition of Senior Vice Chancellor as eligible

III. EXECUTIVE COMPENSATION PLAN - SALARY REVIEW

A. Introduction

Innovative, highly competent, visionary and accountable leadership is essential as the University enters the next millennium. The current Executive Compensation Plan (ECP) does not provide the Board, the Chancellor or the college Presidents the ability to offer competitive salaries, to adjust salaries as may be necessary to retain current qualified executives, or to reward excellent performance. This lack of flexibility, as well as the erosion of the University's executive salaries over time, has resulted in a need to review the plan in an effort to restore the University's competitive advantage and ensure its ability to attract and retain highly competent employees.

B. History and Background

The Board of Trustees Executive Compensation Plan resolutions (both in 1987 and in 1994) state "that periodically thereafter, but no less frequently than every five years, the Board of Trustees shall review national peer data to compare and reassess its Executive Compensation (Salary) Plan" (Board Minutes 6/27/94). The most recent salary study undertaken by CUNY was completed in May 1994, and shared with the Board of Trustees at that time. The following review is consistent with the stated intention of the Board of Trustees.

The current Executive Compensation Plan of The City University of New York (CUNY) can be traced to the early 1980's when the Board of Trustees adjusted the salaries of the Chancellor, Deputy Chancellor, Presidents, and Vice Chancellors and eliminated all REMS (salary supplements) for these titles. The base salary plus the REM was replaced by a total salary and was linked, for each executive title, to comparable positions at the State University of New York (SUNY). In 1982, when the Board appointed the late Joseph Murphy as Chancellor, the explanation in the Board's resolution stated:

"This resolution fixes the salary of the Chancellor of The City University of New York at the same level as the current salary of the Chancellor of the State University of New York, with the understanding that parity in salary between these positions will be maintained in the future." (Board minutes, 6/22/82)

The Board of Trustees also linked the salaries of incumbent CUNY Presidents to the salaries of presidents at SUNY (Board minutes, 12/21/81).

During the mid 1980's, the Board continued to review and adjust the salaries of CUNY executive staff, in consultation with the State Division of the Budget, and in relation to comparable salaries and positions at SUNY. In 1986, the Board eliminated REMs for the titles of Vice President, University Dean/University Administrator, Dean, Administrator, Assistant Vice President, University Associate Dean/University Associate Administrator, and Associate Dean/Associate Administrator. These titles were added to the Executive Compensation Plan and salaries were linked to equivalent positions at SUNY (Board minutes, 1/27/86, 4/28/86, 11/24/86).

At its meeting of October 20, 1987, The City University Board of Trustees adopted the Salary Plan Report that contained the Executive Compensation (Salary) Plan covering the Chancellor, the College Presidents, the Deans of the Medical School and the Law School and the University's senior officers at the central administration. The Salary Plan Report (with amendments) and the Terms and Conditions of Employment for Staff in The Executive Compensation Plan (adopted by the Board on 1/1/87) are the documents that govern the current Executive Compensation Plan. The Salary Plan Report was developed in accordance with Chapter 263 of the Laws of 1987, which authorized both The City University of New York and The State University of New York to establish and implement salary plans in consultation with the New York State Division of the Budget, and the Governor's Office of Employee Relations with a 60 day notification to the Ways and Means Committee of the State Assembly, the Finance Committee of the New York State Senate, and the Director of the Budget.

In accordance with Board policy at that time, senior executive salaries (Chancellor, Deputy Chancellor, Presidents, Vice Chancellors, and the Deans of the Medical School and the Law School) were to be adjusted annually in accordance with general increases for State Commissioners. Salary increases for the executive titles of Vice President and below (Dean, Administrator, Assistant Vice President, Associate Dean, Associate Administrator and corresponding University titles at the central office) were to be adjusted in accordance with general salary increases for New York State Management/Confidential (M/C)

employees. In 1994, the Board amended the Salary Plan resolution so that future salary adjustments for all titles in the Executive Compensation Plan would be linked to general salary increases for New York State M/C employees. This change was designed to promote greater comparability with SUNY and consistency within the administration of CUNY's Executive Compensation Plan.

C. Salary Increases

Because CUNY's current salary plan links adjustments in salaries and salary ranges for all positions in the Executive Compensation Plan to salary increases for New York State Management/Confidential (M/C) Employees, the salary adjustments awarded to staff in the Executive Compensation Plan over the years have been extremely modest and have not kept pace with the national competitive market.

Since 1990, for example, Presidents have received increases totaling a mere 16.25%. This contrasts sharply with the 40.6% increase reported for executives by the College and University Personnel Association (CUPA) for the same time period.

