

MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING OF THE BOARD OF
TRUSTEES OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

HELD

AUGUST 3, 2011

AT BARUCH COLLEGE VERTICAL CAMPUS
55 LEXINGTON AVENUE – BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

The Chairperson called the meeting to order at 4:31 P.M.

There were present:

Benno Schmidt, Chairperson
Philip Alfonso Berry, Vice Chairperson

Valerie Lancaster Beal
Wellington Z. Chen
Rita DiMartino
Freida D. Foster
Judah Gribetz

Joseph J. Lhota
Peter S. Pantaleo
Kathleen M. Pesile
Carol A. Robles-Roman
Jeffrey S. Wiesenfeld

Frederick P. Schaffer, General Counsel and Senior Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs
Jay Hershenson, Secretary and Senior Vice Chancellor for University Relations
Hourig Messerlian, Deputy to the Secretary
Towanda Lewis
Steven Quinn
Anthony Vargas

Chancellor Matthew Goldstein
EVC and University Provost Alexandra Logue
Executive Vice Chancellor and C.O.O. Allan H. Dobrin
President Ricardo Fernandez
President Karen L. Gould
President Tomás Morales
President Antonio Pérez
Vice Chancellor Pamela Silverblatt
Vice Chancellor Iris Weinshall
Vice Chancellor Eduardo J. Martí
Vice Chancellor Frank D. Sánchez
Vice Chancellor Gillian Small
Associate Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza

The absence of Trustees Hugo M. Morales, Charles A. Shorter, Sam A. Sutton, Cory Provost, and Sandi E. Cooper was excused.

Chairperson Benno Schmidt called the special meeting to order, and stated that he would like to thank everyone for being here this mid-summer afternoon. He announced that the following notice would be entered into the record of this Public meeting:

“The meetings of the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York are open to the public, and the Board welcomes the interest of those who attend. The public has ample opportunity to communicate with the Board. Public hearings on the Board's policy calendar are scheduled one week prior to the Board's regular meetings and members of the public who wish to communicate with the Board are invited to express their views at such public hearings. Furthermore, the Board holds additional public hearings each year in all of the five boroughs at which members of the public may also speak. In addition, written communications to the Board are distributed to all Trustees.

The Board must carry out the functions assigned to it by law and therefore will not tolerate conduct by members of the public that disrupts its meetings. In the event of disruptions, including noise which interferes with Board discussion, after appropriate warning, the Chairman will ask the security staff to remove persons engaging in disruptive conduct. The University may seek disciplinary and/or criminal sanctions against persons who engage in conduct that violates the University's rules or State laws which prohibit interference with the work of public bodies.”

A. VIDEOTAPING OF BOARD MEETING: **Chairperson Benno Schmidt** announced that as usual **CUNY-TV** is making available this important community service by transmitting the Public Session of this afternoon's special meeting of the **Board of Trustees** live on cable Channel 75. The meeting is also being webcast live and can be accessed by going to www.cuny.edu. The Public Session of this afternoon's Board meeting will be available as a podcast within 24 hours and can be accessed through the **CUNY** website.

Chancellor Matthew Goldstein stated that a meeting of the **Executive Committee** of the Board was called for July 21 to consider a revised tuition schedule based on new state legislation authorizing **CUNY** to implement a rational tuition policy by increasing tuition up to \$300 annually for the next five years. A public hearing was held by the **Executive Committee** on July 20. I would like to thank **Vice Chairperson Philip Berry** and **Trustee Rita DiMartino** for their participation in that hearing. The **Executive Committee** then met on July 21 and authorized a new tuition schedule for fall 2011. My thanks to all of the **Executive Committee** members for taking the time to meet on the 21st.

On July 26, a New York State Supreme Court judge, responding to a lawsuit filed by several students, issued a temporary restraining order prohibiting the implementation of the tuition schedule approved by the **Executive Committee**, unless and until the full **Board of Trustees** meets and votes on the schedule. Because the full board does not meet until late September, and because time is of the essence, it was determined that a special meeting of the full board should be convened for this purpose. Again, I am grateful to our board members for responding so quickly to this need.