During the five-year period, from 1988 through 1993, only two salary increases were implemented for senior executive titles (5% in June 1988 and 4% in April 1993). The other executive titles (Vice Presidents and below) received salary improvements in 1989 (5%), 1990 (5.5%; senior vice presidents: 3.8%), and 1993 (4%).

As noted earlier, in 1994 all executive increases were linked to salary improvements for New York State M/C employees. As a result of this change in policy, eligible Executive Compensation Plan employees received salary increases in 1994 (5.25%), in 1997 (3.5%), and in 1998 (3.5%). In July 1999, the Board adopted a resolution increasing the salary of the Chancellor to \$250,000, the same salary as was paid to the SUNY Chancellor at that time.

D. Salary Study

As stated, CUNY's Salary Plan has not undergone significant revision since its adoption by the Board of Trustees in 1987. In Fall 1998, the Board moved to engage the services of a consultant to survey peer colleges and universities, to gather current market comparability data and to review other elements of total compensation, including the use of the compensation system to foster and reward individual excellent performance. The consultant was also to examine performance assessment tools as well as other indirect compensation and salary administration strategies. The firm of William Mercer, Inc. was the vendor selected by the Board of Trustees, through competitive bid, for this purpose. Mercer gathered data through the use of customized, as well as existing, national surveys. In particular, data from the College and University Personnel Association's Administrative Compensation Survey, a custom cut of that same survey and a peer systems survey conducted by Mercer were reviewed. In addition to Mercer's study, CUNY conducted a customized telephone survey and examined the 1998-1999 Alabama Survey of Administrative Salaries.

The results of the reviews are found in the attached appendices as follows:

- ❖ Appendix I provides a salary comparison of chief executives (Chancellors) at peer University systems.
- ❖ Appendix II provides a salary comparison of presidents at single institutions.
- ❖ Appendix III provides CUNY and SUNY salaries for positions in the Chancellory along with averages cited by the Alabama Survey of Administrative Salaries.
- ❖ Appendix IV provides a salary comparison of senior executives at CUNY and SUNY.

E. Modifications

On the basis of material gathered from the Mercer review along with the Alabama Survey of Administrative Salaries Report and CUNY surveys, a recommendation to modify the structure of the current Executive Compensation Plan and the associated salaries has been developed. The restructuring of the salary plan establishes, for the first time in CUNY, a tiering of the colleges into four groupings that are similar in nature to the SUNY campus groupings and which correspond roughly to the Carnegie classifications for institutions of higher education. Further, the new structure represents a true performance-based compensation structure. Increases in salary will be based on evaluations of performance and goal attainment as determined by the Board of Trustees (for the Chancellor), the Chancellor (for the Presidents and Chancellory), or President (for campus executives). **There are no automatic increases as a result of this change. All salary improvements are driven by and subject to a performance review.** Campus or system funds will absorb all performance-based increases recommended in the future. Similarly, funds for

Presidential severance upon retirement, as well as future housing allowance increases will be absorbed by the colleges or the Chancellory.

1. Structure:

1a. Tier Differential

Under the plan, each CUNY college will be placed into one of four groupings based on the following criteria:

- ❖ Ratio of doctoral faculty to full-time faculty
- ❖ Percentage of enrollment in graduate programs
- ❖ Percentage of degrees awarded in graduate programs
- ❖ Five-year average headcount enrollment
- ❖ Complexity of regular as well as professional programs at undergraduate and graduate levels

Campuses placed in the first CUNY grouping, **Research**, have on average 35 percent of degrees awarded in graduate programs. The CUNY Graduate School and University Center awards approximately 300 doctorates annually, and much of that instruction is delivered on these campuses. Enrollment in graduate programs in this tier of CUNY campuses is 24.7%, comparable to the SUNY University Center average of 27.5%.

Campuses in the second grouping, **Ph.D/Master's /Baccalaureate**, are somewhat smaller than those in the first grouping, with headcount enrollments between 8,000 and 12,000 students. These campuses have a lower level of involvement in the doctoral programs and a lower level of external funding for sponsored programs. However, they maintain significant graduate degree programs at the Master's level and a complex array of undergraduate programs.

The third grouping, **Baccalaureate/Associate** includes four-year colleges that do not offer programs at the graduate level and/or enroll a substantial number of students in associate degree programs.

The fourth grouping, **Associate**, comprises the community colleges of the CUNY system.

Based on the above, the CUNY campuses will be grouped in the following manner:

- **Research Campuses:** Baruch College, Brooklyn College, The City College, Hunter College, The Graduate School and University Center, Queens College.
- **Ph.D/Master's/Baccalaureate Campuses:** John Jay College of Criminal Justice, Lehman College, the College of Staten Island.
- **Baccalaureate/Associate Campuses:** Medgar Evers, New York City Technical College, York College.
- **Associate Campuses:** Borough of Manhattan Community College, Bronx Community College, Kingsborough Community College, Queensborough Community College, LaGuardia Community College, Hostos Community College.

1b. Change to Titles included in the plan

The salary plan reflects the inclusion of the Assistant Dean/Administrator titles that are currently compensated with REMs. Incorporating these titles within the ECP completes the migration of key executives from REM status to the ECP as originally contemplated in the 1982 proposed Executive Compensation Plan.

Further, the plan identifies "Secretary of the Board" and "Senior Vice Chancellor" as unique titles with corresponding salaries/ranges. The title of Executive Vice Chancellor has replaced the title of Deputy Chancellor.

1c. Performance

The William M. Mercer, Inc., consulting group which participated in structuring the new Executive Compensation Plan will develop, in concert with the Chancellor, a set of recommended performance indicators that will be used to evaluate all executive personnel on an annual basis. These indicators will vary slightly based on the type of position, the level of responsibility and the range of duties. Future salary increases will be determined by individual performance as measured by these indicators.

2. Salary

The salary revisions reflect consideration of a number of sources: the Mercer compensation review, an examination of salaries paid to executives at peer institutions, the Alabama Survey of Administrative Salaries (1998-99), the tiered ranges in effect at SUNY, and market advice received from presidential recruitment firms.

2a. Presidential Salaries:

I. Research campuses:	\$136,661 - \$201,000
II. Ph.D/Masters/Baccalaureate campuses	\$129,000 - \$177,500
III. Baccalaureate/Associate campuses	\$127,500 - \$168,000
IV. Associate campuses	\$124,500 - \$162,000

The overlap between tiers for Presidential salaries allows individual salaries to be based upon several factors, including differing levels of experience among presidents, varying performance review results, and significant differences in market requirements. Within each tier, the salary of a newly recruited president will be determined by his/her background, skill and experience, degrees held, academic accomplishments, special qualifications germane to that presidency, the position held at the time he/she was hired by CUNY and market conditions. Another factor to be considered would be the size of the CUNY college compared to the institution from which the candidate moved.

To determine an appropriate salary level for sitting presidents, the individual's performance while in office will be reviewed, relying in part on a number of indicators that measure how well the institution he/she heads is achieving its mission. The president's performance as it pertains to fiscal and academic management and his/her relationships with students, faculty and staff will also be reviewed.

2b. The Chancellory, Professional School of Deans and Central Office Executive Positions

Chancellor	\$250,000 - \$350,000
Executive Vice Chancellor	\$145,000 - \$224,500
Dean of the Medical School	\$142,000 - \$203,000
Dean of Law School	\$135,000 - \$199,000
Senior Vice Chancellor	\$124,000 - \$192,000
Vice Chancellor	\$116,964 - \$182,000
Secretary of the Board	\$100,500 - \$156,000
University Dean/University Administrator	\$ 94,500 - \$146,000
University Assoc. Dean/Univ. Assoc. Admin	\$ 77,500 - \$120,000
University Asst. Dean/Univ. Asst. Admin	\$ 66,500 - \$103,000

The salary range for the Chancellor reflects the pay range recently approved for the Chancellor of SUNY. Other salaries reflect market considerations including SUNY salaries.

2c. Campus-Based Executive Positions:

Senior Vice President	\$100,500 - \$155,500
Vice President	\$ 94,500 - \$146,000
Dean/Administrator/Asst. Vice President	\$ 84,000 - \$130,000
Associate Dean/Assoc. Administrator	\$ 70,500 - \$109,000
Assistant Dean/Asst. Administrator	\$ 63,600 - \$100,000

Salary ranges for campus level executives are based on market factors. The ranges absorb current salaries of all incumbents and thus do not require immediate salary increases.

All salary ranges will be subject to periodic adjustment in accordance with the general increases provided for New York State Management/Confidential employees. Further, the salary ranges may be adjusted based on reviews of peer and national market trend data for higher education executive personnel, subject to Board of Trustees approval. These reviews will be conducted periodically, but no less frequently than every five years. Any future modifications of salaries, within the appropriate range, and within the ECP, are at the discretion of the Board of Trustees.

The new ranges will be adequate for the overwhelming majority of executive positions on CUNY campuses. Under this plan, the Chancellor, in exceptional circumstances and upon approval by the Board, may make

offers beyond the maximum of the salary range. This is consistent with pay practices at SUNY and, like SUNY, no salary of a campus executive could be offered in excess of the president's salary.