Before I describe the components of the state's plan, I would like to give the board some background about how tuition for **The City University of New York** and The State University of New York has historically been set. I think the historical context will help to shed some light on the reasons that the governor, with input from the state legislature, adopted the model that we are considering tonight—one for which I have been strenuously advocating for nearly a decade. In the past, the setting of tuition levels at **CUNY** and SUNY was done in a very haphazard way. In some years there were very steep tuition increases—15%, 20% and, indeed, even 30%—while in other years, sometimes over a period of consecutive years, there would be no tuition increases.

The reason is that the state would generally raise tuition when it was in a precarious financial position, leading to sudden and significant increases. On some occasions, the tuition increases were so high that students were forced to leave the University because they could not quickly find additional financial resources. I have always believed that we need to have a predictable policy for tuition in order to allow for appropriate planning—both by students and their families and by the University. It is unfair that students, whether living at home with their families or living on their own, do not have the ability to plan for tuition increases, especially since most of them are juggling scarce

resources for competing needs. At the same time, the University should have the ability to plan for how to provide assistance for students, beyond the financial assistance offered by state or federal governments, particularly for those students who may be put in harm's way because of escalating costs.

For years I have urged state officials to adopt a more predictable and rational approach to setting tuition levels, what we call the **CUNY** Compact model. Finally, this year, the governor came forward with a plan that was adopted by the state legislature.

The plan allows the University to raise tuition up to \$300 per year for full-time, in-state undergraduate students, and a proportionate amount for nonresident, graduate, doctoral, per-credit, and selected program rates. This recommendation is very consistent with the **CUNY** Compact approach for establishing a rational and predictable policy for setting tuition targets. It allows students and families to plan for the cost of the college education, and it will allow the University more effectively to activate other sources of income. For example, donors have often asked why they should provide significant support for the University if the state is not willing to meet its obligations. This five-year plan is a strong statement to the wider community that the state is indeed investing in **CUNY** and in SUNY.

Let me mention some important aspects of the state's plan. One is the maintenance-of-effort commitment to the University. Financial support cannot be reduced from prior-year levels, except in cases of financial exigency. In addition, the state allows the University to keep the revenue from the new tuition, rather than returning it to the state, as was often the practice in the past. The new state plan ensures that if a student pays \$1 of support, that dollar stays at the University for investment purposes. Finally, the plan also ensures that the state will continue to fund the University's mandatory costs, such as collective bargaining increases and energy increases.

A critical part of this five-year plan is that it addresses the importance of financial aid as a component of any tuition increase. The plan stipulates that if students are now receiving the maximum award from the state's Tuition Assistance Program, called TAP, they will not have to pay the increase. If students are receiving less than the full TAP award—say, 80% of full TAP or 60% of full TAP—the increase will be reduced proportionately. So part of the revenue that the University receives from this increase is going directly to support students who are most at risk. I have always emphasized that the neediest students should not be impeded in their pursuit of a degree because of a tuition increase. The state's plan is consistent with that caveat. And because the plan will enable us to increase our philanthropic efforts, we will be able to direct more of those resources to assist students in need. I should also note that, consistent with the adopted state budget and the recent federal debt ceiling agreement, both TAP and the federal Pell Grant program are funded for next year.

As you can see, this is a bold step forward for the State of New York, a fundamentally different approach to investing in higher education. And for that reason, **Mr. Chairman**, I think it is important for us to support this approach tonight.

Upon motions duly made, seconded and carried, the following resolution was adopted: (Calendar No. 1)

NO. 1. THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK - REVISED TUITION SCHEDULE EFFECTIVE FALL 2011:

RESOLVED, That effective fall 2011, the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York adopts a revised schedule of student tuition that includes a \$300 increase over current rates (spring 2011) for all full-time undergraduate resident students, and a proportional increase in graduate, doctoral, nonresident and per credit rates at both the senior and community colleges; except for the masters in public administration and doctor of nursing practice programs for which such increase is assessed on the new tuition rates previously approved for those programs by the Board of Trustees effective fall 2011, as reflected in the attached schedule.

On a per semester basis, these include the following increases:

\$150 for full-time undergraduate resident students at senior colleges,

\$150 for full-time undergraduate resident students at community colleges,

\$335 for full-time law school resident students,

\$240 for full-time graduate resident students except for the following:

\$355 for full-time masters in business administration resident students,

\$280 for full-time masters in architecture resident students,

\$280 for full-time masters in engineering resident students,

\$265 for full-time masters in physical therapy resident students,

\$315 for full-time masters in social work resident students,

\$275 for full-time masters in public administration resident students,

\$215 for full-time doctoral resident students except for the following:

\$315 for full-time doctor of nursing practice resident students.