3. Non-Base Compensation

The salary plan also includes such other non-cash compensation components as are customary and appropriate for senior executives in higher education. The non-base compensation practices currently in place are retained. The plan also provides for a one semester severance payment upon retirement from the University after seven or more years of service as Chancellor or President. Also included is a biannual review of the housing allowance, based upon housing and cost of living indices in consultation with the Division of the Budget.

**APPENDIX I SALARY COMPARISON STUDY OF CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER OF A SYSTEM
(CHANCELLOR) PEER INSTITUTIONS**

<u>INSTITUTION</u>	<u>SALARY 1999 (\$)</u>	<u>NUMBER OF CAMPUSES*</u>	<u>APPROXIMATE NUMBER OF STUDENTS*</u>
Texas	375,500	14	147,233
Univ. of California	337,300	9	171,154
Maryland	298,020	11	105,408
Illinois	291,580	3	66,328
California State	285,360	23	335,725
Ohio State	275,004	6	54,509
SUNY	250,000	64	366,794
CUNY	250,000	18	196,368*
Wisconsin	181,527	12	131,590
Average Salary:	\$282,699		

SOURCE: Number of campuses and students, 1998 Higher Education Directory. For CUNY, reflects preliminary headcount enrollment for Fall 1999. Salaries: Telephone and E-mail survey

**APPENDIX II SALARY COMPARISON STUDY OF CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER OF A SINGLE
INSTITUTION PRESIDENT**

<u>INSTITUTION</u>	<u>1999 SALARY (\$)</u>
University of California-San Francisco	335,000*
University of California-Berkeley and Los Angeles	294,500
University of Maryland-Baltimore	268,815
University of California-San Diego	262,000
University of Maryland-College Park	257,910
University of Florida-Florida State	241,610
University of Illinois-Chicago	235,225
University of Illinois-Urbana-Champaign	233,630
California State-San Diego	218,556
California State-Los Angeles	216,648
California State-San Francisco	208,848
University of Texas-Dallas	205,055*
SUNY-Stony Brook	203,000
SUNY-Buffalo	175,950
University of Wisconsin-Madison	165,025
University of Massachusetts-Amherst	60,000
City University of New York	136,661
SUNY-Old Westbury	130,000
SUNY-New Paltz	112,411
Average Salary	213,729
SOURCE: Telephone and E-Mail Survey	

* Also other compensation

APPENDIX II SALARY COMPARISON - POSITIONS WITHIN THE CHANCELLORY

POSITION	CUNY	SUNY	ALABAMA* SURVEY AVERAGES
Deputy Chancellor/ Exec. Vice Chancellor	\$153,898	\$191,939 Range: 148,000 - 192,000	\$147,883
Vice Chancellor for Academic Affairs/Provost	\$116,964	\$176,674 Range: 136,801 - 180,500	\$150,260
Vice Chancellor for Budget and Finance	\$116,964	\$125,573	\$136,249
General Counsel/Legal Affairs	\$116,964	\$126,984	\$135,458
Vice Chancellor for Human Resources/ Labor Relations	\$116,964	N/A	\$105,160
Vice Chancellor for Facilities Planning	\$116,964	Vacant	\$107,707
Vice Chancellor for University Relations	\$116,964	\$132,072	\$135,758
Vice Chancellor for Student Affairs (Vacant)	\$116,964	\$103,700	\$112,000

*1996-99

APPENDIX IV SALARY COMPARISON - SELECTED SENIOR EXECUTIVES - CUNY/SUNY

		<u>Selected SUNY Titles</u>	Albany	Buffalo	Binghamton	New Paltz	Purchase	Potsdam	Brockport	Oneonta
CUNY plan range	SUNY plan range*									
\$94,928 - \$114,901	\$73,907 - \$125,700	<u>Vice Presidents</u>								
		Academic Affairs	\$140,604	\$130,604	\$154,560	\$110,000	\$118,103	\$102,182	\$111,780	\$110,000
		Admin/Finance	\$120,000	\$180,000	\$144,242	\$92,839	\$107,895		\$112,880	\$113,814
		Student Affairs	\$127,588	\$135,000	\$122,600	\$91,534	\$115,943			\$95,000
		Research	\$135,000	\$140,000	\$128,000					
\$92,904 - \$112,602	\$50,562 - \$117,547	<u>Deans</u>								
		Arts/Sciences/Lib Arts	\$155,000	\$165,000	\$142,800	\$95,000		\$96,050	\$102,000	\$83,233
		Education	\$113,317	\$140,000	\$114,500	\$86,000		\$94,150		
		Mng't/Business	\$175,000	\$200,000	\$138,500	\$77,551				
		Engineering		\$160,000	\$139,500	\$77,551				

*The SUNY Plan includes an exception that allows campuses to exceed the salary maximum for individual employees.