And be it further

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees authorizes the Chancellor to make revisions to the City University of New York Tuition and Fee Manual as may be necessary to implement this resolution and to report such revisions at the first regular meeting of the Board of Trustees following the action.

EXPLANATION: In June 2011, the State of New York enacted legislation authorizing CUNY to implement a rational tuition policy by increasing its tuition up to \$300 annually for the next five years (through fiscal year 2015-2016) for full-time undergraduate resident students, beginning with the fall 2011 semester. While overall senior college full-time equivalent enrollments have increased by 10.7% over the last three years, the University's operating budget sustained reductions totaling \$205 million during that same period. In addition, the FY2012 State enacted budget contains an additional \$95 million in reductions to the senior colleges, for a total of \$300 million. State base aid at the community colleges has been reduced over 20% over the last four years; the FY2012 City adopted budget also includes reductions for the community colleges. Therefore, in order to maintain and further strengthen academic quality and student support services, the recommended increases are necessary. The new State legislation requires that a tuition credit be given to those students who are eligible for the state Tuition Assistance Program when the annual tuition exceeds \$5,000. A portion of the revenues generated from the increased rates will be set-aside for financial aid purposes.

Proposed Tuition Schedule Fall 2011

Senior Colleges

Undergraduate	Resident Students	Non-resident Students
Full-time	\$2,565 per Semester	\$460 per Credit
Part-time	\$215 per Credit	\$460 per Credit
Non-Degree	\$320 per Credit	\$680 per Credit
 Masters Students including the Graduate School		
Full-time	\$4,105 per Semester	\$640 per Credit
Part-time	\$345 per Credit	\$640 per Credit
Maintenance of Matriculation	\$170 per Semester	\$280 per Semester

Other Masters Program

Baruch	Masters in Business Administration		
	Full-time	\$6,030 per Semester	\$820 per Credit
	Part-time	\$545 per Credit	\$820 per Credit
City	Masters in Architecture		
	Masters in Engineering		
	Full-time	\$4,810 per Semester	\$710 per Credit
	Part-time	\$405 per Credit	\$710 per Credit
Hunter	Masters in Social Work		
Lehman			
	Full-time	\$5,425 per Semester	\$730 per Credit
	Part-time	\$460 per Credit	\$730 per Credit
Hunter	Masters in Physical Therapy		
CSI			
	Full-time	\$4,490 per Semester	\$670 per Credit
	Part-time	\$365 per Credit	\$670 per Credit
Baruch	Masters in Public Administration		
City			
John Jay			
	Full-time	\$4,720 per Semester	\$740 per Credit
	Part-time	\$400 per Credit	\$740 per Credit

Doctoral Students

Level I Full-time	\$3,670 per Semester	\$715 per Credit
Level I (per credit)	\$415 per Credit	\$715 per Credit
Level II	\$2,300 per Semester	\$5,110 per Semester
Level III	\$910 per Semester	\$1,820 per Semester

Doctor of Nursing Practice

Level I Full-time	\$5,425 per Semester	\$730 per Credit
Level I (per credit)	\$460 per Credit	\$730 per Credit
Level II	\$5,425 per Semester	\$730 per Credit
Level III	\$5,425 per Semester	\$730 per Credit

Law School

Full-time	\$5,710 per Semester	\$9,490 per Semester
Part-time	\$475 per Credit	\$795 per Credit

Community Colleges

Undergraduate	Resident Students	Non-resident Students
Full-time	\$1,800 per Semester	\$240 per Credit
Part-time	\$150 per Credit	\$240 per Credit
Non-Degree	\$205 per Credit	\$320 per Credit

Upon motion duly made, seconded and carried, the meeting was adjourned at 4:46 P.M.

SECRETARY AND SENIOR VICE CHANCELLOR JAY HERSHENSON

(This is a detailed summary of the Board of Trustees' meeting. The tapes of the meeting are available in the Office of the Secretary of the Board for a period of three years.)